

A     S T U D Y     O F     T H E     R E L A T I O N  
O F     T H E  
C H R I S T I A N     ( P O S T - R E F O R M A T I O N )  
C O N C E P T     O F     V O C A T I O N  
T O     T H E     M O D E R N     D E V E L O P M E N T  
O F     S T A T E - C O N T R O L L E D  
V O C A T I O N A L     G U I D A N C E

by Sherwood Eliot Wirt

Submitted as partial fulfilment  
of the requirements for the degree  
of doctor of philosophy in divinity  
in the University of Edinburgh.  
May 1951



FOR WINNIE AND LEX



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface . . . . .	111
Chapter One, 'The Concept of Vocation' . . . . .	1
Chapter Two, 'The Concept of Vocational Guidance' . . . . .	52
Chapter Three, 'Problems of Adaptation' . . . . .	94
Chapter Four, 'Toward a Modern Concept of Christian Vocation' . . . . .	157
Chapter Five, 'Toward a Plan for Christian Vocational Guidance to Collaborate with State-Controlled Agencies' . . . . .	196
Appendix, 'An Experiment in Christian Vocational Guidance in Scotland, 1950-1951' . . . . .	228
Case Study . . . . .	255
Bibliography and abbreviations . . . . .	283

The spelling throughout, except for quoted passages, is American according to Webster's Collegiate Dictionary, fifth edition.

## Preface

Forces working toward the integration of human society are creating many serious problems for traditionally voluntary organizations such as the Christian Church. During the ten years of the writer's ministry he has become increasingly aware of one particular issue: when controlled guidance becomes a universal feature of state education, what influence will be left the Church in its guidance of youth in the world?

The present investigation points toward the conclusion that the Church can only rise adequately to the challenge, now so obvious in lands dominated by Marxist ideology, by reviving its own Reformation doctrine of Vocation. Christian vocational guidance, properly taught and administered, may provide that additional counsel that will interpret the world to Christian young people, and give them a solid basis on which to choose their life work. Further, in many cases it may give to that work lifelong meaning and significance.

In order to arrive at such a position it became necessary to trace the primitive sources of the doctrine of Vocation and the vocational guidance movement, and to study their development and mutual relationship. In the final chapters a reconstruction and adaptation is then attempted, with a particular view to conditions in Great Britain and America.

There are a great many persons who have helped to make this work possible, and it may be proper to mention a few of

them. The privilege of two years of study in Scotland and Switzerland was the gift of the United States government. To Principal John Baillie of New College go my warm thanks for first encouraging the present piece of research. Professor W. S. Tindal of the New College faculty and Professor James Drever of the Psychology department have helped a great deal to clarify and supplement the argument of the thesis. Professor W. R. Forrester of St. Andrews, Professor Emil Brunner and Miss B. Baehr of Zürich, Dr. Joseph H. Oldham of London and others have offered stimulating and timely suggestions. The staff of the Psychology department and vocational guidance unit has given generously of its knowledge and time, is responsible for much of the scientific accuracy and none of the errors in the present work.

The cooperation of the Rev. E. S. Towill, B. Ed., of Edinburgh, and the congregation of Newington and St. Leonard's Parish, has made the experimental part of the research a pleasurable undertaking. The Rev. J. B. Primrose and Miss E. R. Leslie of the New College library staff have kindly assisted in the procuring of data, as have staff officers in five other Edinburgh libraries and the British Museum. For first interesting me in the Christian possibilities of vocational guidance I have to thank Professor emeritus Edwin B. Stevens of the Educational department, University of Washington, and Professor Ernest M. Ligon of Union College, New York.

Members of the Edinburgh Student Christian Movement, by their keen and invigorating interest in the subject of Vocation, have sharpened the discussion at many points. Mr. C. A. Woodward

of James Thin, booksellers, has most courteously dealt with many requests for help. Mrs. Madison V. Scott has earned my gratitude by typing the finished copies, and my wife as usual has been a steady blessing of encouragement.

Finally I would like to thank the fifteen young people who volunteered for and faithfully carried out their end of the experiment. Their honest, if sometimes perplexed, desire to serve God with their whole lives has proved to be a more convincing argument for the validity of the Christian Calling than many books.

S. E. W.

University of Edinburgh

March 12, 1951

## CHAPTER ONE

# THE CONCEPT OF VOCATION

### Outline.

#### Introduction.

#### I. Biblical Sources of the Concept.

- A. As Mission.
- B. As Call to Salvation.
- C. As Secular Calling.

#### II. Forming of a Medieval Concept of Vocation.

#### III. Luther's Doctrine of the Secular Calling.

#### IV. Doctrine of the Calling after Luther.

- A. The Reformed View of the Divine Calling.
- B. Calvinism and the Worldly Calling.
- C. Vocation Becomes a Secular Expression.

#### Summary.

With him ther was a Plowman, was his brother,  
 That hadde y-lad of dong ful many a fother...  
 God loved he best with al his hole<sup>"</sup> herte  
 At alle<sup>"</sup> tymes, thogh him gamed<sup>"</sup> or smerte,  
 And thanne his neigh<sup>"</sup>bour right as him-selve.  
 He wolde<sup>"</sup> thresshe, and therto dyke and delve,  
 For Christes sake, for every poore<sup>"</sup> wight  
 Withouten hyre, if it lay in his might.

-- Chaucer, Prologue to "Canterbury Tales"

I kneeled there in the muddy fallow,  
 I knew that Christ was there with Callow,  
 That Christ was standing there with me,  
 That Christ had taught me what to be,  
 That I should plough, and as I ploughed,  
 My Saviour Christ would sing aloud,  
 And as I drove the clods apart,  
 Christ would be ploughing in my heart.

-- Masfield, "The Everlasting Mercy"



## Introduction.

The trouble about the word Vocation, a modern writer has observed, is to find out what it means.<sup>1</sup> Murray's Oxford Dictionary defines Vocation<sup>2</sup> first of all as "action on the part of God of calling a person", and then distinguishes three principal types of Call: (1) the Call to a special mission or function, especially of a religious nature; (2) the Call to salvation, and (3) the divinely determined secular station or Calling in which one serves.

The changes that have taken place since the Reformation in the meaning of the words Calling and Vocation are so profound that no dictionary can adequately represent them. In other fields the process might be described as polarization. The Church clings ever more closely to its classical interpretations, and Protestant theologians aver that "Vocation is the supreme category of religion."<sup>3</sup> But in the fields of education, industry and trade the term Vocation, where used at all, has developed into a convenient synonym for "occupation".<sup>4</sup> In recent years the term has been put to work not only in school and mart but in the technical laboratory.

1. W. G. Symons, Work and Vocation, 13.

2. For the sake of simplicity the words Vocation, Call and Calling, except in quoted passages, normally will be capitalized.

3. J. A. Robertson, Divine Vocation in Human Life, 108.

4. A similar fate has overtaken the German Beruf; also the Dutch beroep, Danish kald, Swedish kallelse. See Holl, GAK, I, 258; Weber, The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism, tr., 207.



Educational research has developed an entire science and has given it, in disregard of any sacred connotations, the name of Vocational Guidance. Industrial research has done similarly with Vocational Selection.

So we retain the idea of a sacred Vocation and of a secular Vocation, but the vital message of the word--the sacred in the secular--has been lost.<sup>5</sup>

The present study will attempt to trace the concept of Vocation in the Hebrew-Christian tradition, particularly in the years during and after the Reformation, and then to investigate ways of restoring to the word its Christian significance in a manner that is relevant to the needs of our day. It will also trace the history of the vocational guidance movement, and will then inquire into the possibility of relating the two concepts on the practical level.

The hazards of the task appear impressive at the start. The basic difficulty is not the overcoming of opposition from secular agencies. It is the revitalizing of a word which, in Calhoun's phrase, has gone stale.<sup>6</sup> Of the dozens of documents that could be cited to the effect that "the sense of a Divine vocation must be restored to man's daily work",<sup>7</sup> there is notable lack of specific directions as to how it is to be done.

5. Fanfani, an Italian Catholic economist, maintains that such a tension is impossible; when the sacred is brought into the secular it is debased, and Protestantism always leads to the "sanctification of the real", i.e. the sinful. The temptation is surely present, but Fanfani forgets that one of the meanings of the Incarnation is the "sanctification of the real". (Cf. Catholicism, Protestantism and Capitalism, 198.)

6. God and the Common Life, 25.

7. Joint letter to London Times, Dec. 21, 1940.

The reason is not hard to find. The problem of Vocation is at the heart of the modern dilemma in man's work, which the Christian Church is slowly coming to realize. The growth of relativism, the decline of incentives, the creation of working conditions and attitudes different from anything that existed when the men of the Bible heard their Calls, all make the task of adapting the concept of Vocation a harrowing one. Yet the need remains.

If even one expression of the faith can be redeemed from the past and given the exalted meaning it once knew, it will be a great boon to the Christian community. The trend toward a secular society is by no means inevitable.<sup>8</sup> It may be God's purpose to use some such word as Vocation as a banner to rally confused and disheartened believers, and to make His Spirit regnant in the Church. A faith in that purpose informs the pages that follow, however much they may seem to be occupied with detail.

Modern vocational guidance, the enterprise which has pre-empted the word Vocation for its own particular use, represents one of the more impressive achievements of western culture in this century. It has proved so popular that it threatens to touch the lives of nearly all the children of earth within a few generations. A discussion of Christian Vocation that can come to terms with this world-wide effort to

---

8. "As Thucydides long ago suggested, fatalism tends to produce what it dreads, for men do not oppose that which they consider inevitable." -- Trueblood, The Common Ventures of Life, 81.

guide youth in the choice of life-work, will be making real strides toward the modern solution of the problem. Despite the size of the task and the writer's consciousness of his limitations, it is into such a milieu that our discussion must finally be carried, amid the scientific and technical interests which are the distinguishing features of modern life. Whether Vocation can emerge from it as once again "one of the lordliest of words" remains to be seen.

### 1. Biblical Sources of the Concept.

There can be no intelligent discussion of the meaning of Vocation without some examination into the Biblical sources of the word. The most primitive form (Hebrew qahal, Greek klesis) was a call or summons as to an assembly.<sup>9</sup> The word soon acquired theological significance however, and was associated with Israel's messianic role. Thus the message came to Hosea, "I called my son out of Egypt," and to Deutero-Isaiah, "I have called thee by name, thou art mine."<sup>10</sup> "The Old Testament," writes Dr. Forrester, "is the Book of the Vocation of Israel; the whole idea of the Covenant and the Chosen People is a doctrine of vocation, whose special feature is the personal and gracious relationship between Jehovah and each member of His people, as well as a promise for the people as a whole. This we see best in the case of Abraham."<sup>11</sup>

The early Christian Church claimed the heritage of ancient

---

9. HDB, art. "Call". Klesis appears frequently in the LXX, e.g. in 1 Samuel 3:4.

10. Hosea 11:1, Isaiah 43:1. (A.V.) Cf. Isaiah 42:6, 48:12.

11. Cunningham Lectures, 1950, I.

Israel as its own, and appropriated the concept of the Calling for the elect race, the peculiar people, the holy nation which was itself.<sup>12</sup> The idea that Christians are a Called people is based directly on the New Testament doctrine of the Church, for the Greek word for Church (ekklesia) means literally a Called body. This teaching has been linked from the beginning with the concept of separation--"called out" from the rest of the world--and has its roots in the history of Israel.<sup>13</sup> In many ways the concept of the Calling was similar under the Old and New Covenants; the New Testament may in fact be properly described as the Book of the Vocation of the New Israel.<sup>14</sup>

#### A. The Call as Mission.

It is the assumption of this thesis that the most significant, the most dramatic, and perhaps even the most authentic doctrine of Vocation in the Bible is the Call of God to a special task or mission. Because scholars are not agreed on the point, and because in recent centuries Vocation has become a

---

12. I Peter 2:9, James 1:1.

13. TWBB, art. "Call".

14. Dr. Forrester describes it rather as the "Book of the Vocation of Jesus, who was called to proclaim the Kingdom of God and in turn called His followers to continue the work." (Cunningham Lectures, I.) I have preferred the term "Vocation of the New Israel" because the other suggests that in the NT the Call is more restricted than in the OT, which is not the case. B. Weiss does in fact speak of such a distinction; he says the Gospels report "not, as in the Old Testament the calling of the nation as a nation, but of its individual members". (BTNT, tr., I, 126.) It is true that there is a nationalistic aspect to the Call of Israel which no longer holds in the NT. Yet as Dr. Forrester points out, the case of Abraham shows that God's Call is a relationship between Jehovah and each member, as well as between Him and the people as a whole. In neither OT nor NT is the Call completely individual, since they are called as Israelites or as members of the Body of Christ; it does however remain in most cases personal.



word of many meanings, no effort is being made to claim that such a Call is the only "true" interpretation. There is sufficient agreement that it is an important aspect of the Biblical doctrine. Again and again in the course of Hebrew-Christian history the Call was heard by persons summoned to particular and different undertakings. When J. A. Robertson describes the Bible as "the book of the calls of God to men"<sup>15</sup>, he is bringing to light one of the great unifying elements of the Scriptures.

Said the Eternal to Abram, 'Leave your country, leave your kindred, leave your father's house, for a land that I will show to you; I will make a great nation of you and bless you...' <sup>16</sup>

By faith Abraham obeyed when he was called to go out to a place which he was to receive as an inheritance; and he went out, not knowing where he was to go. <sup>17</sup>

God called to him out of the thorn-bush, saying, 'Moses, Moses!' He answered, 'Here I am!'... 'Come, I will send you to the Pharaoh that you may bring my people the Israelites out of Egypt.' <sup>18</sup>

The Eternal turned to (Gideon) and said, 'Go with this strength of your own, and rescue Israel from Midian. Am I not sending you?' <sup>19</sup>

This word from the Eternal came to me:... 'I have appointed you a prophet to the nations.' <sup>20</sup>

I am no prophet... I am only a shepherd... But the Eternal took me from the flock; the Eternal said to me, 'Go and prophesy to my people Israel.' <sup>21</sup>

---

15. Op.cit., 189.

16. Genesis 12:1-2. (This and the following OT citations are from the Moffatt translation.) Alan Richardson comments, "This calling, with its attendant idea of separation, calling out, may be said to begin with the order to Abram to move from Haran." (TWBB, articles "Call", "Church".)

17. Hebrews 11:8 (ARSV).

18. Exodus 3:4, 10.

19. Judges 6:14.

20. Jeremiah 1:5.

21. Amos 7:14-5.

This message from the Eternal came to Jonah the son of Amittai: 'Go to Nineveh, that great city, and thunder in their ears that their wickedness is known to me.'<sup>22</sup>

Follow me, and I will make you fishers of men.<sup>23</sup>

Go ye therefore and teach all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost; teaching them to observe all things whatsoever I have commanded you.<sup>24</sup>

When he had seen the vision, immediately we sought to go on into Macedonia, concluding that God had called us to preach the gospel to them.<sup>25</sup>

And he said to me, 'Depart; for I will send you far away to the Gentiles.'<sup>26</sup>

Paul, called by the will of God to be an apostle..<sup>27</sup>

Each of these Calls<sup>28</sup> is different in time and character, yet they were interpreted according to a fairly uniform pattern as a summons to a special mission or function for God. At the heart of the message was the divine Vocation in the sense of "action on the part of God in calling a person", which was combined with "a designation to the fulfilling of a definite duty".<sup>29</sup>

Other meanings of the Calling will be discussed in course, but before proceeding it is worth noting how many of the above calls issued in life work. The special mission became a task which for Moses, Jeremiah, Paul and others was the medium of

---

22. Jonah 1:1-2.

23. Mark 1:17.

24. Matt. 28:19-20.

25. Acts 16:10 (ARSV.)

26. Acts 22:21 (*ib.*)

27. I Corinthians 1:1. (*ib.*)

28. The list in the Bible is by no means exhausted with the above.

29. B. Weiss, *op.cit.*, I, 126. Weiss interprets the parable of the laborers in the vineyard (Matt. 20:1-7) as a "summons to work in God's vineyard" (*ibid.*)

their life service to God and their social function in the community of men.<sup>30</sup>

Two calls have been singled out for special study as relevant to twentieth century vocational issues. The first is the Call of Samuel, which is one of the best known stories in the Bible.<sup>31</sup> The boy Samuel, asleep at his post in the temple at Shiloh, is awakened in the night by a voice calling his name. When he answers, at the behest of the old priest Eli, he hears a sentence of judgment on Shiloh and the house of Eli.

The first point of interest is Samuel's age. Careful reading of the text leads to the conclusion that he was not as young as he is often pictured at the time of the Call. Fleming James writes: "How old he was we do not know, for the epithet na'ar used to describe him can mean anything from a little child to a young man. Probably Kittel is right in picturing him as about fifteen years of age".<sup>32</sup> If Samuel was indeed fifteen years old, his Call seems to assume more coherence. Fifteen years is an extremely important age in a lad's life. Today it is the approximate age for joining the church, for taking school leaving exams, for receiving vocational guidance, for commencing to work. The boy begins to put away childish things, to look forward, to plan for life. He takes his first full step inside the threshold of manhood. Samuel's Call probably came at a most signifi-

---

30. Dr. Forrester (op.cit., I) describes the Call of Isaiah (Is. 6) as being a complete example of a genuine call, since it includes the vision of God's glory, the sense of penitence, the cleansing forgiveness, the call to action: "Who will go for us?..." and the response, "Here am I, send me."

31. I Samuel 1-3.

32. Personalities of the OT, 83.



cant time, perhaps at the very moment when he was seeking to resolve his mother's dreams of the future with his own; certainly he was in a receptive frame of mind.

Without going into the metaphysical question we may unhesitatingly identify it as a genuine Call. Its prophetic aspect is clear, for it carried the authentic warning of doom--in itself a strange word to be spoken by a lad. Unwillingly Samuel repeated the message to the priest for whom it was intended. Yet beyond the immediate command of God which Samuel carried out there appears to have been a kind of consecration in the Call. The hand of the Lord was upon Samuel; from that time forth "the Eternal was with him" until "all Israel from Dan to Beersheba knew that Samuel was accredited as a prophet of the Eternal".<sup>33</sup> He had received his Vocation.

The Vocation of Samuel was not something that appeared "out of the blue" in his early 'teens; there had been a work of preparation. Since the day when his mother Hannah brought him to the temple at Shiloh he had been acquiring the skills of the priestly function. Situated as he was at the center of the cultus, he could not have escaped observing through the years the conditions around him. What James calls "the developing insight of boyhood" must have opened his eyes to the sacred prostitution favored by the sons of Eli. There is little chance that he failed to be aware of the growing Philistine menace. In the call of Samuel therefore it is possible to find overtones which are functional, ethical and political. The immediate

---

33. I Samuel 3:19-21. See James, op.cit., 83.

summons, like that heard by many another servant of God, had lifelong consequences.

The other call in Scripture which requires special notice at this time is the Call which came to Our Lord Jesus Christ. This Call is inevitably linked with Jesus' consciousness of His messianic mission; hence there is a sense in which the Call was eternally unique. For Jesus according to Christian belief was not merely summoned out of the human family to a particular task, like the prophets; He was begotten by God and sent into the human family for His mission. Further, as the Word of God He was and is involved in God's work of Creation, and His entrance on the scene of life was for a purpose affecting all of mankind. Ritschl actually chooses the word Vocation to express the messianic mission:

Christ...recognizes the business of His vocation to be the Lordship or Kingdom of God...as the special ordinance of God for Himself, and His activity in the fulfilment of it as service rendered to God in God's own cause...He understands the name Christ as the expression of His individual vocation...His unique vocation (is) to establish the Kingdom... and the community destined for this task.<sup>34</sup>

The first suggestion given by the historical record that Jesus was aware of His divine Vocation is contained in Luke's account of His visit to the temple at the age of twelve.<sup>35</sup> The familiar story reaches its climax with Jesus' reply to His reproachful parents: "How is it that ye sought me? Wist ye not that I must be about my Father's business?" The Greek wording,

---

<sup>34</sup>. Ritschl, Justification and Reconciliation, tr., 445-50.  
<sup>35</sup>. Luke 2:41 ff. (AV)

which is also capable of being rendered, "in my Father's house", conveys a hint that Jesus was thinking with reference to His future work. It has been suggested that these words, the earliest spoken by Him of which we have any accurate record, "sum up His whole life".<sup>36</sup>

Jewish boys in the days of Herod on reaching the age of twelve became "sons of the law"; they were allowed for the first time to attend the religious festivals. In our own day the age of twelve is also considered significant in the boy's development; he is then eligible for membership in various youth movements. But the average youngster of twelve today--as possibly in Roman times--is not too seriously concerned about his life work. It is only the unusual child, the gifted child, who in many cases has already made up his mind. Catherine Marie Cox in Genetic Studies of Genius reveals that most of her subjects knew by the age of twelve the direction their life work would take, and made plans and conducted activities accordingly.<sup>37</sup>

In the temple Jesus does not seem to be equating His chief interests with Joseph's trade; quite the contrary. The intellectual gifts He displayed--perhaps even overcoming the handicap of a Galilean accent--and the spiritual attitude He expressed suggest that whatever may have been forming in His mind, He was not thinking of His future in terms of carpentry.

---

36. Stewart, LTJC, 30.

37. Cox, Genetic Studies of Genius, II, 223-710. The reference here is not to precocity but to adult genius. Cf. Ligon, A Greater Generation, 128: "The lives of great men--or at least most of them--remind us that if we are to leave any significant footprints on the sands of time, we must start early. Most great men were well on their way by the age of twelve. It is no accident that Jesus knew at the age of twelve that he must be about his Father's business."

Vocation in the sense of a Call did not come to Jesus until eighteen years after the temple episode, as He came to present Himself for baptism by John at the Jordan river. For Christianity the event is fraught with utmost significance; it was "the most momentous call in history, the call of Jesus to His work of saving the world".<sup>38</sup> At the moment of baptism Jesus "received with unhesitating conviction the assurance of his divine vocation as the Messiah".<sup>39</sup> The vision of the dove recorded in the Gospels has traditionally been interpreted as the endowment of Jesus with the Holy Spirit, while the voice from heaven-- "Thou art my beloved Son; with Thee I am well pleased"--could be considered the call to His life-work.<sup>40</sup>

It is well to remember that for some time Jesus had already been pursuing a secular "calling". Whether He possessed natural gifts for it we do not know; certainly He had acquired some skills, experience and knowledge of the trade, else His fellow townsmen would scarcely have referred to Him as "the Carpenter".<sup>41</sup> Yet His years of work as a joiner and His established reputation in the community were quite discounted at the river Jordan. The Vocation He assumed at baptism had some points of contact with the attitude He expressed in the temple at the age of twelve, but none at all with the family trade. The conclusion to be drawn is not, however, that for Jesus God's call had no relation to daily work; quite the contrary. Jesus consistently spoke of the Vocation He assumed at baptism as "work".

---

38. J.S.Stewart, The Life and Teaching of Jesus Christ, 36.

39. Bishop Gore, Jesus of Nazareth, 46.

40. Stewart, op.cit., 43.

41. Mark 6:3.



"My father worketh hitherto and I work."<sup>42</sup> He looked upon the messianic mission not so much as a position to be filled as a task to be done. A mystic living in detachment who describes his occasional public appearances as "work", might be suspected of using a word to which he is not entitled; but when a man who has worked with his hands for nearly two decades, refers to a new aspect of his life as his work, we cannot but accept the fact that he knows what he is talking about. Jesus found after baptism that His Vocation lay in the daily work He had undertaken in preaching, teaching and healing. "The works which... I am doing, bear me witness that the Father has sent me."<sup>43</sup>

To describe Jesus during His Galilean ministry as an "itinerant carpenter" is to speak most inaccurately, for He left His trade with His tools. The Jordan river incident involved a thorough vocational adjustment: He had substituted one kind of daily work for another. If we do not know exactly what ability He had as a joiner, we have abundant evidence of His gifts in His new Vocation. The Calling of carpentry is noble in its own right, and more vital than many types of work in the life of a community. Tens of thousands of Christians have served their Lord through their hammers and planes. Nevertheless Jesus' relation to carpentry was not, strictly speaking, vocational.<sup>44</sup> When the time was ripe He was called to other work.<sup>45</sup> The experi-

---

42. John 5:17 (AV).

43. John 5:36 (ARSV).

44. Nor was Paul's relation to tent-making (Acts 18:3).

45. The fact that Jesus spent years as a manual worker in one of life's commoner occupations is perhaps the best of all possible illustrations of the Christian doctrine of work. Cf. the sermon Hugh Latimer preached to Edward VI on the subject (see p. 47).

ence, skills and reputation that Jesus acquired in the family trade served Him in good stead and yielded solid values in His later ministry, notably in His preaching,<sup>46</sup> but the occupation of carpentry seems to have been left completely behind.

Jesus then interpreted the Vocation which He received at the river Jordan as messianic mission and as life work. In the temple at the age of twelve He had shown some awareness of the nature of his future activities and of God's purpose for His life. At the baptism this awareness crystallized into action; the "fullness of time" suddenly became the concrete event in which the Good News was to be proclaimed.

B. As Call to Salvation.

Two other meanings are given for the word Vocation in the Oxford dictionary that call for comment. The first is the "call to salvation", for which the locus classicus has always been the letters of Paul. The Gospels use the word klesis only twice in a theological sense: Matthew 22:14, "Many are called but few are chosen,"<sup>47</sup> and Mark 2:17, "I came to call not the righteous, but sinners to repentance."<sup>48</sup> These verses later formed the basis of the medieval and Reformation doctrine of the vocatio exterior.<sup>49</sup> They do not fit any of the categories of Calling we are presently studying, for Jesus seems to be referring to His own invitation, such as He would give for the

---

46. "The Lord who spoke of his 'yoke' as easy was the good carpenter who knew the difference between a well-made and a badly made yoke which the poor oxen at the plough would have to wear." --TWBB, art. "Work".  
 47. Cf. Matthew 20:16 in some manuscripts.  
 48. Cf. Luke 5:32.  
 49. See pp.26, 36.

messianic banquet.<sup>50</sup>

In certain passages Paul sets forth a doctrine of Vocation in which a strong predestinarian element appears, similar to that found in I Peter and in the Old Testament--a unilateral choosing on God's part in which the human response is insignificant.<sup>51</sup> Such passages are illustrated by the following:

God chose you from the beginning to be saved, through consecration by the Spirit and belief in the truth. To this he called you through our Gospel.<sup>52</sup>

And those whom he predestined he also called; and those whom he called he also justified; and those whom he justified he also glorified.<sup>53</sup>

The famous passage in I Peter may be compared:

But you are a chosen race, a royal priesthood, a holy nation, God's own people, that you may declare the wonderful deeds of him who called you out of darkness into his marvelous light.<sup>54</sup>

It must be emphasized that Paul does not, however, leave the concept of the Calling in any such predetermined form. He is continually hedging it about with contingencies and exhortations. The Call of God is never simply a fait accompli, it is always close to a conditional fact. Christians are "called to be saints",<sup>55</sup> but sainthood and separateness are conditional upon behavior. "This calling is conditioned by the nature of

50. B. Weiss finds the Calling in the sense of invitation lying behind many parables and events of the Gospels, e.g. in the seeking for the lost sheep and coin, the gathering of her chickens by the hen, etc. (Luke 15:3-10, Matt. 23:37.) (BTNT, tr., I, 126-9.)

51. Cf. I Peter 2:9-10, Isaiah 48:15.

52. II Thessalonians 2:13-14 (ARSV). "The communication of the Spirit is always annexed to the calling." (Reuss, HCTAA, II, 117.) For a thorough discussion of the relation between Calling and the Holy Spirit, see ibid., 108-121.

53. Romans 8:30 (ARSV).

54. I Peter 2:9. (This and the following citations are from ARSV.)

55. Romans 1:7.



the hearts of the men whom it reaches, and depends upon the existence within them of susceptibility and longing for salvation."<sup>56</sup> Paul's precepts are evidence that he sees man's response in the range of his social and ethical attitudes; and that he links those attitudes with doctrinal teaching.

Christians are to seek the "hope" of God's Calling; they are to prove themselves "worthy" of it; Paul himself, though not fully arrived, "presses toward the mark for the prize of the high calling of God".<sup>57</sup> Christians are "called to freedom" and "to the peace of God"; "God has not called us for uncleanness but in consecration".<sup>58</sup>

The very fact that a Christian is called out of the world into a new order of being<sup>59</sup> in which love reigns supreme<sup>60</sup> is evidence that in some sense man's efforts are needed to vindicate the Call's effectualness--a point much emphasized in later Calvinism. Our interest is not to discuss irresistible grace, but to show that the idea that God calls men to righteous action in His service--which is what Paul meant by "walking worthy of one's vocation"--is not far distant from the view under consideration, namely that God calls men to special tasks in His cause and evokes from them an active response. Indeed, Paul declares that he himself was called to such a mission--"called to be an apostle"<sup>61</sup>-- while the Book of Acts describes more exactly the missionary nature of the Call:

56. Weiss, *op.cit.*, I, 125-6.

57. Ephesians 1:18, 4:1; Philippians 3:14; II Thessalonians 1:11 (ARSV).

58. I Thessalonians 4:7; Galatians 5:13; Colossians 3:15 (ARSV).

59. II Corinthians 5:17.

60. I Corinthians 13:13.

61. Romans 1:1.

While they were worshipping the Lord and fasting, the Holy Spirit said, "Set apart for me Barnabas and Saul for the work to which I have called them."<sup>62</sup>

Paul made a tremendous contribution to the concept of Vocation. He raised the theological significance of the individual Calls extended by Jesus. He made it clear that he considered himself to have been personally called by God through His grace<sup>63</sup> and that although he possessed by no means perfection, yet God's Call gave him his apostolic credentials and justified his life mission.<sup>64</sup> Further, Paul stressed the point that Christians were called to something as well as from something. The Call of God was not only to truth but to righteousness. The life of obedience had positive as well as negative ethical implications. The very separateness to which Paul considered himself called made him eager to go among men even to the remote corners of the earth. Thus the paradoxical manifestation of predestination and extreme activism, so typical of many of the Reformers, found its first great expression in Paul.

Finally, Paul heightened the sense of personal communion between the Caller and the called, as well as the meaning of fellowship in Christ among the whole body of the called.<sup>65</sup> The

---

<sup>62</sup>. Acts 13:2.

<sup>63</sup>. Galatians 1:15.

<sup>64</sup>. Philippians 3:13, Galatians 1:1. That Paul considered his mission a life work is implied in such passages as 2 Timothy 4:7, "I have fought the good fight, I have finished the race, I have kept the faith." Cf. Hebrews 12:1-2, "Let us run with perseverance the race that is set before us, looking to Jesus," also John 17:4, "I have finished the work which thou gavest me to do."

<sup>65</sup>. I Corinthians 1:9, "God is faithful, by whom you were called into the fellowship of his Son, Jesus Christ our Lord." In the concept of the Church as a called body there are points of direct contact with the OT view of Israel as the chosen race (Hosea 11:1, Isaiah 48:12,15), which is reflected also in I Peter 2:9 (see above, pp. 5,16).

Call may have come to him individually, but it was a Call into the Body of Christ, a summons into the Christian community. The relationship between the individual and the community he explained on the basis of the differentiation of function, about which more will be said later.<sup>66</sup> The Call to salvation was thus not only a Call out of the world to a life that was hid with Christ in God; it was also a set of orders directing the believer to use his gifts within the redeemed fellowship.<sup>67</sup>

Thus did Paul establish the doctrinal foundations of the New Testament concept of Vocation, which remains in the words of Brunner "one of the most profound truths which have ever been conceived by the mind of man".<sup>68</sup>

### C. As Secular Calling.

There is yet another meaning attached to the word Vocation that can be traced to the Bible. It seems almost to have been invented by Paul in the seventh chapter of I Corinthians, as he sought to counsel the Christian community in the problems of everyday living. Because of the enormous importance of the passage for the future doctrine of Vocation, it needs to be reproduced in the Authorized Version:

But as God hath distributed to every man, as the Lord hath called every one, so let him walk...Is any man called being circumcised? let him not become uncircumcised. Is any called in uncircumcision? let him not be circumcised...Let every man abide in the same calling wherein he was called. Art thou called being a servant? care not for it; but if thou mayest be made free, use it rather...Brethren, let every man, wherein he is called, therein abide with God...

---

66. See p. 119.

67. Cf. Romans 8:3-8.

68. Divine Imperative, 199.

Art thou bound unto a wife? Seek not to be loosed. Art thou loosed from a wife? Seek not a wife...But this I say, brethren, the time is short...for the fashion of this world passeth away.<sup>69</sup>

The above excerpts contain the gist of the passage upon which all secular interpretations of Vocation have been built. It has been analyzed many times in Christian history, with many differing conclusions. There is however general agreement among many scholars on certain points:

(1). The passage has a definitely eschatological setting, apart from which the significance of Paul's remarks is missed. The prime conditioning factor was the expected Parousia. Had the "time" not been "short", the directions might have been different. The medieval Church erred in following Jerome and seeking here a proof text for clerical chastity. It took the counsel given to an ordinary mixed congregation in the face of an impending cataclysm, as the design for a permanent monastic establishment accommodating a special class of persons.

(2). The word Calling, particularly in the line, "Let every man abide in the same calling wherein he is called", refers to the status or outward condition of life in which a man finds himself--the marital, ritual, social and occupational status.<sup>70</sup> The general framework of the individual's life should not be altered, in view of the expected end. Outward conditions do not just "count for nothing", as Calhoun thinks, for the

---

69. I Corinthians 7:17-31 (selections, AV).

70. Cf. Calhoun, op.cit., 18. I Corinthians 7:20 is best studied in the light of I Thessalonians 4:11-12, which also introduces the element of manual labor: "We exhort you...to aspire to live quietly, to mind your own affairs, and to work with your hands, as we charged you." (ARSV).



very phrase "use it rather" shows that Paul considered freedom better than slavery. Nor is it that the apostle was a morning star of economic laissez-faire. The essence of Paul's reasoning, which seems to have escaped most commentators,<sup>71</sup> is that when the Christian remains quietly in his station, God's action--His Call--has a deeper effect. If in the time that remains before the Parousia, God does not have to contend with a restless, active spirit, but on the contrary is presented with a steady attitude of being, he can the more easily lead His Called one on to full salvation.

(3) The reason for the choice of the word Calling to express Paul's idea is obscure. "We do not know enough about the language usages of the time to decide whether Paul was coining a new thought altogether unique in the history of religion, or whether he was making use of some current idea."<sup>72</sup> Some have assumed that since the Post-Reformation development of Vocation as occupation is attributed to this passage, Paul must have been referring to abiding in one's employment. Quite possibly employment is included in Paul's general thinking, e.g. as a part of the duties of a slave. Weber's contention that Paul was thinking in terms of status or condition rather than occupation is generally held to be valid,<sup>73</sup> though Bishop Kirk has asked with some perception why, if Paul meant those words, he did not use their Greek equivalents instead of putting the

---

71. But not Luther. See Bernhard Weiss, op.cit., II, 2.

72. Holl, op.cit., III, 190; Forrester, PESC, op.cit.

73. Weber, op.cit., 209.

word Calling to a use which has no known parallels in ancient literature.<sup>74</sup>

## Section II. Emergence of the Medieval Sense of Vocation.

The Biblical concept of Vocation, as is generally known, underwent a transformation in the centuries following the Apostolic age, along with other cardinal teachings of the faith. By the time of Eusebius the word vocatio was being applied exclusively to ecclesiastical functions. A Vocation was a call to the religious life, priestly, monastic, ascetic. The Vocation did not consist so much in the Call heard as a divine summons, for the truly decisive call was issued by the bishop. The Calling was more the religious state itself. The religious Calling was the highest of all callings; in fact it was really the only Calling, for other activities in the world

---

74. The Vision of God, 81 n. J. Weiss (HPC, II, 589) thinks that there is a passage in Epictetus, about sixty years after Paul, which provides a legitimate parallel. Epictetus speaks (Book I, 29) about the possibility of God summoning the wise man on to the stage of life as a witness, saying to him, "Lay aside the laticlave (senatorial dress) and clothing yourself in rags, come forward in this character." (Discourses of Epictetus, Long tr.) Weiss comments: "Calling is thus here quite properly the vocatio, the mission to fulfil, in a particular task of life, a particular task... This linguistic usage approximates our 'call'." But Bonhöffer (Epiktet und das Neue Testament, 37-8, 208), and Kirk both disagree. If Epictetus indeed thought of the Call as a summons to a particular task it would be interesting, but the text will not support Weiss' view. The motive for laying aside the laticlave was not a task or a mission to fulfil a condition of life, but rather Stoic indifference to all the conditions of life.

of affairs were not undertaken in response to vocatio.<sup>75</sup>

"The Church in its early days," writes Forrester, "was more concerned with missionary expansion than with any ethical principle or social programme. And by the time the Parousia expectation was fading, the catholicizing movement was already well on its way. In becoming acclimatized to the Greek culture, the Church began to exalt the contemplative above the practical life."<sup>76</sup> So for a thousand years the Church used vocatio exclusively to describe its own various activities.

Research done in the late medieval period during the past fifty years has shown that the doctrine of secular Vocation was

- 
75. See Troeltsch, op.cit., 118-20, 184-5, on the attitude of the early Church to work; esp. the quotation from Uhlhorn: "The conception of vocation, the connection of the earthly calling with the heavenly one, had not yet dawned upon the Church (at the time of the ancient Fathers)." Troeltsch also states that "The Early Church...had no idea of a 'calling' in the (later) sense." (Ib.) Worldly activities were known, esp. after Thomas, as officium or ministerium. But Troeltsch translates these words as Beruf (Calling in his Eng. tr.) This leads him to make such erroneous statements as "Luther's view of vocation agreed with that of Paul, the early Church, and the Middle ages." (op.cit., 610.) Other scholars have been unable to discover so much as a single medieval Catholic reference to secular labor or in fact to any worldly activity as vocatio. Cf. Troeltsch, 293-4, 420 ff; Weber, op.cit., 211; Calhoun, op.cit., 253-4.
76. PESC, op.cit. (following Holl and Troeltsch). Vocatio was quickly identified with chastity by the early Fathers. Thus Jerome used I Corinthians 7, including v. 24, "Let every man, wherein he is called, therein abide with God," (AV), to justify the ascetic life. The eschatological framework was ignored. As an example of the manhandling of Paul's teaching for ascetic purposes, Jerome's letter to Gaudentius may be cited: "'Is any called being circumcised'--that is, as a virgin? 'Let him not become uncircumcised'--that is, let him not seek the coat of marriage given to Adam on his expulsion from the paradise of virginity." Abiding in one's Calling meant to Jerome, above all else, remaining chaste. The call to chastity was then identified with the religious life, which in turn was identified with the various ecclesiastical activities. (Jerome's Selected Works, letter 128.)



not entirely an achievement of the Reformation; yet it has not been proved that Thomas Aquinas or even late medieval writers such as Antoninus of Florence, Gerson or Gabriel Biel ever raised the doctrine to the full level of religious activity. Indeed, they did not even give it complete expression by using the word vocatio in any sense that could be called worldly or secular.<sup>77</sup> Holl reports of Thomas Aquinas that "it is...no different than with Berthold (of Regensburg); one's condition of employment is a service, a not unnecessary service, a service regulated by God, but still no 'call' in the true meaning of the word."<sup>78</sup> Forrester believes that in the writings of Aquinas and others and in the organization of the Guilds "the later Middle Ages were struggling to express the idea, but the doctrine of the two standards prevented its full development."<sup>79</sup>

- 
77. Nearly all the available evidence on which a case for a medieval doctrine of secular Vocation can be built has been amassed by Holl in his article Die Geschichte des Wortes Beruf (GAK, III, 207-8). At first sight it appears impressive, but the citations from Antoninus, Gerson and Gabriel Biel turn out to be either rephrasings of Paul, whose teaching on Vocation was hardly "worldly"; or they are noble tributes to "labor corporalis pertinens ad vitae sustentationem" which make no reference to Vocation. Biel, in one notable instance, states that when Christ calls, "Come unto me all ye who labor" it is apparent that just as none are without labor, so none are without Vocation. But the Vocation as heard in Christ's Call in this instance is quite different from what Luther and Calvin meant by the worldly Calling. There were Dominican preachers in Tauler's day who also spoke eloquently for the spiritual value of daily work, although they do not seem to have gone as far as Tauler, who was likewise a Dominican. (Holl, ib.)
78. Calhoun writes, "So far as I can discover, St. Thomas never applied to the doing of opus manuale (secular labor in its widest sense) the distinctive terms vocare, vocatio; nor did he ever grant to those engaged in such work a level (gradus) of life comparable to that of the orders set apart to engage in opera spiritualia. On this latter point, the tract De perfectione vitae spiritualis...is decisive." (op.cit., 211).
79. Cunningham Lectures. 1950, III.

While monasticism leaned heavily on the disdainful attitude toward work of the ancient Greeks, there is also evidence that the Church has consistently produced men who held work in high esteem.<sup>80</sup> Augustine is credited with the saying "laborare est orare" which Benedict took for his order. Thomas Aquinas dealt systematically with ordinary work and (in spite of his Aristotelianism) he greatly dignified its status, particularly in the towns.<sup>81</sup> He spoke of the "division of men in different occupations" as occurring "in the first place through divine providence, which distributes the condition of men in such a way".<sup>82</sup> A man's actual field of work is determined however "in the second place from natural causes,"<sup>83</sup> as a result of which it happens that there are different aptitudes for different occupations amongst different men."<sup>84</sup> In the writings of Brother Lawrence, Francis of Assisi and other medieval Catholics there is found, further, a positive glorification of the daily tasks. Yet none of these ever questioned the superiority of the religious life, which remained for them the "better part".<sup>85</sup>

---

80. On the influence of Aristotle's views of work upon the medieval church, see Borne and Henry, A Philosophy of Work (tr.), and Forrester, Cunningham Lectures, II, III. Biblical views of work are discussed below, pp. 157 ff.

81. Cf. Troeltsch, op.cit., 295.

82. Cf. I Corinthians 7:17.

83. Cf. Pascal, "La chose la plus importante à toute la vie est la choix du métier; le hasard en dispose." The idea that a rather impersonal fate decides one's "Vocation" also occurs in early Puritanism, e.g. in the verses of Robert Crowley.

84. Quaest. Quodlibetales, VII, Art. 17c. Opera, vol. VI. Passage tr. by H. M. Robertson, op.cit., 6.

85. Although the monastic life is described as the "better part", one Catholic writer (Grabmann) claims that "according to all the rules of logic it does not follow that the laity belong to a worse"! (Troeltsch, op.cit., 396.)

Our conclusion must be that the Catholic teaching on vocatio had little share in the future molding of the word; that the modern secular definition of Vocation is almost entirely a post-Reformation development.<sup>86</sup>

How well Catholic doctrine has withstood the secular trend both from within and without may be seen in the current description of Vocation in the Catholic Encyclopedia:

VOCATION, Ecclesiastical and Religious. An ecclesiastical or religious vocation is the special gift of those who, in the Church of God, follow with a pure intention the ecclesiastical profession or the evangelical counsels.

No definition of any other kind of Vocation is given, despite the attempts of some modern Catholics to apply the concept to the work of the layman. We are left with an official view of the Calling which is purely medieval in spirit, and which seems equidistant from the Biblical and the later Protestant views.

### Section III. Luther's Doctrine of the Secular Calling.

In the fourteenth century the German mystics Eckhart, Seuse and Tauler accorded to daily labor quite a new status. Having little use for monasticism, they sought to prove that a man could be in a state of union with God no matter what his earthly condition. They rejected the idea that the monk had chosen the "better part". Tauler went so far as to maintain that the earthly condition could in fact be a path which led to God, and he

---

86. We are speaking here of secular development; on the spiritual side traces of Thomas Aquinas' teaching on the vocatio interior and vocatio exterior can be found even in the Westminster Confession. See Q. 67-8, concerning "effectual" and "outward" Calling, and discussion below, pp. 36-7.

went beyond his fellow Dominican preachers in giving to this state the name Ruff or Ladung, that is, a call or a summons from God. Ruff was beginning to be known in German by this time as a synonym for Stand, possibly from early translations of I Corinthians 7:20,<sup>87</sup> but Tauler became more specific. He applied Ruff to daily work such as the making of shoes and the spreading of manure, and declared that no matter how mean was a man's Calling, it was possible to find the grace of God in it--in contrast to the activities of a "conceited monk" who did not actually earn his bread with his hands.<sup>88</sup>

In the succeeding century the value of secular states of being rose somewhat due to the endorsement of daily work by the mystics, by the Dominican preachers and by the late medieval writers already mentioned. By the time of Luther the word Ruff or Ruf was in general use in the meaning of Stand,<sup>89</sup> but as yet none except Tauler, so far as one can discover, had linked Ruf directly with "occupation" or "means of livelihood".<sup>90</sup>

Luther's development of a concept of Calling (Berufgedanke) has been carefully studied in the past fifty years by Eger, Weber and Holl among others. They have not always agreed in their conclusions but they are at one in crediting Tauler with influencing Luther's thought in this connection. Luther's ultimate mature Berufgedanke was, to be sure, more comprehensive than the treatment given by the mystics, and became as a result

---

87. Klesis and Vocatio were usually rendered in German by Ruff-unge (Weber, *op.cit.*, 207.)

88. Die Predigten Taulers, Vetter ed., 7, 13, 14, 25, 177, 240, 243.

89. Holl, *ib.*, 208-9.

90. See n. 77.



one of the keystone doctrines of Protestant Christianity. Because of the influence this doctrine had on modern vocational thinking, it is important to examine briefly the way in which it took form.

In the introduction to the Psalms (Luther) had said, with reference to the monastic life, that obedience raised up the most insignificant act to the highest value.<sup>91</sup> Now (i.e. by 1520) it dawned on him that this principle could be extended beyond its meaning for monasticism. It mattered only how much joyous will and love were brought into a work; thus God could be served as well by the smallest as by the greatest deed.<sup>92</sup>

As his reforming activities progressed Luther came gradually to the opinion that the worldly state of man, if not better, was at least as true a vocatio as the monastic way of life. In his Sermon on Good Works (1520) he declared that a man's "work in trade, standing, walking, eating, drinking, sleeping, and all kinds of work done to support life or the general need" found their true significance only when they were related to God.<sup>93</sup> The daily happenings "within the world" provided the opportunity for the highest of all good works, namely faith, and these same happenings also gave occasion to prove one's gratitude, obedience, stewardship, helpfulness and love in contact with one's neighbor.<sup>94</sup>

---

91. Auslegung der sieben Busspsalmen, WA I, 163, 20. (1517).

92. Holl, op.cit., I, 208.

93. WA II, 60, 27 ff. See Holl, ib., 240.

94. "All works that are done in this faith are equal and alike, and the one the same as the other. Here, therefore, all distinction between works falls to the ground, whether they be great or small, long or short, many or few. For the works are not pleasing unto God in themselves, but because of the faith in which they are done. . . Some... regard their own gain more than the Commandment of God..as though they ought not to be as watchful in the cause of their neighbor as they are in their own!" -- Sermon on Good Works (Cole tr., London, 1828).

Luther was still not ready to break altogether with the monastic ideal of life, though he was becoming aware of its anachronistic position in the face of his own increasing participation in and estimate of the activities of the world. Heretofore he had disposed of the question of man's duty in society apart from the Church, simply by quoting I Samuel 10:7, "Do as thy hand shall find, for God is with thee."<sup>95</sup> Not until after the shattering events of the Diet of Worms (March-April, 1521) did he become conscious of the fact that his earlier injunction to do within the customary callings "as thy hand shall find" was hardly sufficient. For now, as Holl observes, it became evident to Luther that not every calling in which one stood was acceptable.<sup>96</sup> Especially was he suspicious of certain religious callings. Accordingly he began during his stay in Wartburg castle (1521-2) to work out a new concept of secular Vocation.

The most significant immediate change to be noticed is Luther's use of the word Beruf instead of Stand, Amt or Befehl, which were the words he had previously used in connection with worldly activity. In choosing Beruf rather than Tauler's word Ruf, Luther used a word with clear spiritual implications, similar to Berufung which had succeeded Ruffunge as the German equivalent of Call in the normal Pauline sense. When he translated I Corinthians in the Wartburg, Luther employed Beruf in the crucial verse at 7:20 (actually following older German translations). The translation itself was not significant; but about

---

95. WA VI, 207, 4.

96. Holl, op.cit., I, 241.

the same time, Dec. 27, 1521, St. John the Evangelist's Day, Luther preached a remarkable Kirchenpostille sermon, in which he used Beruf to set forth a new and vigorous doctrine of worldly Vocation.<sup>97</sup>

Before dealing directly with this doctrine it is necessary to comment on a point in Weber's research which led to his notable thesis regarding the connection between Protestantism and capitalism. Weber is perhaps correct in saying that Paul was not referring to occupations or fields of activity in I Corinthians 7:20, as we have already noted. But it may well be that Weber is too emphatic in claiming that Luther did not complete his creation of the modern concept of Beruf until the year 1533, when he translated the book of Ecclesiasticus. In chapter 11, verse 21, according to Weber, when Luther rendered the words "stick to your work" as "bleibe in deinem Beruf", the word Beruf was used for the first time in its modern sense.<sup>98</sup>

Karl Holl, writing with Weber's work before him, is quite certain that the word Beruf "in its ordinary meaning of today, with exclusive reference to the worldly callings, wherein the early religious sound of the word was neither intense nor yet quite lost" was already present in the St. John's Day sermon of 1521. Having no particular thesis to establish as Weber did, Holl seems to be able to approach the study of Calling from a more comprehensive historical viewpoint. He shows that Luther's creative discovery in this connection was not a particular use of a particular word, but a whole new field of activity in

---

97. WA X, 1, 303 ff.

98. Weber, op.cit., 79.

which God can be joyously and effectively served, namely, the life of the world.<sup>99</sup>

Luther's teaching on the subject of the Calling did undoubtedly tend to be traditionalistic and to encourage everyone to "stay in his own business", as Weber contends. One quotation from the Tischreden is sufficient to prove the point:

It is much to be lamented that no man is content and satisfied with that which God gives him in his vocation and calling. Other men's conditions please us more than our own...The more we have the more we want. To serve God is for everyone to remain in his vocation and calling, be it ever so mean and simple.<sup>100</sup>

To maintain that the traditionalistic element is the most significant, however, as Weber claims, is to pass completely by Luther's main point.<sup>101</sup> For the idea Luther is seeking to express is not "stay where you are" or even "work where you are", but rather it is "be obedient where you are--to God". This emphasis is evident in the St. John's Day sermon, in the Wartburg translation of the New Testament which was published in September, 1522, and in the special commentary on I Cor. 7 which Luther wrote the following year.<sup>102</sup> The change in the concept of Calling resulted from his discovery that "all service ranks the same with God", to use a line from Browning's Pippa Passes. Luther found that one could be as obedient to God outside the monastery as within it, and it was this fact that forced a revision of his view of vocatio. That such a revision had taken place by 1522--regardless of any specific use of Beruf for Arbeit or Geschäft--is

99. Holl, op.cit., 219, 259.

100. Tischreden, DCCCXCI. (tr.)

101. Weber, op.cit., 209.

102. WA XII, 88 ff.



evident from the following quotation from the St. John's Day sermon. After quoting from Psalm 25:12, "Him shall (God) teach in the way that he shall choose," Luther says:

You might reply, "But how is it if I have not been called? What shall I then do?" Answer: How is it possible that you have not been called? You are in the state of matrimony, you are already a married man or wife or child or daughter or servant or maid. Take your most modest state: you are a married man. Have you not enough to do in this state? To govern your wife, child, servant and estate, and to see that everything goes under obedience to God and that you wrong nobody? Indeed, if you had four heads and ten hands, you would still find them too few to allow you to take some holy work to yourself...So you see how nobody is without command and calling, and even so is nobody also without work, if so be he will do right. And everyone should take care that he remain in his calling (Stand) in which he finds himself, therein truly to serve God and keep His commandments...It is certain that God's eyes look not on the works, but on the obedience in the work; therein will he also that we should look on the work, as St. Paul says, I Cor. 7, "Let everyone abide in the calling in which he was called."<sup>103</sup>

What Luther seems to have changed in the years after 1522 was not his view of the calling--that had definitely been extended to worldly activity<sup>104</sup>--but rather his view of work. Greater activity in affairs outside the monastery brought a new awareness of the value of daily work. He began to condemn idleness and to praise the principle of joy in work. The milking of cows and other opera servilia, he said, held equal value in God's eyes with any kind of work in faith and obedience. Believers should not be "curious" about other vocations--that

---

103. WA X 1, 308-11.

104. A good reason for that extension was the burning question of monks' and priests' vows in Wittenberg, where both Jonas and Bugenhagen took wives in 1522. It is significant that henceforth Luther abandoned the monastic estimate of the worldly state altogether. See Holl, op.cit., 258 ff.

is, other types of work. All work is nothing else than a screen behind which God Himself works. The range of "good works" mentioned in the sermon of 1520 was considerably widened by 1544 when the Commentary on Genesis appeared, so that Luther could say that even Adam was not allowed to be idle in the Garden, but had been given something by God zu schaffen.<sup>105</sup>

It is important to remember that Luther's concept of work was so intensely bound to duty to God that it never, in his writings, escaped completely from the realm of the theological into the secular. As Holl expresses it:

The joy in work that he meant has nothing to do with a dull activity in which the content of the work is, in the long run, ignored, and which becomes only an expression of an inner unrest. To (Luther) it is much more just the living feeling for the sense of the work, the consciousness that through the work something is being done to the honor of God's name and to meet the needs of one's neighbor...The world did not guess that work is a blessing; therefore man works only when need drives him. But the Christian becomes a worker even when he possesses things in abundance, for he cannot have his God without being willing to work in His service.<sup>106</sup>

Thus instead of seeking to lower the concept of Beruf to a word of merely secular significance, Luther sought to do the opposite by raising the daily commonplace tasks of life to a highest level of obedience to God's inner Call, thereby strengthening man's sense of duty, his conscience, and his confidence in himself.<sup>107</sup>

---

105. WA XXXI, 1, 436; see Weber, op.cit., 215. Also WA XXIX, 441, 19 ff., Enarrationes in Genesim, op. lat. exeg., ed. Elsparger, VII, 213; IV, 109.

106. Holl, op.cit., 260.

107. On self-confidence the following is worthy of quoting from the Commentary on Galatians: "If a magistrate, an household-er, a servant, a schoolmaster, a scholar abide in his vocation, and do his work therein faithfully...he may glory and rejoice in himself; for he may say, I have done the works of my vocation appointed unto me by God and with such faithfulness and diligence as I was able." (VI, 4).

There is yet to be mentioned the view, never carefully worked out by Luther but none the less present in his writings, that society consists of a fabric of callings in which men mutually give and receive the benefits of their work. Weber finds Luther's views of the distribution of labor "highly naive", but Holl sees in them an important sociological principle.

For the meaning of each calling is that man therein mutually serves and does not necessary work for the whole group...The calling is the<sup>108</sup> connecting link binding individuals together.

Thus Luther praises the status of marriage above monastic celibacy on the ground that it enjoins greater individual duties and forces man to think of his neighbor.<sup>109</sup> And while he sees little evidence of true Christian concern for others,<sup>110</sup> there is no doubt whatever in his mind as to the nature of the ideal. In the St. John's day sermon he quoted I Peter 4:10 in the words, "You shall be as true, good stewards or office bearers of the many graces (A.V. "manifold grace") in order that each of you may, with that which he has received, helpfully serve the other." He commented,

See how St. Peter says that the grace and the gifts of God are not all the same, but differ. And whoever shall take this saying truly will use it for others. How fine it will be if it so happens that a man seeks his own and yet at the same time serves his neighbor's interest, and thereby in good relations with one another they proceed on the right path toward heaven.<sup>111</sup>

Finally, Luther renewed and strengthened the New Testament doctrine of the Calling in its more traditional form. The inner

---

108. Holl, *op.cit.*, 258-9.  
 109. WA VIII 328, 15 ff.  
 110. WA XXXI, 1, 88, 3ff.  
 111. WA X I, 311.

Call of God, so strongly emphasized by Paul, lay at the heart of Luther's own personal experience, and appears throughout his devotional writings. In a sense the impetus that Luther gave to the idea of the Call as a summons into the Kingdom, was fully as important as his doctrine of weltlicher Beruf. For while the latter was a logical extension of the Biblical idea of the Call to a special task or mission, the emphasis on God's personal, intimate Call to salvation as the mark of every Christian, was at the crux of the Reformation. Theologians for centuries past had worked out elaborate doctrines of Vocation, had discussed its relation to election, to preaching, and to "the good intention"; but because of the restriction of Vocation to the clergy, the schoolmen had been unable to relate God's Call supremely, as Paul did, to the new life in Christ.<sup>112</sup>

Luther's treatment of Vocation was thus a recapitulation in miniscule of his whole Reforming mission, for the dealing with it he went to the Bible for his inspiration, and then liberated the concept from monastic captivity. Vocation, in Dr. Forrester's phrase, became the ethical counterpart of the doctrine of the priesthood of all believers.<sup>113</sup>

---

112. Thomas Aquinas distinguished a vocatio exterior and a vocatio interior, the former being the Call through preaching, the latter a "divinely implanted impulse toward the good". (Sentent. iv. dist. 17, Q.1. artt. 1,2.) Luther also noted a two-fold Calling but it was quite different: "either divine, which is done by the highest power, which is of faith; or else it is a calling of love, which is done by one's equal." (Tischreden, Hazlitt tr., 1848, cccxcii.) See discussion of views of Vocation held by Cassian, Augustine, Suarez etc. in Cath. Encyc., in loc.

113. Cunningham Lectures. IV.



## Section IV. Doctrine of the Calling after Luther.

### A. The Reformed View of the Divine Calling.

Luther's teaching on Vocation left a permanent impression on the Church of the Reformation; the Lutheran theologians of succeeding centuries did little more than elaborate his views. Calvin introduced Luther's teaching to the Reformed churches, however, and made significant alterations which require some notice.

Like Luther, Calvin tended to consider the Calling in two ways, in its divine aspect and in its worldly aspect. In its divine aspect he followed the scholastic distinction between the vocatio exterior and vocatio interior. There are, he said,

Two species of calling; -- for there is a universal call, by which God, through the external preaching of the word, invites all men alike, even those for whom he designs the call to be a savour of death, and the ground of a severer condemnation. Besides this there is a special call which, for the most part, God bestows on believers only, when by the internal illumination of the Spirit he causes the word preached to take deep root in their hearts.<sup>114</sup>

The distinction, which is also found in later Lutheran theology as vocatio generalis and vocatio specialis, is based on the saying of Jesus, "Many are called but few are chosen."<sup>115</sup>

Calvin accentuated the thought already present in Lutheran writings that the inner Call is the effectual Call, which means that its effectiveness is not contingent upon an answer. The Christian does indeed answer the Call, but it is God rather than man who wills and activates the answer. For Calvin "the call is effectual not, as for the Lutheran theology, because the word

---

<sup>114</sup>. Institutes, III, xxiv, 8.

<sup>115</sup>. Matthew 22:14.

carries within it an inherent converting potentiality, but because, through the power of the Holy Spirit working ab extra, it actually effects conversion."<sup>116</sup> The Calling follows as an inevitable consequence of the divine decree of predestination. "By calling...(God) admits them to his family...When calling is thus added to election...nothing is to be looked for in it but the free mercy of God. For if we ask whom it is he calls, and for what reason, he answers, it is those whom he had chosen."<sup>117</sup> This interpretation was eventually incorporated into the Westminster Confession and the Larger Catechism.

All those whom God hath predestinated unto life, and those only, he is pleased, in his appointed and accepted time, effectually to call, by his word and Spirit, out of that state of sin and death in which they are by nature, to grace and salvation by Jesus Christ.<sup>118</sup>

Q. 67. What is effectual calling?

A. Effectual calling is the work of God's almighty power and grace, whereby...he doth, in his accepted time, invite and draw them to Jesus Christ, by his word and Spirit...

Q. 68. Are the elect only effectually called?

A. All the elect, and they only, are effectually called; although others may be, and often are, outwardly called by the ministry of the word who...do never truly come to Jesus Christ.<sup>119</sup>

The doctrine of the effectual Calling as it appeared in the Westminster documents became the norm for religious and ecclesiastical usage in the Protestant churches of the English-speaking world.

#### B. Calvinism and the Worldly Calling.

It now becomes necessary to inquire as to what happened

---

116. ERE, art. "calling".

117. Institutes, Book III, xxiv, 1.

118. Westminster Confession, x.

119. Westminster Larger Catechism.

after Luther's day to the concept of calling in the sense of I Corinthians 7:20. Luther, be it remembered, translated vocatio with Beruf and later used the same word to render Sirach's "stick to your work" with "bleibe in deinem Beruf". He thus created a linguistic tool with which to fashion his concept of worldly Vocation.

In Germany the word Beruf began a process of secularization which had its counterpart in English-speaking countries. To find the true heritage of Luther's work it is necessary to turn again to Calvin. Typically, Calvin systematized Luther's doctrine of the secular calling as he did the New Testament doctrine of the "heavenly calling". A remarkable passage in the Institutes sets forth Calvin's view:

The Lord enjoins every one of us, in all the actions of life, to have respect to our own calling. He knows the boiling restlessness of the human mind, the fickleness with which it is borne hither and thither... its ambition. Therefore, lest all things should be thrown into confusion by our folly and rashness, he has assigned distinct duties to each in the different modes of life. And that no one may presume to overstep his proper limits, he has distinguished the different modes of life by the name of callings. Every man's life, therefore, is a kind of station assigned him by the Lord...so...that all our actions are thereby estimated in his sight...In everything the call of the Lord is the foundation and beginning of right action. .In all our cares, toils, annoyances, and other burdens, it will be no small alleviation to know that all these are under the superintendence of God. The magistrate will more willingly perform his office, and the father of a family confine himself to his proper sphere. Every one in his particular mode of life will, without repining, suffer its inconveniences, cares, uneasiness and anxiety, persuaded that God has laid on the burden. This, too, will afford admirable consolation, that in following your proper calling,<sup>120</sup> no work will be so mean and sordid as not to have a splendour and value in the eye of God.<sup>121</sup>

---

<sup>120</sup>. Latin, vocatio; French, vocation.

<sup>121</sup>. From Book III, x of the Institutes: "How to Use the Present Life, and the Comforts of It," 6.

The influence of Luther on this passage is manifest; it could not have been written without Luther's prior work. Yet the points of difference are more characteristic and significant than the resemblances. Calvin followed Luther's traditionalism but he organized it more carefully as one would who was interested in the proper division of labor and the rational ordering of life. Luther's emphasis on divine obedience in worldly activity was changed to divine obedience through careful stewardship and daily labor in an ordered calling. Eger<sup>122</sup> and others have noted the subtle change from Luther's view that the Christian serves God in vocatione, to Calvin's emphasis on service per vocationem. The change heightened the importance of the work itself as an instrument for God's glory. It should be noted, too, that Calvin stresses the fact that man must work "without repining", persuaded that "God has laid on the burden"; and that Calvin's sense of discrimination prevented him from saying with Luther that "mean and sordid" work was equal to other kinds in God's eyes, though he conceded it value and even splendor.

Out of this passage was hewn the Calvinistic doctrine of the secular calling which has been made the vehicle of Max Weber's thesis that Protestant asceticism created the spiritual conditions for the rise of modern industrial capitalism.<sup>123</sup> We cannot deny Weber's contention that Calvinism and particularly Puritanism sought to subject the whole of life to a

---

122. Die Anschuungen Luthers vom Beruf, 117.

123. See Weber, op.cit., pp. 180-3. Weber denies however that the Reformation can be deduced from economic changes, or that capitalism as an economic system is a creation of the Reformation (90-1).



rigorous moral discipline. Calvinism made labor in a calling an integral part of the Christian's duty of proving his faith and establishing the certainty of his election. The Westminster Larger Catechism interpreted the eighth commandment as prescribing "a lawful calling, and diligence in it" for every man. The significance of this attempt to discipline the working life of humanity has been rather suggestively set forth by Troeltsch after the manner of Weber:

The Protestant ethic of the "calling", with its Calvinistic assimilation of the Capitalist system, with its severity and its control of the labour rendered as a sign of the assurance of election, made service in one's "calling", the systematic exercise of one's energies, into a service both necessary in itself and appointed by God, in which profit is regarded as the sign of the Divine approval. This conception of the "calling"...laid the foundation of a world of specialized labour, which taught men to work for work's sake, and in so doing, it produced our present-day bourgeois way of life.<sup>124</sup>

A considerable literature has arisen around the Weber thesis, and many of his conclusions have been modified where they have not been directly called in question.<sup>125</sup> The effect of what he calls "Protestant asceticism" on the spirit of capitalism is too well documented to be doubted.<sup>126</sup> But that the idea of the Calling itself was such an all-important factor in creating the conditions of capitalism seems more difficult to accept. As Tawney points out,<sup>127</sup> most of Weber's illustrations of his thesis are drawn from the writings of English Puritans of the

---

124. Social Teaching of the Christian Churches, 11, 645.

125. For a survey of the literature to 1930 see Tawney's foreword to the Weber translation, 4-5.

126. See Weber, op.cit., chapter V; Tawney, Religion and the Rise of Capitalism, chapters 11,v.

127. Foreword to Weber translation,9.

latter part of the seventeenth century. The tracts of these moralists<sup>128</sup> may have had some influence but how far they affected the division of labor is exceedingly questionable. H.M. Robertson has suggested that the material conditions of industrialism probably had more influence on the doctrine of the Calling than the doctrine itself had on the development of

---

128. One of the ablest Puritan discussions of the Calling is found in Richard Baxter's Christian Directory (Part I, Ch. III, xx.) Baxter's main points are: "Choose that employment or calling (so far as you have your choice) in which you may be most serviceable to God...and the common good,...and best escape sinning," and "Be very watchful redeemers of your time, and make conscience of every hour and minute...in the best and most serviceable manner that you can." Baxter takes a less serious view than either Luther or Calvin of Paul's admonition in I Cor. 7:20: "No man must take up or change any calling, without sufficient cause to call him to it; but when he hath such cause, he sinneth if he change it not." This is a long way from Paul's eschatological view that if man abode quietly in his present status, God would lead him on to full salvation! (See Weiss, BTNT, II, 2).

Another representative writer is Richard Steele, who in 1684 published The Tradesman's Calling, being a Discourse concerning the Nature, Necessity, Choice, etc. of a Calling in general. Sample: "God doth call every man and woman to serve him in some peculiar employment in this world, both for their own and the common good." (p.1).

Earlier in the same century William Perkins of Cambridge took the same approach: "Offices and callings which serve to preserve the good estate of any family, church or common wealth, are lawfull and of God. . . The calling in which (a man) is, is the particular calling in which God (would) bee served of him." In proper Puritan style, Perkins listed only two gifts for a calling, "namely aptnesse and willingnesse". (Workes, 1, 481, ff.)



Capitalism.<sup>129</sup> Contrary to Weber's thesis that the ascetic Protestant idea of the Calling<sup>130</sup> set the pattern for modern specialized industrial work,<sup>131</sup> Brunner believes that the modern capitalist system has destroyed the idea of the Calling in its narrow bourgeois form, "since it has dissolved the whole order of callings."<sup>132</sup>

- 
129. Robertson says of Weber, "Owing to his unhistorical treatment he has not noticed the change in the conception of the 'calling' from an antidote against covetous ambition to a comfortable doctrine suitable for a commercial people (in Puritan literature). He has treated the doctrine as having been the same for all time; and the adherent of the school of 'economic determinism' may be excused if he criticises Weber for neglecting the converse study of the influence of capitalism on the Protestant Ethic." (op.cit., 15.) A similar strain is found in Troeltsch: "It was not the Christian attitude towards work...which produced this world of civil callings. In the first place it was the result of economic and political conditions...It was rather this achievement of the city...in the division of labour...which essentially created the new positive conception of 'the calling' as a rational constituent part of the social system." (op.cit., 295). One is tempted to wonder whether Weber would have called the division of labor among the bees the result of a Protestant doctrine of the Calling! In fairness to Weber it should be said that Robertson fails to see that Weber is not interested in showing that the Calling directly encouraged avarice, or even the accumulation of wealth; but merely in showing that it formed the basis on which capital was able to establish an orderly division of labor. By his quotations from the contemporary Catholic writers, Robertson does show however that the doctrine of the Calling was not of itself strong enough to bear any such weight in the economic structure of modern society.
130. It cannot be pointed out too often that the disciplinary ideas held by the later Puritans, especially the Baptists and Methodists, differed vastly from those held by Calvin himself and even by the early Puritans. Calvin once described the Puritan ascetic attitude to life as "*inhumana illa philosophia quae nullum nisi necessarium usum concedit ex creaturis*". (Institutio III, 10;3, quoted by Brunner, DI, 676.) As Robertson suggests, Weber's lack of historical sense may account for his tendency to describe the Protestant ethic as a static phenomenon. A good antidote to the Weber-Tawney view of Puritanism is found in documents cited in Scholes', The Puritans and Music.
131. "The Puritan wanted to work in a calling; we are forced to do so." (op.cit., 181).
132. DI, 207.



That the Puritans used the doctrine of the secular Calling to explain and maintain the status quo not occasionally, but frequently, cannot be doubted.<sup>133</sup> As Ruskin cried, "You knock a man into a ditch, and then you tell him to remain content in the position in which Providence has placed him."<sup>134</sup> Such misuse helps to explain why the doctrine finally fell into disrepute, so that by the early years of the present century it had reached complete bankruptcy. Robertson has shown us how the historical process worked; how God was forced to come to terms with mammon. "The spirit of capitalism was responsible for a gradual modification and attrition of the Puritan doctrine (of the 'calling')."<sup>135</sup> Calvinism lost the power and then the will to bind business within the discipline of Christian justice and Christian charity, "due to the unwillingness of a rising bourgeoisie to be bound by what it considered to be antiquated rules."<sup>136</sup> Calhoun describes the bitter result:

We still speak of our daily pursuits as vocations and callings, bearing unconscious witness to the permeation of ordinary speech by a once novel and daring theological usage. But the words have gone stale. The magic is drained out of them. Three hundred years of modern commercial and industrial life have left them drab and secularized, as common as the ad-writing and face-lifting to which we now so glibly apply them.<sup>137</sup>

The writings of such contemporary Americans as H. L. Mencken, Lincoln Steffens and Sinclair Lewis (whose hero, Elmer Gantry,

133. Often unwittingly, as Cecil Alexander's nineteenth century hymn "Septuagesima" betrays, in lines no longer sung in church: "The rich man in his castle, the poor man at his gate, God made them, high or lowly, and ordered their estate."
134. Fors Clavigera. 1, 48.
135. Op.cit., 27.
136. Ib., 210-1.
137. God and the Common Life, 24-5.



received his "call" to the ministry when intoxicated) have shown us, in Calhoun's phrase, "how naive, inept, and morally ambiguous the old Protestant teaching on earthly vocation can seem now to one not biased in its favor."<sup>138</sup>

The collapse was directly connected with the rise of a technical civilization and a mechanized order of industry. The Calling lost its vertical bearings in the incessant whirr of machinery and the grime of the mill town.<sup>139</sup> In particular the principle of stewardship was weakened. Production became the god of the economic order so that even the hymns picked up the theme, "Work for the night is coming." The machines demanded more and more human energy, even while they cast millions adrift; so that in the vigorous writings of men like Thomas Carlyle (who was no capitalist but who could not help reflecting the spirit of the times), work was made into something like religion.<sup>140</sup> As the modern world awoke to its material strength and shook off the disciplines of the Puritan way of life, it found that the doctrine of the secular Calling had become unnecessary.<sup>141</sup> When Weber first developed his thesis in 1904, the doctrine had

---

<sup>138</sup>. Ib.

<sup>139</sup>. Weber's diagnosis: "Where the fulfilment of the calling cannot be related to the highest spiritual and cultural values, or when on the other hand it need not be felt simply as economic compulsion, the individual generally abandons the attempt to justify it at all." (op.cit., 182.)

<sup>140</sup>. Cf. Past and Present, III, XI.

<sup>141</sup>. Weber's explanation reveals his cynical bias which accounts for most of his inaccurate generalizations: "Capitalism at the time of its development needed laborers who were available for economic exploitation for conscience' sake. Today it is in the saddle, and hence able to force people to labour without transcendental sanctions." (ib., 282.)

started on the road to oblivion.<sup>142</sup> The word Calling was falling into disuse, and Vocation had dropped its ethical significance.<sup>143</sup>

The disintegration of the Puritan doctrine would have been more important to our study had it been really as influential, in our opinion, as Weber suggests. The fact is that the process just described was in a sense a recapitulation. It actually repeated something which took place immediately after Luther set forth his new doctrine of Beruf, before Puritanism had even come into existence. To that period we again turn briefly.

### C. Vocation Becomes a Secular Expression.

When Tyndale translated the New Testament into English in 1526 following his visit to Wittenberg, he failed to convey into his own tongue the significance of Luther's doctrine of secular Calling. In the key passage, I Corinthians 7:20, he rendered klesis by "state", and the same phrasing appeared in his 1534 revision. In the following year, however, Myles Coverdale published<sup>144</sup> the first complete English edition of the Bible since Wycliffe. Coverdale's New Testament was largely a

---

142. How difficult it is to make the Puritan doctrine meaningful today is well illustrated in J.A. Robertson's book, Divine Vocation in Human Life, 81-97.

143. Talcott Parsons, Weber's translator, makes the following illuminating comment (op.cit., 194): "The two terms profession and calling I have used in translation of the German Beruf, whichever seemed best to fit the particular context. Vocation does not carry the ethical connotation in which Weber is interested." Webster's New International Dictionary reports Calling in the sense of "station or position in life" as already obsolete. In this connection it should be added that Holl's claim made in 1924 that the word Beruf still retains some religious connotation in popular usage, is of doubtful accuracy today.

144. Probably in Zürich. Coverdale did his translating on the continent, and collaborated with Tyndale on the Pentateuch at Hamburg in 1529. (Memorials of Myles Coverdale, 1838, 23).

reprint of Tyndale's 1534 revision, but in I Corinthians 7:20 there appeared a significant change, and the verse now read "Let euery one abyde in the callynge wherin he is called."<sup>145</sup> The word Calling, thus formally introduced into sixteenth century English as a description of worldly activity, was accepted into the Great Bible revisions of 1539-41<sup>146</sup> and later into the Authorized Version of 1611.

No reason is known for Coverdale's change, but it is certain that the word Calling was quickly accepted (if he did indeed introduce it) and put into use as a purely secular term. The word Vocation likewise came into common secular usage, probably because vocatio was the Latin equivalent of Beruf in the writings of Luther, and was also used by Calvin in expounding his doctrine of worldly Calling. The Bishops' Bibles of the Elizabethan era translated I Corinthians 7:20, "Let every man abide in his vocation," following the Vulgate.

Murray and Robertson have accumulated evidence to show that almost at the time of Luther's death, English writers both lay and clerical were employing the words Calling and Vocation in

145. Wycliffe used the Anglo-Saxon cleping.

146. Incorrectly described as the Cranmer Bible. H. R. Willoughby, The First Authorized English Bible and the Cranmer Preface, (Chicago, 1942), attributes the Great Bible translation to Coverdale. See also Daiches, The King James Version of the English Bible, Chicago, 1941, 15.

a strictly secular context.<sup>147</sup> In a noble passage of a sermon preached before Edward VI, the Reformer Hugh Latimer unconsciously showed how far this tendency had gone:

Oure Sauour Christ before he began hys preachynge, lyued of hys occupacion, he was a carpenter, and gat hys liuyng wyth greate laboure. Therefore let no man disdayne or thincke skorne to followe hym in a meane liuyng, a meane vocation, or a common callynge and occupacion. For as he blessed oure nature with takynge vpon hym the shape of man, so in hys doynge he blessed al occupacions and artes.<sup>148</sup>

One writer speaks of "cruel callinges" as early as 1551, and two years later another describes the "soldiour's vocation" in derogatory terms. The author of the Marprelate epistles refers to "unlawful callings", and later (1596) Shakespeare's Sir John Falstaff makes his famous quip about his purse-stealing "vocation".<sup>149</sup>

In all this development there is little suggestion of the motivating idea which lay behind Luther's teaching on the subject. Thankfulness to God, service to God in one's daily work, steward-

147. See Murray's Oxford Dictionary, in loc., H.M. Robertson, The Rise of Economic Individualism, 7-13. Robertson has discovered in Crowley's Voyce of the Last Trumpet...Callyng al estats of men to the ryght path of theyr vocation, and in Thomas Lever's Sermons, both published in 1550, some references to the Vocation of the yeoman (farmer), merchant, magistrate, and craftsman. Robertson's work, designed to disprove Weber's thesis, emphasizes the strong traditionalist tendency in both writers, following Luther and Calvin. But Robertson does not make clear--so anxious is he to refute Weber--that a rapid secularization did in fact take place immediately upon the word Calling being introduced into English by Coverdale, which was quite different from Luther's concept of Beruf, as set forth in 1522.

148. Latimer, Seven Sermons, quoted in Robertson, op.cit., 10.

149. The Puritan phrasing of the quip is significant: "Hal, 'tis no sin for a man to labour in his Vocation!" (I Henry IV, Act I, Scene II.)



ship, the hallowing of all worldly activity performed as obedience to God's will, loving concern for one's neighbor; all of these were to a great extent ignored, particularly by the lay writers. Calvin's insistence that "the call of the Lord is the foundation and beginning of right action" found scant place in the common usage. Even among the devout, except in men of Latimer's stripe, the emphasis was primarily upon obedience for its own sake, or as Marx would say, for the sake of the economic system! Thus Robert Crowley wrote:

Fyrste walke in thy vocation  
And do not seke thy lotte to chaunge;

but the reason he gives is hardly pious:

For through wycked ambition,  
Many mens fortune hath ben straynge.<sup>150</sup>

Sidney and Beatrice Webb appear to be justified in their claim that since the sixteenth century the word Vocation "has increasingly been used indiscriminately for any specialized occupation."<sup>151</sup> This usage has been a clear distortion of the teaching of the Reformers, for whom a "cruel calling" or an "unlawful calling" would have been a contradiction in terms. The surprising fact is that the changed meaning became evident as early as four hundred years ago, when the word Vocation was being used as a synonym for "employment" or "occupation", precisely in the sense in which Dr. Frank Parsons used it when in 1908 he wrote his pioneering work, "Choosing a Vocation".

Today the Puritan doctrine of the Calling is in process of becoming an historical phenomenon, thereby reinforcing the

---

150. Crowley, Voyce of the Last Trumpet, quoted in H. M. Robertson, op.cit., 7.

151. Soviet Communism: A New Civilisation, 1935 ed., 339 n.

secularization which took place in the sixteenth century.<sup>152</sup> In educational and scientific circles the word Calling is becoming archaic, while Vocation, if used at all as a noun, has come to suggest a specialized and even bourgeois profession. Edwards says in a curious passage written in 1940 that "vocations may be accepted as a distinct class of employment including the professions", this class being "usually...considered...socially superior to a trade or handicraft".<sup>153</sup> Most modern writers on secular work and employment prefer not to use the word Vocation. Instead they speak of trades, professions and occupations.

The adjective "vocational", by contrast, has come into active use and shows no signs of waning in popularity. Its meaning is usually completely secular, for it has been adapted to technical and scientific usage. "Vocational training" today means training in industrial trades--by no means necessarily bourgeois!--and "vocational guidance" is, as we shall see, a new branch of educational science.

- 
152. Many Puritan writers followed Latimer's custom of using the words Calling and Vocation simply as synonyms for "occupation"; thus T. Brown, author of Saints in Uproar (1687), wrote, "I was a ferry-man by my calling." Others preferred "avocation" to Vocation in describing daily work; thus Fuller (1642): "Heaven is his vocation, and therefore he counts earthly employments avocations." For these and other examples see Oxford Dictionary, in loc.
153. Edwards, Vocational and Occupational Guidance, 10, 110. The same class distinction appears in Symons' observation: "We talk readily enough about the vocation of the teacher or nurse. Architecture or public administration may be called 'vocations' after a moment's hesitation. But the word is rarely applied to brickmaking, steel bar rolling, bus conducting or stevedoring--yet these are just as essential jobs." (Work and Vocation, 28.)

## Summary.

The Bible may be considered in a sense the "Book of the Calls of God to men." Each of these Calls was given in a context which was both social and personal, whether under the Hebrew or the Christian covenant. The Call was more than an invitation into the family of God, it was a summons to a definite duty; and the duty frequently took the form of life work. The apostle Paul's theological treatment of the Calling expanded and deepened the concept but did not change its meaning materially, except in the single phrase, "Let every man abide in the calling wherein he is called." In the dark ages this verse helped the ascetic priesthood to appropriate the term vocatio for purposes exclusively ecclesiastical, and it remained in such usage throughout the whole medieval period.

Luther however saw that the verse in question, and indeed the whole of I Corinthians 7, was really a description of the way in which the Christian could fulfil God's Call in the world. He therefore began to apply the term Beruf to worldly activities. Calvin systematized Luther's thinking and applied the concept more specifically to ordinary human work; he also altered the concept from service to God in vocatione to service per vocationem. As the western world progressed into an industrial and capitalist economy, however, the Puritan view of the Calling, inherited from Calvin, lost the sense of the sacred in the secular. The ascetic disciplines helped to build a Protestant financial and mechanical empire, but to many believers' sons mammon assumed more significance than God. The Calling therefore became a term irrelevant to and even despised

by victims of the new industrial order.

The development was really a recapitulation of a process which took place in Great Britain in the sixteenth century, for even before the emergence of Puritanism in Elizabethan times, the words Calling and Vocation were being employed as purely secular terms. And it was in the secular sense that the term Vocation was incorporated into such modern educational movements as Vocational Selection and Vocational Guidance.



## CHAPTER TWO

# THE CONCEPT OF VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE

### Outline.

- I. Definition of the Concept.
  - II. Early Beginnings.
  - III. Modern Establishment.
  - IV. Vocational Guidance Today in Great Britain  
and America.
  - V. A Christian Critique of the Concept.
- Summary.



Having gifts that differ according to the grace given to us, let us use them.

-- St. Paul

Momentous, cardinal decision--the choice of one's work in the world; of one's career... First requirement--an honest and determined effort to discover and understand oneself.

-- J.C.W. Reith

History regards as great men those who ennoble themselves by working for the common good. Experience distinguishes as the happiest him who makes most men happy. Religion itself teaches that the Ideal, after which all strive, sacrificed itself for humanity, and who would dare to deny such maxims? When we have chosen the position in life in which we can best work for humanity, then burdens cannot crush us, for they are sacrifices for all. Then it is no...egotistical joy which we experience; our happiness belongs to millions, (and) our deeds live on, silently but effectively...

-- Karl Marx, aged seventeen  
"Meditation of a Young Man  
on the Choice of a Profession"

The field of vocational guidance has become in less than half a century so vast, and its literature so complete, that any attempt to deal with it extensively here would be unnecessary. The present study will be restricted to those aspects of the subject which are directly relevant to the thesis: an understanding of what is meant by vocational guidance, where its sources lie, how it became established as a modern science, and the general direction of its growth. Only after that can a critical evaluation from the Christian point of view be attempted.

### I. Definition.

There seem to be dozens of definitions of vocational guidance, ranging all the way from "organized common sense" to "seeing through Johnny and seeing Johnny through". In the early days of the movement it was common to refer to the "giving of information, experience and advice" as being the essence of vocational advice, and the concept was thus attractively phrased:

Vocational guidance of the adolescent is equivalent to placing in his hands a chart by which to steer his ship on the sea of life. The country toward which he steers depends upon his strength, his ability, his courage, his mental and physical resources, his knowledge and experience. It is the privilege of the more experienced navigator to indicate the far-distant port and to set the most suitable course. The value of his advice will depend upon the extent to which he himself has charted the crowded seas, has studied the wrecks and derelicts dotting every route, and has seen how little or how much is accomplished by those who are ill-equipped for their journey.<sup>1</sup>

While in many parts of the world vocational guidance is still thought of in terms of advice, the past twenty years have

---

1. Earle, F.M., Methods of Choosing a Career, 293.

witnessed a reaction to this approach, particularly in the United States. Thus in 1937 the National Vocational Guidance Association revised its "credo" to read:

Vocational guidance is the process of assisting the individual to choose an occupation, prepare for it, enter upon and progress in it. It is concerned primarily with helping individuals make decisions and choices involved in planning a future and building a career--decisions and choices necessary in effecting satisfactory vocational adjustment.

G. E. Myers, writing in 1941, said of the new definition, "It is well to note that vocational counseling is not giving vocational advice. Someone facetiously has said that the worst vice is advice."<sup>2</sup> Some sympathy with this point of view is found among British vocational authorities today. In many parts of the world, however, vocational guidance is still thought of primarily in terms of study and advice. Its basic principles were set down over forty years ago by Frank Parsons in the first vocational guidance textbook ever published:<sup>3</sup>

In the wise choice of a vocation there are three broad factors: (1) a clear understanding of yourself, your aptitudes, abilities, interests, ambitions, resources, limitations, and their causes; (2) a knowledge of the requirements and conditions of success, advantages and disadvantages, compensation, opportunities, and prospects in different lines of work; (3) true reasoning on the relations of these two groups of facts.

Parsons, it will be noted, did not mention "advice" as a part of the true reasoning, although in his case studies it is apparent that he dispensed advice rather freely, and probably even used the words, "If I were you, son.." But he did a last-

---

2. Myers, G.E., Principles and Techniques of Vocational Guidance, 3.  
 3. Parsons, Choosing A Vocation, 5.



ing service by establishing the variables with which vocational guidance has been concerned ever since, particularly in western countries: first, the differences in individuals, and second, the differences in occupations.

At the present time in the United States there are two extreme schools of thought on the subject of vocational guidance. At the University of Minnesota the view has developed that the counselor should lead and direct by the giving of advice, while the University of Chicago has become the seat of "nondirective counseling", which insists that the student steer his own ship in choosing a life work. Most American and British counselors find themselves somewhere between the two schools. Super of Columbia University suggests that vocational guidance is "a dual process of helping the individual to understand and accept himself, and of helping him to understand and adjust to society".<sup>4</sup> He believes that "the techniques of vocational counseling vary from case to case and from counselor to counselor", but that they frequently fall into two natural categories: "those of diagnosis and those of treatment or counseling in the more limited sense". What Parsons first described as "understanding" and "knowledge", therefore, Super would now call "diagnosis"; and what Parsons called "true reasoning" Super would consider "treatment or counseling", thereby changing the technique radically.

Such advice as might be essential, Super would include in the counseling process. He thinks that the purely directional approach is fallacious, since it assumes that the counselee can gain insight "by the same rational processes used by the counselor

---

4. Super, D.E., Appraising Vocational Fitness, 2 ff.

in making a diagnosis". He agrees with Rogers that the counselee's insight-gaining processes are "effective and not cognitive,...emotional rather than rational". On the other hand he believes that Rogers' tendency to minimize the value of diagnosis through the use of tests and other techniques, is one-sided and reflects his preoccupation with neurotic patients rather than with normal persons seeking vocational guidance.

All of the foregoing definitions of vocational guidance, advisory and non-advisory, fall regardless of divergences into one philosophical category. They are interested in enabling the individual to attain, as Keller expresses it, "not only the good life, but the happy life".<sup>5</sup> The interest in the welfare of individual persons is typically western and even more typically academic. In Great Britain the individualistic view persists despite the challenge of socialism, although it has been questioned by some who approach vocational guidance from the standpoint of industry and its needs. Edwards indicates the way an industrialist, concerned with such manpower problems as the British economy faces, would state his case:

The problem of vocational guidance is peculiar to the industrial communities of the world. The other communities have no such problem. . . . The aim of vocational guidance is to secure the fitting of each...according to the capacity which would produce... a more contented and stable industrial system. . . . Perfect freedom in the choice of a career<sup>6</sup> is considered impracticable and also undesirable.

The difference between Edwards and the average American vocational counselor is that Edwards approaches the guidance problem through a concern for vocational selection. The latter

---

5. Keller and Viteles, Vocational Guidance Throughout the World, 17.

6. Edwards, Vocational and Occupational Guidance, 101.

term requires some elucidation. Vocational selection is the scientific choosing and placing of workers to secure maximum efficiency in the use of manpower. Collins and Drever speak of vocational psychology in general as "an attempt to take into account individual differences on the one hand, and vocational requirements on the other". They would classify vocational guidance as that branch of vocational psychology which deals with the individual, and vocational selection as that branch which deals with the socio-economic community.<sup>7</sup> Some psychologists, however, refuse to make such a hard and fast distinction. Viteles says, "Guidance is mainly concerned with the success and welfare of the individual, but...it thereby serves the best interests of the community. It is at once personal and social in scope. In practice...the two problems frequently overlap."<sup>8</sup>

Many theoretical statements could be adduced to show that vocational guidance as developed in the western countries is interested not just in the individual but in the "general welfare". Myers, De Man and others are quite explicit on the point.<sup>9</sup> Super has more recently declared that vocational counseling "has two fundamental purposes: to help people make good vocational adjustments and to facilitate the smooth functioning of the social economy through the effective use of manpower."<sup>10</sup> But in reality and in practice all of these authorities treat vocational guidance simply as a way of dealing with the problems of the individual; and in so doing they follow the historic pattern of the

---

7. Collins and Drever, Psychology and Practical Life, 172 ff.

8. Keller and Viteles, op.cit., 296.

9. Myers, op.cit., 73; De Man, Joy in Work, 221.

10. Super, op.cit., 1.

movement as it has developed in Great Britain and America.

On the European continent the individualism is not nearly so marked. Vocational guidance "has developed out of placement, usually in government employment bureaus, within a ministry of labor".<sup>11</sup> It became a means of expediting the supply of manpower to the dictator governments of Mussolini and Hitler, which means that the concerns of the worker as an individual got scant attention. We are told that a similar situation obtains today in the Soviet Union: "The immediate needs and success of industry are placed above the interests and welfare of the individual", and "adjustment is based on the immediate needs of the proletarian dictatorship".<sup>12</sup>

Some of the basic elements involved in vocational guidance have now been indicated, and it is necessary to proceed to an examination of the sources of the movement.

## II. Early Beginnings.

Because the Christian faith is considered to have made a general impact upon western culture, it may be said that there are elements in the science of vocational guidance that have some roots in the Christian tradition. We know that Paul was not unaware of the nature and importance of individual differences. Yet on the whole one can scarcely say that vocational guidance is of Christian origin; quite the contrary. That Vocation means "the action of God in calling a person" has scarcely occurred to, let alone interested, the educa-

---

11. Keller and Viteles, op.cit., 21.

12. Ib., 243.



tors and scientists who have built the vocational guidance movement. We are dealing here with a modern, technical, scientific enterprise boasting its own history and its own saints and philosophers, and it would be captious to claim for it a Christian origin. A far better case could be made for a pagan origin.

One of the American pioneers of the movement, John Brewer, has written: "It is as difficult to trace the beginnings of vocational guidance as to trace the discovery of the use of steam...Many persons have appreciated the need of vocational guidance through reading Plato's Republic." <sup>13</sup>

Indeed, as one traces the development of Socrates' argument in the Republic he is impressed by the way in which the whole social structure of the book is founded on the principle of individual native gifts and capacities, the ruling philosopher-kings being those who are deliberately chosen as being most fittingly endowed to direct the state. As he sets about to build his proposed state, Socrates makes such statements as the following: <sup>14</sup>

I am myself reminded that we are not all alike; there are diversities of natures among us which are adapted to different occupations.

And again,

All things are produced more plentifully and easily and of a better quality when one man does one thing which is natural to him and does it at the right time, and leaves other things.

When he comes to consider the education of the "guardians" and their selection, Socrates says, in recapitulation of his argument:

---

<sup>13</sup>. Ib. 30.

<sup>14</sup>. Republic, Book II, Jowett translation, Oxford, 1888.

The shoemaker was not allowed by us to be a husbandman, or a weaver, or a builder--in order that we might have our shoes well made; but to him and to every other worker was assigned one work for which he was by nature fitted.

The higher the duties of the guardian...the more time, and skill, and art, and application will be needed by him...will he not also require natural aptitude for his calling?<sup>15</sup>  
Certainly.

Plato's contention that "diversities of natures" should be adapted to "different occupations" is the philosophical core of the modern vocational guidance movement. Plato was convinced that such guidance and selection were necessary for the welfare both of the individual and the state. Personal and social concerns were blended in the Republic, although certain limitations were placed on individual freedom. A man was not free, for example, to choose a type of work for which he was not naturally fitted. Generally speaking, Plato was more interested in selection than he was in guidance.

When one considers the dearth of interest in guidance of any kind that marked the succeeding centuries, Plato's writings assume almost a "scriptural" significance. Historians have found through the years only an occasional reference to the subject, usually in the form of a complaint concerning the misfit. One such lament is in Ecclesiastes:<sup>16</sup>

My heart rejoiced in all my labour: and this was my portion of all my labour. Then I looked on all the works that my hands had wrought...and behold, all was vanity and vexation...Yea, I hated all my labour which I had taken under the sun: because I should leave it unto the man...after me. And who knoweth whether he shall be a wise man or a fool?

---

15. "Calling" (Jowett tr.) appears in Plato's Greek not as klesis but as demiourgia (δημιουργία, handicraft) or as epitedeuma (ἐπιτήδευμα, pursuit, business).

16. Ecclesiastes 2:10-11, 18-19.

Another occurs in Sir Thomas Elyot's The Governour, published in 1564:<sup>17</sup>

How many men there be that having their sons in childhood aptly disposed by nature to paint, carve or engrave, to embroider or to do other things but as soon as they espy it, they be therewith displeased and forthwith bind them apprentice to tailors, weavers... cobblers, which have been the inestimable loss of many good wits.

Not until 1747, it appears, do we find a serious attempt being made in the direction of vocational guidance. Bloomfield places in the front of his book, Readings in Vocational Guidance, a three-page facsimile of a volume issued in that year in London, containing the title page and preface.<sup>18</sup> The title begins, "A General Description of all Trades Digested in Alphabetical Order: by which Parents, Guardians, and Trustees may, with greater Ease and Certainty, make choice of Trades agreeable to the Capacity, Education, Inclination, Strength, and Fortune of the Youth under their Care." And the preface asks,

Pray now, what Step in Life is of greater Consequence, than the well placing-out your Offspring in Business? Does not their future Well-being very much depend upon this? How many hopeful Youths have been ruined, by being put to Trades, or Callings, either improper for them, or they unfit for? But now, 'tis presumed, the splitting on that Rock may, in a great Measure be prevented.

The unknown author's hopes that his book would solve the misfit problem, to be sure, went unrealized; yet his work indicates there were men of that day as there have been in every age, who were thinking seriously about the guidance of youth. In a brief note in his Autobiography Benjamin Franklin tells of his father's

---

17. Edwards, op.cit., 17.

18. Bloomfield, op.cit., 112.

concern for his vocational future: "He therefore sometimes took me to walk with him and see joiners, bricklayers, turners, braziers, etc., at their work, that he might observe my inclination, and endeavor to fix it on some trade or other on land".<sup>19</sup> It was such guidance that led Franklin into the printing trade, and the methods employed by Franklin's father, significantly enough, are now part and parcel of the vocational guidance movement.

A less successful approach was tried in the early nineteenth century with the development of a new, popular "science" known as phrenology. F. J. Gall and J. T. Spurzheim claimed in Germany that careful examination of a person's skull would reveal some of his significant traits and aptitudes. Their disciples catered to the popular interest, and in addition to estimating individual characteristics they gave occupational advice. But phrenology's very popularity proved its undoing, and since many of its basic principles were questionable, the study fell into scientific neglect.

The middle decades of the century saw Thomas Carlyle emerging in Britain as a powerful and eloquent spokesman for efficiency in the use of manpower. Carlyle's opinions on the subject of human labor are today being quoted in numerous textbooks on vocational guidance, industrial psychology and "human engineering". Because of their Christian overtones, some of his expressions are worth including here:

---

19. Quoted in Bloomfield, The Vocational Guidance of Youth, Boston, Houghton Mifflin, 1911, 1.



Blessed is he who has found his work; let him ask no other blessedness.<sup>20</sup>

The latest Gospel in this world is, Know thy work and do it...know what thou canst work at; and work at it, like a Hercules!<sup>21</sup>

A man...is born to expand every particle of strength that God Almighty has given him, in doing the work he finds he is fit for.<sup>22</sup>

To each is given a certain inward talent, a certain outward environment of fortune; to each, by wisest combination of these two, a certain maximum of capability. But the hardest problem were ever this first: to find by study of yourself, and of the ground you stand on, what your combined inward and outward capability specially is.<sup>23</sup>

A man...shall be...encouraged...to do what work the Maker of him has intended by the making of him... according as the gifts have been bestowed on him for that. And his happiness, and that of others round him, (depends upon) his and their getting into such a relation that this can be permitted him...to do the Maker's will who had constructed him with such and such capabilities and prefigurements of capability.<sup>24</sup>

While Carlyle was restating Plato's opinions in vigorous nineteenth century English, modern scientific psychology was beginning to show signs of life. Fechner wrote the first treatise on the application of mathematical measurement to psychology. Building upon the sound experimental work of Weber, Wundt and others, scientists in the last decade of the century commenced to devise the first mental tests. The tests were produced in the laboratories of Cattell in America, Kräpelin and

---

20. Past and Present, Book III, ch. xi.

21. Ibid.

22. Quoted by A. Macrae in Industrial Psychology (C.S. Myers, ed.), 171.

23. Speech on being installed as rector of Edinburgh University, 1866.

24. Crit. and Misc. Essays, (Centenary ed.) IV, 357.

Münsterberg in Germany, and Binet and Toulouse in France. Within a very few years other pioneers were making outstanding contributions to the work, among them Spearman in London, Heymans and Krueger in Germany, Lahy in France, Decroly in Belgium, De Sanctis in Rome and Rossolimo in Moscow.

It appears to have been inevitable that sooner or later the results of this rapidly-expanding research would be applied in a practical way to the problems of the average man and woman in search of life work. That practical application was to prove the start of the modern vocational guidance movement.

### III. Modern Establishment.

"Vocational guidance in some form," writes Keller, "is an inevitable accompaniment of the educational process. Yet in the United States it seems to have become a 'movement' on a certain day in a certain year, like a battle or a political campaign. In English, German, and French educational literature one is reminded again and again that vocational guidance was born when, in 1908, Parsons organized the Vocation Bureau in the Civic Service House in Boston."<sup>25</sup>

The Bureau was founded in January of 1908 and historians report that according to the best evidence, the combination of words "vocational guidance" first appeared in print in a brief report published by Parsons a few months later. Parsons died that same year, but in 1909 his last book, the first of the vocational guidance textbooks, was published, entitled Choosing A Vocation.

---

25. Keller and Viteles, op. cit., 31.

Parsons made a permanent impression on the young movement. His "broad factors" are still considered relevant, and the healthy growth of the movement is due in no small part to the kind of leadership it received at the start. Parsons was apparently a Protestant Christian layman of rather liberal views. According to Brewer he is "justly called the founder of the vocational guidance movement" because he "discarded the pseudo-sciences, used the systematic study of occupations, and was sane and painstaking in the investigations of character and ability which he made."<sup>26</sup>

Parsons' successors in America quickly expanded the work. Men such as Bloomfield, Hanus and Brewer, and women such as Helen Woolley, provided the social vision and scientific integrity that ensured a sound future for vocational guidance. Programs, projects and laboratories sprang up independently in other sections of America, and in 1910 the first national conference on vocational guidance was held. New York City, Cincinnati, Grand Rapids, Des Moines and Chicago became centers of the work, which flourished particularly in the public school systems.

Meanwhile in Great Britain characteristically different beginnings were made. Bloomfield describes in his little book The Vocational Guidance of Youth, published in 1911, "one of the most thorough systems of school guidance" operating "in the Educational Information and Employment Bureaus of the Edinburgh School Board".<sup>27</sup> He also reports a speech made in Dundee in

---

<sup>26</sup>. Ib., 30.

<sup>27</sup>. Bloomfield, op. cit., 80 ff.

1909 by the Hon. Winston Churchill, calling attention to the need for guidance in the employment of youth.

While the Edinburgh bureau conferences (at which the churches were represented with other civic groups) began in 1908, provision of organized assistance for adolescents seeking employment did not begin on a national scale until 1910. The Labour Exchanges Act (1909) and the Education Act of 1910 enabled labour exchanges and local education authorities to furnish advice and information on the choosing of occupations.<sup>28</sup>

In general the American pattern of development differed from the European. The Vocation Bureau of Boston was moved in 1917 to the School of Education in Harvard University, and American institutions of higher learning have taken the keenest interest in vocational guidance ever since. In Britain on the other hand the center of interest in the movement since 1922 has been the National Institute of Industrial Psychology. For many years prior to that date vocational bureaus and clinics of one kind and another had existed in various cities in Europe; Berlin, Brussels, Barcelona, Paris etc. The pioneering efforts were often followed by a more systematic approach under institutional sponsorship. Keller and Viteles have shown in their world-wide survey that in some of the countries of Europe, the state entered the picture very shortly after the founding of the first experimental guidance bureau and some kind of legislation was passed. In Germany for example public vocational counseling bureaus were developed in 1911, and in 1919 a Prussian state edict laid the groundwork for the entire state organization of

---

28. Earle, op. cit., 24-5.



vocational counseling throughout Germany. Vocational guidance started in the Soviet Union in a small research laboratory under the direction of A. F. Clark at the Institute of Brain, Leningrad, in 1924. Three years later it was subsidized by the Commissariat of Labor, and in 1934 the All-Union Central Council of Trade Unions in Moscow assumed responsibility for the program on a nation-wide, compulsory scale.<sup>29</sup> In general the post-war labour shortages in European industry created a special need which expedited the growth of vocational agencies.<sup>30</sup>

In the majority of the countries studied by Keller and Viteles, it was found that the administration of the vocational guidance program has been left in the hands of local agencies such as communal institutes for vocational guidance, special bureaus attached to universities, and public, technical or vocational<sup>31</sup> schools.

#### IV. Vocational Guidance Today in Great Britain and America.

##### I. Great Britain.

The "Report of the Committee on the Juvenile Employment Service" in 1945, commonly known as the Ince Report, marked the starting point of a new phase in the development of planned vocational guidance in Great Britain. Three years later, in 1948, a bill embodying the recommendations of the Ince committee was brought before Parliament, and after a "free" debate and vote

---

29. Op. cit., 402.

30. Macrae, A., Talents and Temperament, London, Nisbet, 1932, 194.

31. Technical schools in Europe and America are often called "vocational", though the lines of work they train boys to follow are usually described otherwise than as "vocations". Symons comments, "An even wilder stretching of the word than usual." (Work and Vocation, 36.)

(not conducted on party lines) it became the Employment and Training Act.

The Act provides specifically that every British child of school-leaving age shall, when the law is fully in effect, receive vocational guidance from a representative of the Youth Employment Service. It seeks to reduce to some kind of uniformity the widely varying guidance programs operating in different parts of the United Kingdom, by establishing a minimum standard. It aims to end the long rivalry for supremacy that has existed in this field between the Ministry of Labour and the Ministry of Education, with the creation of a Central Juvenile Employment Executive composed of representatives of both groups. It gives local educational agencies in most cases opportunity to retain or to acquire the right to conduct the service.

Normal procedure in operating the new Youth Employment Service under the Act, as it has been planned by many of the local education authorities, includes the following general steps:

1. Heads of all schools will report to the Youth Employment Officer the names of children due to leave school at the end of the term and will enclose a report for each.

2. School talks will be given by the Officer or an assistant to encourage thinking among the pupils on the subject of future employment. Experts may also be asked to speak on specific careers to selected students.

3. The Officer will visit the school and interview separately each school leaver to "assess the qualities and abilities of the boy or girl and to give advice about suitable em-

ployment in general and on available opportunities in particular". The parent will always be invited to attend but may be interviewed with or without the child.

4. The Officer will try to "place" the school leaver suitably. There is no obligation on the child to accept the Officer's advice or the vacancy offered. Difficult cases call for re-interviewing.

5. The Officer will endeavor to keep in touch with all youngsters after they have started work, by "open evenings", correspondence or personal visits.

In thus describing within brief scope the aims of the Employment and Training Act, it has been necessary to leave out many factors, but one change made by Parliament in the Ince Report's recommendations is too important to omit. The committee had urged that the reported data passed on from the school to the Youth Employment Officer should include facts concerning the student's health, general ability, educational attainments, special aptitudes, interests, qualities of disposition, membership in voluntary organisations, special home circumstances if any, and special features of school attendance if any. In the House of Lords this list was reduced and limited to the first four items--health, general ability, educational attainments and special aptitudes. It is presumed that the Officer is therefore not intended to receive information from the school on the other points. The Ince Report had mentioned under "interests" the following: intellectual, practical, aesthetic, social and physical activities. Under "qualities of disposition" it mentioned "degree of self-reliance, friendliness, application,

conscientiousness, initiative, or reliability". According to the law of the land, vocational guidance is to be divorced from such considerations, at least insofar as school reports are involved. Parliament was obviously interested in protecting the child from the adverse effects of a possibly unfair school report, made to the person who would help him determine his future. But the amendment made it just that much harder to use the principles of vocational psychology in administering the Act.

Two years after the Act was passed, it can be reported that the law is going into effect in many parts of the country. In some special situations, notably in Warrington, the local educational authority has adopted a Youth Employment Service scheme which aims to take full advantage of the enabling powers of the Act. Detailed job descriptions are being prepared, tests of intelligence, attainment and special aptitudes are being administered to all school leavers, and the interview is being conducted with more than scant attention to vocational principles. A follow-up survey will be used to evaluate results. The assistance of the National Institute of Industrial Psychology has been secured in the Warrington experiment. In other areas, such as Edinburgh and Fife, the new Service is being built on long-established vocational guidance programs.

It should be pointed out however that at the present time, even in urban areas of Britain, large numbers of children are not receiving vocational guidance. In the rural areas the Service, where it is functioning at all, operates usually on an "austerity" basis, with the Officer getting the minimum information, giving the minimum time to interviewing and placement,



and possessing little in the way of satisfactory job descriptions. The same holds true in many city educational systems. It is a gigantic task that has been undertaken, and much hard work and careful planning have gone into it. It has been introduced into the schools and labour exchanges, and has been made a part of the law of the land. In years to come it may be possible to say that there is a national system of vocational guidance at work in Great Britain. That time, despite the interesting beginning, has not yet arrived.

Some mention should be made of the scientific progress made in Great Britain in the field of vocational guidance. Experts trained by the National Institute of Industrial Psychology have made far-reaching contributions to the industrial life of the nation through the development of methods of vocational selection. Such activities received new impetus in World War II, due to the important role played by psychologists in the British Armed Forces. What the continentals call "psychotechnics" and the Americans "psychometrics" has always received careful attention in Britain since the days of Spearman, although the "reticent Englishman", and still more the Scot, is inclined to view with suspicion any technique which threatens to replace common sense. The result is that British tests and measurements, while of a high order, have never occupied pre-eminent place in British vocational guidance, although they have been in continual and growing use.

## 2. America.

To appraise the vocational guidance situation in America today is far more difficult than in the case of Britain. The

lack of homogeneity noted in Britain's vocational history is multiplied a hundredfold in America. And yet vocational guidance has achieved a distinct maturity in that country, after the American fashion. It has been accepted into hundreds of school systems and has been the subject of state (but not national) legislation. It has awakened much interest in American industry. It has "sold itself" to the youth of the land and in general has become a part of the national life, although it has still to reach many areas.

Parsons did not open his Vocation Bureau in a public school, but the young science quickly came under the supervision of educational authorities and has remained there ever since. While continental vocational guidance grew out of juvenile labor placement exchanges, the American movement developed in the schools. The amount of research that has been conducted, the number of controlled experiments that have been carried out, the monographs and books written on the subject, are impossible to estimate. Today the work goes on unceasingly, new experts are being trained, new bureaus opened, new university departments added, new theories developed and applied. And it has all happened in four decades.

To the outsider it would seem, after not too exacting a study, that there are three areas in which American vocational guidance has developed in a distinctive manner, and this effort to survey the scene as it is today will concentrate on the three areas: (1) the emergence of a general concept of guidance, (2) the development of psychological tests, and (3) the accentuation of the human factor in industrial relations.

(1) It is actually becoming unfashionable in America today to speak of vocational guidance in educational circles. Teachers in training, reflecting the lectures they hear and the textbooks they read, speak of "guidance". For guidance is considered a new science, having some affinities with the field of education but not identical with it. A guidance counselor usually draws a higher salary than a teacher. He receives special training in post-graduate studies. Unlike the careers master in the English schools, he is considered to be an expert in many forms of guidance. Just how many forms there are is not clear; one writer has facetiously suggested that there are "fifty-seven varieties". But the following forms have been seriously suggested by American educationalists:

Vocational guidance, educational guidance, recreational guidance, health guidance, leisure-time guidance, social guidance, civic guidance, moral guidance, religious guidance, economic guidance, mental guidance, emotional guidance, personal guidance, community service guidance, home guidance, cooperative guidance, cultural guidance, personality guidance.<sup>32</sup>

Perhaps it is to be expected that at this early stage there should be some confusion of terms; but the picture of some future institution in which all of these services are meted out to the adolescent is an appalling one. It would be better if the term guidance had never been invented! Meanwhile whether the guidance counselor is here to stay is not clear, but it is important to note that in the new approach to guidance the term still means what it does when coupled with the adjective "vocational": the process of aiding the individual to choose, pre-

---

32. Myers, op.cit., 14-15.

pare for, enter upon, and progress in activities that are suited to his personal aptitudes, interests and other characteristics.<sup>33</sup> Much of the discussion of the various types of guidance so far has been heavily academic, although this condition may improve with the development of case studies.

(2) One would expect perhaps that psychological tests for measuring vocational fitness would find their best growing soil in America. The seemingly unlimited funds and facilities, the battalions of skilled personnel, the robust faith in new scientific methods, the naive interest in mechanical gadgets, all combined to produce a generation that is acutely test-conscious. It is estimated that in one peace-time year twenty million persons took psychological tests of some kind in the United States.<sup>34</sup> A Seattle schoolgirl wrote after enrolling in a midwestern girls' college, "This is the fourth time I have taken the Kuder Preference Record!"

Practically all leading psychologists have made statements warning against too literal an acceptance of the results of tests in vocational guidance. Yet psychometrists continue to devise new types of measurement, and keep their graduate students busy making correlations; and the public continues to show an increasing appetite for tests of all kinds. The University of Chicago's nondirective counselors have taken a rather offhand view of psychometrics and all other forms of diagnosis, but few of their American colleagues have shared their views fully.<sup>35</sup>

There is no doubt that some of the tests now being used in

---

33. Ib. 27.

34. Super, op. cit., xiii.

35. Ibid., 2 ff.



vocational guidance have enormous practical value. They enable the student to think systematically about his life work, by arranging his thoughts for him. They give him clues to his native endowment of intelligence. They bring to light important factors of his personality which he was aware of, but did not think important. They show him "what God made him able to do"--within certain limits. They arrange his aptitudes and interests in a way which he can easily classify. They provide an attractive way of making him think seriously about his future. And they are of vast assistance to the vocational counselor seeking to make a diagnosis.

Yet it remains to be seen how permanent will be the contribution of psychometrics (or psychotechnics) to vocational guidance. Already in America there is developing among young people a condition of "immunity". Indiscriminate exposure to too many testing sessions has created in some of the youngsters a sophistication and an indifference which, if allowed to grow, will greatly reduce the value of tests as a vocational guidance tool. The success of a test depends on more than effective administration. Sincerity and cooperativeness on the part of the testee are absolutely essential, and if they are destroyed or even threatened, the worth of the whole procedure is in jeopardy.

The growing tendency to "falsify" obvious questionnaires--of which there seems to be an endless stream--has led some American educators to resort to projection tests which probe below the surface of consciousness. Such tests were originally devised for clinical use and not for vocational guidance. It would seem that these tests are likewise not free from the pos-

sibility of being "slanted" by sophisticated testees, and in general one could conclude that the testing method is no real short cut for counselors who would have their answers without digging for them.

(3.) A third area exists in which significant American work has been done, relating not so much to what we have called the "vocational guidance movement" as to the subject of Vocation itself. It is the area of personal relationships in industry.

A new, so-called "human" approach to the problems of workers in industry has been gathering momentum for some time in the western world.<sup>36</sup> The movement received a notable forward impulse in the experiments conducted at the Hawthorne plant of the Western Electric Company in Chicago. The so-called "Hawthorne experiments" began in 1923 and continued for several years with company officials collaborating with the Harvard Graduate School of Research.<sup>37</sup> At first the experiments were concerned with units of output among workers under different kinds of illumination. After some time it was discovered that physical factors--illumination, hours, rest periods, free lunches, etc.--did not affect output nearly as much as did more intangible "human" or socio-psychological factors, such as sense of personal worth, closeness of supervision, attitudes toward the social group in the individual worked, etc. One of the experimenters summed it up by saying, "Whether or not a person is going to give his services whole-heartedly to a group depends, in good part, on...the meaning for him of what is happening around him."<sup>38</sup> It is not what

---

36. See pp. 111 ff.

37. Mayo, E., The Human Problems of an Industrial Civilization, 1933; The Social Problems of an Industrial Civilization, 1945.

38. Roethlisberger, F.J., Management and Morale, 15.

is happening that matters so much as how he feels about it and what it means to him.

All this may seem to have little to do with the guidance, selection and placement of adolescents, and to belong strictly in the realm of industrial psychology. Yet the work done at the Hawthorne plant carries considerable significance for anyone seeking to study the relation of man to his work. The old, logical, straight-forward questions of the standard vocational interview, such as "Working conditions?" "Prospects?" "Accessibility?" need to be expanded by discussion of other factors which might seem "irrelevant" to the "economic man", but which to human beings are very important and very real. Roethlisberger indicates the nature of some of these factors: "We all want tangible evidence of our social importance...Money is only a small part of this social recognition. The way we are greeted by our boss, being asked to help a newcomer, being asked to keep an eye on a difficult operation, being given a job requiring special skill--all of these are acts of social recognition."<sup>39</sup>

It is significant that the experimenters conducted interviews on nondirective lines which gave employees a chance to express themselves freely, easing many long-standing vocational problems, some of which were quite irrational--"the foreman looks like my step-father".<sup>40</sup>

American industry has not yet digested the lessons of the Hawthorne researches, nor has it accepted the principle of planned vocational selection on anything like a universal scale.

---

39. Op.cit., 24-5.

40. Mayo, Social Problems, op.cit., 78.

What happened at Chicago is, nevertheless, a portent of future developments which have much significance not only for specialists such as vocational counselors, but for the whole problem of labor unrest.

#### V. A Christian Critique of Modern Vocational Guidance.

The concept of vocational guidance as presented here is far from complete. It has been described only in general terms, and only those aspects have been considered which are relevant to our subject. Such limitations and restrictions must be borne in mind in the attempt at a Christian critique which follows. It should also be remembered that there are some aspects of vocational guidance in which, by the nature of things, no Christian critique is possible. To attempt to analyze the mathematical basis of a test for aptitudes from the "Christian" point of view would be to mix fields rather absurdly.

Out of the vocational guidance movement as a whole, however, it would seem that certain facts emerge which call for legitimate Christian comment. Most Christians and indeed, most sensitive persons of whatever persuasion would agree that there is a high level of constructive idealism motivating the movement. Few churchmen would deny that such idealism is in keeping with the Christian concept of the good life, or that the practical aims of vocational counseling are on the whole in harmony with the ethical teachings of the Church. Theologians would be dissatisfied, perhaps, with the doctrine of man implicit in some of the vocational guidance literature, and other serious faults could be found which call for present consideration. But



theologians would also, perhaps, be the first to suggest that the movement operates not only from a scientific but from a moral principle; and none would be likely to deny its usefulness.

It may fairly be said then, that any Christian critique must begin by acknowledging that vocational guidance is a growing, rapidly-spreading movement dedicated to human welfare and happiness; that it carries no prejudices and plays no favorites. In the words of the Authorized Version, it is no "respector of persons". It steps into the serious gap in the life of a young person when he stops playing and starts working. It offers counsel on the basis of those capacities with which the individual is endowed. It works directly at the problem of the misfit, which Ramsay MacDonald once termed "the greatest tragedy of our modern life". It seeks to lift at least a part of the misery left by the industrial revolution. It has called into its service some extremely able educators and scientists, who have given their time because they believed that they were helping to build a greater generation--greater because better adjusted to life. The definitions of vocational guidance already noted are proof that behind the occupational surveys, the statistical correlations, the ever-increasing number of tests, and the experiments in counseling techniques, there operates sound motivation based on a genuine ideal.

The work of maintaining and implementing the ideal has been carried out with considerable care in the western countries. In Great Britain and America the local public school agencies have taken a leading role in the nurture of vocational guidance, and have kept the movement's motives well-nigh unimpeachable. The

result is that in Great Britain, which professes to be a Christian nation, the question has been raised as to whether vocational guidance is not in fact a Christian movement.

The latter question brings us to the consideration of the limitations of modern vocational guidance. The criticisms will endeavor to take cognizance of the fact that it is a young movement which has not yet worked out its own philosophy, and the further fact that it is unwise to criticize a worthwhile movement without suggesting practical ways of correcting the defects. But what follows is an attempt at Christian criticism; and even when the Church has no alternative plans to offer it reserves the right to judge, particularly in a field involving the future of youth. It claims that right on the highest authority.

The five areas in which it is contended that the vocational guidance movement shows weakness are: (1) present outreach, (2) social consciousness, (3) national importance, (4) personality treatment and (5) vocational concept. And while it could be said that a Christian element enters into the first four criticisms, it is only in the last that the argument is grounded upon theological considerations. Therefore while the movement could correct itself in the first four instances at least in theory, the fifth objection calls for a radical change in the basic meaning of vocational guidance.

Each of the five areas will be examined in turn.

(1.) At the present stage of its development, vocational guidance is not reaching the masses of school children except in its most cursory form. In Great Britain and Soviet Russia, where every child is supposedly required to receive such guid-

ance, practice has not yet caught up with theory. It is a herculean task to provide occupational counsel for the entire youth of a nation, and there are budgetary limitations which gainsay the letter of the law. On the whole it could be said that more effort is usually made to provide vocational guidance in urban and industrial sections than in rural areas.

Even industrial areas, however, are not well provided for in many cases and perhaps even in most cases. In Edinburgh, for example, there has been organized assistance to youth seeking employment since 1908. Yet in 1950, as the Youth Employment Service commenced a new phase of vocational guidance in the city with four staff officers, it was still evident that the ideal was far from reached. For each officer is now assigned 1500 children of school-leaving age and is expected to provide vocational guidance for them during the school year. As one of the officers explained, "We can only act as sieves, and deal with the more difficult cases. Most of the work will be job placement." Ten minutes is the normal time allotted for interviews.

One attempt to overcome the discrepancy between theory and present practice is through the mass experimental approach. An entire city or part of a city is selected for concentrated work by vocational guidance experts. Every school-leaving child is carefully studied and counseled, and follow-up reports are made to determine the effectiveness of the guidance. Such techniques have proved successful in Great Britain and America, but they are really tokens of hoped-for future development rather than measurements of present steady growth. In no country is vocational guidance yet functioning on a broad level of efficiency.

(2.) It has already been noted that the standard American definition of vocational guidance is curiously individualistic, lacking in interest in the real needs of society. The lack of social consciousness, which is revealed in many of the American textbooks and popular writings on "the right job for Bob", is perhaps a reflection of the nation's traditionally independent spirit. Yet there are times when such an approach, dealing as it does strictly with the individual and his adjustment, seems appallingly unreal. For if vocational guidance is purely a matter of finding joy in work, it is quite certain that some kinds of essential work--such as sewer maintenance and garbage disposal--will never be performed without some other inducements. The prospective worker may well say to the guidance expert, in the words of Mr. Nigel Balchin, "I have only one life to live. Why should I spend the best part of it in factories and mines? They may be air-conditioned, but I don't want to be in them. The work may be light, but I don't want to do it."<sup>41</sup>

Important as are the questions of individual satisfactions and capacities, there is a social order in which we operate; and if the guidance counselors in their expanding work ignore this order, then they will find the social order circumventing and nullifying their own work in its drive for man-power. Alexander Miller's remarks have a bearing at this point: "Our self-centred and subjective-minded generation tends to think that work is justified only if it 'assists in the development of personality'...The ready acceptance and the faithful performance of (work) because it is socially necessary will develop the only

---

41. "Satisfactions in Work", in Occupational Psychology, xxi, 3, July 1947.



kind of personality worth developing."<sup>42</sup>

In the Soviet Union, of course, social consciousness assumes far greater importance in vocational guidance than individual considerations, so that the problem under discussion does not exist. In Great Britain both the social and individual needs are recognized but the primary place is given to individuals. Thus the latest handbook for Youth Employment Officers issued by the Ministry of Labour states, "The first function of the Service is to help boys and girls to choose the career or type of employment which is best suited to their capacities, aptitudes and interests."<sup>43</sup> Again it describes the "three main aims" in placing boys and girls in employment:

"1. To fit them into the jobs suited to their qualifications, aptitudes and interests.

"2. To divert them from jobs harmful to health or character and from those leading to no suitable career; and

"3. To ensure, so far as possible, that the national needs are taken into account.

"Of these three the first two are fundamental."

The handbook states that the Youth Employment Officer should "call attention to those jobs in which they could make the best contribution to the community", but that "the primary consideration should always be what would be best for the individual boy or girl".<sup>44</sup> Yet there are today many statesmen and economists, particularly in Britain, who are genuinely concerned over the shortage of manpower in industry, and who are becoming aware that the needs of society are not finding much relief in

---

42. Christian Vocation in the Contemporary World, 39-40.

43. London, Sept., 1948, 4.

44. Ibid., 10.

an individual-centered system of vocational guidance.<sup>45</sup>

(3.) If it be sin to ignore the needs of society in an over-concern for the individual, the reverse is equally sinful. In view of the collectivist trends of the twentieth century, it might even be predicted that the second danger is greater than the first. When a state becomes totalitarian, one of its first concerns is man power. It seeks help in operating its machines and firing its furnaces. Vocational guidance assumes secondary importance to vocational selection. The question is not, Does a man derive satisfaction in his work? but rather, Can he do the job the state has chosen for him? If he can, the state will see that he does it.

The weakness of the vocational guidance movement throughout the world lies in the fact that it has always been pushed into the background whenever a national emergency has arisen. Being a state organ, it might be presumed to have a certain autonomy; but it has proved to be powerless to assert its principles in any serious conflict of state interests. Vocational selection, which is the scientific choosing and placing of workers, has become increasingly recognized and used by governments as well as industry. Many a modern misfit in civilian or military occupations today, however, will testify that vocational selection in practice has no necessary connection with vocational guidance. It may not be the fault of vocational guidance if it helps a youth to discover his real potentialities, only to have the government then draft the youth for totally other work. Nevertheless the fact remains that vocational guidance cannot be

---

45. Cf. Ince Report, 22.

called successful until it is realized in placement. The modern state can and does often thwart that realization, and such thwarting is no less likely because the guidance program happens to be under some kind of government control or supervision.

(4.) Vocational guidance in its present form, it may be contended in the fourth place, is not taking seriously enough the well-worn phrase, "aptitudes, abilities and interests". These traits are not being treated sufficiently as part of the whole personality. The past fifteen years have seen a rapid development of personality studies, and many persons who were once thought to be "occupationally maladjusted" are found to be suffering from more deeply-rooted conflicts. It is a contention of Carl Rogers, founder of the non-directive school of counseling at the University of Chicago, that many cases which seem to be problems of vocational and educational counseling are in reality personality problems.<sup>46</sup>

Yet vocational counselors today are not being trained to deal with personality problems.<sup>47</sup> If the counselor operates in a large clinic, he may conveniently refer a client with such a problem to a psychotherapeutic expert. The chances are, however, that he has no such resource available. Either he helps the child, or it gets no help, for the trained experts are already being overworked. The result is that many young persons whose vocational problems are only a part of a larger maladjustment to life, do not get the help they need at the time when

---

46. Counseling and Psychotherapy, 252. See also Super, Appraising Vocational Fitness, 4.

47. It is at this point that the insights of the Hawthorne researches might well be applied.

they most need it. And because they are quiet and tractable they do not get into the category of "difficult cases". They just go on being unhappy.

Miss Tay, one of the young people in our experiment, was found to be vocationally unsuited to her clerical position. She applied for a hospital opening which seemed better fitted to her talents and interests. She made a favorable impression at the hospital and received a letter ordering her to report to work. She had only twenty-four hours to decide. She wrote an answer refusing the position. In our interview she confessed her fear of "meeting the other girls" and "perhaps having to stick needles in people's fingers". Shyness and inferiority feelings had caused a serious block in her vocational adjustment, and had interfered with her future.

Such instances lead one to believe that unless vocational guidance operates on the total personality level, it is not really vocational guidance. Criticism is not aimed at the Youth Employment Officers of Great Britain, who are fulfilling a highly useful function to the best of their ability, particularly in the areas of employment service, job placement and vocational education. Yet the fact remains that vocational guidance cannot be given to any child in a superficial, mass-production manner, and still deal with the child's deepest felt needs. And that much vocational guidance in Britain and America is superficial, few would care to dispute.

(5.) The foregoing criticisms have sought to deal with the vocational guidance movement from practical points of view, considering what are claimed to be its functional weaknesses.



The fifth criticism will deal with the working theory behind the movement; not the basic motivation or ideal, but the working theory.

A good opening for criticism is provided by a "job factor sheet" developed by the Institute of Counseling, Testing and Guidance at Michigan State College, and published in 1947. This sheet, which was prepared for young people, lists what it calls "factors I consider important in choosing a job". The young people are expected to tick those factors which reflect their own attitudes. Here is the list:<sup>48</sup>

1. Certainty of continuous employment.
2. Opportunity for advancement.
3. Opportunity to make money.
4. Opportunity to use your own ideas.
5. Pleasant people to work with.
6. Good hours.
7. Opportunity to learn a job.
8. Opportunity to "do good for people".
9. Variety of work.
10. Opportunity to be in a position of authority.
11. Having a good boss.
12. Having clean work.
13. Prestige of the job.
14. Opportunity for adventure.
15. Opportunity for travel.
16. Opportunity to work inside or out.
17. Opportunity to become famous.
18. Easy work.
19. Chance to use abilities.
20. Chance to use past training.
21. Chance to satisfy parent.
22. Chance to work for yourself.
23. Chance to get a job easily.
24. Chance to do research and study.
25. Chance to work at home.
26. Chance to continue education at work.
27. Chance to work in a large city.
28. Chance to see and know a lot of people.
29. Chance to enter a new or growing field.
30. Other factors.

Since this is a serious piece of scientific work, it de-

---

48. Erickson, C.E., and Smith, G.E., Organization and Administration of Guidance Services, 79-80.

serves to be treated seriously. But when one puts himself in the position of a young person asking the question, "What shall I do with my Life?" and then refer to this list, he cannot help wondering whether the concept of Vocation thus presented is not inadequate.

The individual items are not particularly offensive, since the students could classify them as "very important", "important" or "not important" as they chose. What is so striking is what is left out. The whole concept of devotion to human welfare is condensed into a single item--"opportunity to 'do good for people'"--which is so frivolously worded as to discourage any genuine answer. Self-improvement and the desire for positive life achievement get scant treatment. There is no consideration of Christian Vocation or Calling, or even of a sense of destiny in a young person's life. The appeal to "practical" considerations has resulted in the accumulation of a mass of inconsequential data which has no conceivable relation to the basic drives of human character, or to the deep-lying motivations of youth.

The Michigan list undoubtedly presents a picture of vocational guidance in its worst light, but only because it makes explicit what is already implicit in a great deal of guidance as it is dispensed by the modern state. Excellent though the individual counselors may be, the characteristics of the guidance movement are such that Vocation is usually reduced to selfish, material and at times even trivial considerations. It is small wonder if when a national government faces an emergency which calls for a great upsurge of popular idealism, the vocational

guidance program is found to be too individualistic to be integrated and used.

When young people come to the point where they are ready to receive vocational guidance, they are usually thinking about more than just "choosing a job". They are thinking about life work. Selfish considerations invariably enter into such thinking, but it is a travesty on human nature to suppose that they are the only considerations. Service to the social group, to one's "country", is becoming an increasingly important motivation in some lands. The British Youth Employment Officers are instructed to emphasize community service in their vocational counseling; and it would be altogether a grievous wrong to accuse the entire guidance movement of the errors noted in the Michigan list. Nevertheless as long as the word Vocation is used by counselors as a synonym for "occupation", the vocational guidance movement in the west will remain essentially selfish in nature; that is, it will treat individuals from the point of view of their own selfishness.

The case of Albert Schweitzer may prove an illustration of the point. Schweitzer was world-famous as an organist, teacher and theologian when he entered upon the study of medicine in order to devote the rest of his life to medical missionary work among the natives of west Africa. As a youth, which one of the Erickson-Smith "job factors" would Schweitzer have ticked? How would a vocational counselor have dealt with his case? Schweitzer would undoubtedly have been encouraged to become a teacher or a musician, because of his apparent aptitudes, interests, capabilities and the rest. Yet his Vocation, his Calling, was

neither music nor education but a ministry of healing. He had aptitude for surgical work or he would never have been successful. He had interests in many fields, and in the years of his maturity he has not neglected any of them. His choice of life work, however, was decided on the basis of factors of whose existence the vocational guidance movement seems hardly to be aware.

In the Christian view the vocational problems of a young man or woman cannot be solved purely on the secular level. "Choosing a job" can be solved thus, but choosing a job does not settle one's vocational problem. When a Youth Employment Officer gives a school talk and urges the young people to ask themselves, "What do I feel I can do? Am I good at making things with my hands? Would I like to work out of doors, or in an office?"<sup>49</sup> he is not dealing with the question of Vocation. He is not dealing with life work in any genuine way that would lift man's vision from the dust. What he is actually discussing is survival, and it is with the problem of survival in a capitalist system that a good deal of modern vocational guidance is concerned. But important as Christians consider the matter of survival to be from a social viewpoint, they do not care to think of it as a Vocation.

A Christian critique of vocational guidance would dig down ultimately to the meaning of the Calling. For if, by its own definition, vocational guidance is concerned with the good life and the happy life, then it must raise its concept of Vocation above the survival level. It cannot counsel man as though he

---

49. Handbook for Youth Employment Officers, 20.



lives by bread alone, and still expect him to be happy. Christian faith maintains that only when a man looks upon his life work as Vocation, based on the prior action of God, can he ever discover the good life. Whether that claim can be made relevant to the modern social order is the task for the next three chapters to discover. Here it is sufficient to summarize the fifth and main criticism of the modern vocational guidance movement; it fails to do justice to the far-ranging spirit of man, and to the true concept of Vocation. In any vocational choice there is involved more than aptitudes, interests, personality problems, the division of labor and the material needs of society. For work is work, and toil is toil; but man is still God's handiwork, and his Vocation is ultimately understood best as an event in eternity.

### Summary.

The science of vocational guidance has been defined usually from an individualistic standpoint, as assistance given to persons to help them choose their occupations. Just how much advice giving is included in the assistance is a much-debated point. Social problems of industry are usually grouped separately by educators under the heading of vocational selection.

The vocational guidance movement has its roots in Plato, but it actually began in Boston, U.S.A., in 1908, with the work of Frank Parsons. The movement spread rapidly as it was taken up by the schools, and in many countries it came under the direct control of national legislation. Great Britain passed in 1948 the Employment and Training Act, which provides that every child of school-leaving age shall receive vocational guidance from the Youth Employment Service. So far the service has made a beginning, but it is far from its goal.

The United States, with no such national program, has given birth to a number of ambitious vocational developments. "Guidance" as an inclusive term has become academically popular. Tests with technical devices are now widely used as guides to occupational choice. The Hawthorne experiments have emphasized the need for genuine personal adjustment to work.

A Christian critique of the vocational guidance movement starts from an analysis of certain functional weaknesses: its failure to reach all the youth, its individualism and poor integration with vocational selection, its inability to win national recognition of its vital importance, and its ineffective approach

to personality. The critique concludes with a fifth criticism, more basic than the others, concerning the essential weakness of the concept of Vocation behind the movement.

CHAPTER THREE

PROBLEMS OF ADAPTATION

Outline.

- I. The Response to Modern Work.
  - 1. Industrialization and Socialization.
  - 2. The Emergence of Meaninglessness.
  - 3. The Romantic Reaction.
- II. The Rise of the Human Factor.
  - 1. Satisfaction in Work.
  - 2. The Differentiation of Function.
    - a. Individual Differences.
    - b. The Division of Labor.
- III. Efforts Toward Adapting the Concept of Vocation.
  - 1. Emergence of a Vocational Ethic.
  - 2. Withdrawal to a Religious View of the Calling.
  - 3. Adaptation by Emphasis upon Work.
  - 4. Secular Adaptation.
    - a. Vocation as Social Duty.
    - b. Vocation by Tape-Measure.
    - c. "The Vocation of Leadership".

Summary.



I have looked for a man among them to build up the wall and man the breach on behalf of the land...but I could not find a man.

-- Ezekiel 22:30 (Moffatt)

The Christian community has a specific task in just this field, namely, to work out a concrete doctrine of vocation through its lay members who know the jobs and their threat to working morale, and to demand and to create such technical and psychological conditions as are necessary to regain the lost sense of work as a divine calling.

-- Emil Brunner

## I. The Response to Modern Work.

In the foregoing chapters the history of the concept of Vocation was traced to its issue in modern technological terminology, and an effort was then made to investigate one of the more important of those terms, namely vocational guidance. The present task is to survey recent tendencies to adapt the vital and enduring qualities of Christian Vocation to modern life, and the problems that have been encountered thus far on the way. Upon completion of the survey, a proposal for a new approach to adaptation will be offered in Chapter IV, and will be applied specifically to the field of vocational guidance in Chapter V.

### 1. Industrialization and Socialization.

The greatest single change in the working scene is the rise of industry. In many parts of the world young people of school-leaving age still face the same conditions of work that confronted their ancestors. Their economy is still saturated with medieval, agrarian and feudal elements; the old traditional distinctions or "stations" apply to the modes of living, and a humble piety is still woven into the social fabric. But the sands of time are obliterating these oases, and where there has come change, it has usually been due to the development of industry.

The problem presented to Christian ethics by the advent of the machine is usually underestimated by preachers and theologians. Dr. J. H. Oldham recently pointed out that direct counsel on industrial matters is to be found neither in the Bible, nor the patristic fathers, nor the schoolmen nor the Reformers, since

the modern power machine came after them all.<sup>1</sup> When Luther advanced his doctrine of worldly Vocation, work was still conducted much as it had been in Biblical times. The division of labor was relatively simple. "In a primitive...village not yet converted to the Industrial Revolution, occupations...have an organic and contributive character. . . Like it or not, the members of such a...village must work together or perish."<sup>2</sup>

The industrial invasion has brought about a drastic transformation in the ordinary man's way of living. Everything--his daily work, his family life, his amusements, even his sleep--has been altered. "The characteristic marks of modern society are that it is a scientific, technical, industrial and administrative society. . . It is hardly possible to exaggerate the changes which together they have brought about in the conditions of man's life and on his ways of thinking and feeling."<sup>3</sup>

Whether the growth of a technical and industrial way of life has been healthy or unhealthy for mankind is not a matter upon which this thesis is expected to pass judgment. Many writers may be found to testify to its evil effects, as the following pages make evident. Yet others such as Mumford believe that the machine is ultimately an instrument for good; that it has lessons to teach man, and can be absorbed profitably into his culture.<sup>4</sup> Oldham, who basis his analysis to some extent upon Mumford, finds that from the Christian point of view the machine is both beneficial and harmful. His insights,

- 
1. Lecture, Conference on Work, Dollarbeg, Scotland, Nov.1, 1950.
  2. Calhoun, God and the Common Life, 101-2.
  3. Oldham, Work in Modern Society, 11.
  4. Mumford, Technics and Civilization, 319, 363.

which are included in the Amsterdam reports and are expanded in a later booklet, Work in Modern Society, offer the keenest survey yet made by a Protestant writer of the response of man to modern work.<sup>5</sup>

The task of relating Christian Vocation to the changed nature of man's work must begin with a recognition of the fact that despite the primitive areas left on the earth's surface, wherever modern man has been at work in earnest and in a way that is typical, he has created an industrial order. He has so rearranged society that the house of the machine, be it factory, shop, engine or mine, has lured millions of human beings from the countryside into urban districts. What has been an old story in Europe and America is still a new one in Asia and Africa, where mechanization has been introduced at an accelerated pace. Even since 1930, when Mumford wrote his definitive history of the rise of industry, whole new chapters have been added. Modern India, for example, in the briefest span of years has quite uprooted the sacred tradition according to which a man followed in the trade of his ancestors.

The eventual result of the changes in the division of labor in India, as in the west, will depend upon another factor which is strongly conditioning the modern human response to work. It is the trend toward mass groupings of people for efficiency and convenience. The effect of such groupings is to reduce the value of individual differences and to lower the significance of Vocation for all Christians except the "uncommon" ones.

---

5. Cf. The Church and the Disorder of Society, World Council of Churches, 29-49.



Brunner maintains that "mass man" is a creation of the industrial era; that he did not exist in the populous medieval cities.<sup>6</sup> Mass, he points out, is amorphous; and in society it is identical not only with formlessness but with spiritual homelessness. One of the dangers of modern vocational guidance, it was suggested in the last chapter, is that when provided by the state it tends toward a mass-distribution, superficial type of service which really does not meet the young person's needs.<sup>7</sup> Now it must be added that the emergence of "the masses" is a threat to the concept of Vocation itself.

The political name for the trend toward mass groupings is collectivism, and its curve in history is roughly parallel to industrialism. As man's work grew more and more mechanized, the prophets of collectivism became more and more articulate. Godwin, Fourier and Saint-Simon in the eighteenth century were followed by Proudhon, Robert Owen and Karl Marx in the nineteenth.<sup>8</sup> The mechanical shrinkage of time and distance was accompanied by increasing attempts to organize men, until today social cohesion among workers has been achieved on a scale previously unknown in history. Adam Smith propounded an economy based on the self-interest of the butcher and the baker, but the modern social order is rapidly moving toward the opposite principle, "in union there is strength".

---

6. Brunner, Justice and the Social Order, tr., 164.

7. See p. 85.

8. Cf. Gray, The Socialist Tradition, 114-331. Fourier, for example, was "maddened by the sight of 300 women, in 300 little houses, lighting 300 little fires, and cooking 300 little dinners in 300 little pots for 300 little men returning from their work", when one pot, one fire, and three or four women could have done the whole thing better. (Gray, ib., 178.)

There are many phenomena attending this movement; whether they are symptoms or causes cannot be discussed here. The reduced significance of the family, the twenty-four-hour shift, the "blanket coverage" of the radio, the incessant summons to class warfare, the mass executions in wartime followed by bulldozer burials, the increasing state controls and above all the machine itself, have helped to blur the individuality of human persons and to produce the masses. The true symbol of this change is the Displaced Person in the refugee camp, who is displaced not only from his home but from his work.

## 2. The Emergence of Meaninglessness.

One of the most characteristic results of the industrial process has been the emergence of meaninglessness. Nihilistic feelings have probably always existed among the exploited workers in society since the days of the pyramid builders of Egypt.<sup>9</sup> Modern industry has simply rubbed salt into those wounded feelings until today, with the working classes suddenly become vocal, the meaninglessness which was formerly more or less noticed in passing has become a major world problem. The squalor of living conditions, the ever-present threat of the machine to take over one's means of livelihood, the tedium of the job and the threat of lethal destruction have all contributed to make city work a tragic fulfilment of the curse in the third chapter of Genesis.

To show the nature of meaninglessness is no easy task, yet it would be fatuous to attempt to build a concept of Vocation today without recognizing it as a most significant factor in

---

9. See pp. 60, 160.

modern work.<sup>10</sup> It will not be necessary to quote from writers of the Marxist school who are suspected of exploiting the general misery to their own ideological purposes.<sup>11</sup> Many literary men and women of integrity in the past century have devoted their talents to the problem of meaningless work.

John Ruskin, aristocrat, aesthete and art critic, who described himself as "not an unselfish person nor an Evangelical one", told how the emptiness of other men's work affected his own:

I simply cannot paint, nor read, nor look at minerals, nor do anything else that I like, and the very light of the morning sky, when there is any--which is seldom, now-a-days, near London--has become hateful to me, because of the misery that I know of, and see signs of...<sup>12</sup>

Speaking directly to the question of work, he said in a lecture at Manchester in 1864:

All that great foul city of London there--rattling, growling, smoking, stinking--a ghastly heap of fermenting brickwork, pouring out poison at every pore--you fancy it is a city of work? Not a street of it! It is a great city of play; very nasty play, and very hard play; but still play...The first great English game is this play-

- 
10. An excellent statement of the human reaction to the machine, including the emergence of meaninglessness, is contained in Mumford (op.cit., ch. 6.) under such headings as "the direct attack on the machine", "the cult of the past", "the cult of death (war)", the "romantic" cult, "sport", etc. He even links such phenomena as Mormonism and the modern dance and popular joke to this reaction.
  11. How far the Communist Manifesto is a genuine and righteous outcry against the misery of the working classes, and how far it is a clever instrument for the acquisition of political power, may never be decided. De Man found that the Manifesto's claim that "the labourer has become a mere appendage to a machine" was indignantly rejected by the machine-tenders in his survey, even when they happened to be Marxists. (Joy in Work, 85-6.)
  12. Fors Clavigera, I, 3.

ing at counters.<sup>13</sup>

Ruskin's final sentence above suggests a flaw in the economic structure of capitalism: the danger of meaninglessness in a system in which the primary emphasis is not upon work done and service rendered, but upon the margin of profit in the exchange.<sup>14</sup>

Socialist writers before and since Ruskin have made much of the fact that the temptation to "play at counters" destroys the meaning and integrity of work.

William Morris, an artist like Ruskin but an active Socialist as well, wrote at length on what he considered the greatest tragedy of his time--the increasing joylessness of work. In a lecture on "Art and Socialism" he said,

The wonderful machines which in the hands of just and foreseeing men would have been used to minimize repulsive labour and to give pleasure, or in other words added life, to the human race, have been so used...that they have driven all men into mere frantic haste and hurry, thereby destroying pleasure, that is life, on all hands; they have instead of lightening the labour of the workmen, intensified it and thereby added more weariness yet to the burden which the poor have to carry.<sup>15</sup>

Morris' "News from Nowhere" was a brilliant utopian satire on the

- 
13. Crown of Wild Olive, 33-4. It is also an American game, now carried on, as Mayo suggests, by "strange groups of men that one never meets elsewhere in this great country, except in trains or hotels. Cigar in corner of mouth, each talks incessantly of dollars". (Social Problems of an Industrial Civilization, 4.) But what Ruskin calls "play" and Weber (Protestant Ethic, tr., 182) "sport", may be a "jovial mask for the serious antagonisms of competitive trade" which, from the viewpoint of productive work, could be equally meaningless. (Cf. Calhoun, op.cit., 60.)
  14. Cf. Dorothy Sayers' essay, "Why Work?" in Creed or Chaos. For a discussion of the distinction between capitalism and industrialism, see Forrester, Cunningham Lectures, 1950, IV (published earlier in Expository Times, Sept. 1937).
  15. Lecture on Art and Socialism in Architecture, Industry and Wealth, 107.



purposeless nature of modern work. He felt, he said, "dazed at the thought of the immensity of work which is undergone for the making of useless things".<sup>16</sup>

Not only the attitude one took toward one's work and the function itself were being stripped of meaning; the conditions of work were also becoming such that man could find no significance in them. The novels of Charles Dickens abound with descriptions of the most appalling scenes in English industrial life; and what his eye failed to see, Kingsley, Robertson, Carlyle, Walpole, Wilde and the British socialists reported. In other countries of Europe and America there were equally dismal conditions, as the literature of those lands in the past two centuries testifies.<sup>17</sup>

As early as 1805 Dr. Charles Hall, whom Sir Alexander Gray calls "a man of high principle", described manufacturing conditions in the west of England in the most dramatic terms. Work, he said, was "carried on within doors, in confined rooms,

- 
16. A. Clutton-Brock, William Morris, 231. Among many available modern expressions in similar vein, Calhoun's may be cited: "The part of the ordinary worker in much of modern industry and trade has been trivialized to the point of boredom and preclusion of self-respect. Snipping endlessly the pieces of cheap cloth for shoddy garments; punching endlessly the paper and split leather soles for bargain shoes; feeding endlessly the rods, wire, and sheet metal that become ten-cent hardware...Who is fool enough to look for God.. in this dreary modern warehouse?" (op.cit., 30.)
  17. This is not the place for a bibliography of such literature, but among recent writings in English the works of such Britons as H.G. Wells, Bernard Shaw and Aldous Huxley, and of such Americans as Theodore Dreiser, Upton Sinclair and John dos Passos, might be mentioned. Mayo (in foreword to Roethlisberger, op.cit., xvii-xxi) ascribes much importance to the nineteenth century French sociological studies of Le Play and Durkheim (particularly the latter's study of suicides) as factual evidence of the growth of meaninglessness in industry.

shutting out the pleasant objects of nature, frequently within frames like cages, in offensive atmospheres, generally rendered more nauseous by the effluvia of the subject worked on, always by that of the bodies and filthy clothes of the workmen; their postures bent, doubled, and every way distorted."<sup>18</sup>

As an aesthetic expression of the meaninglessness of modern work and the deeper attitudes of many men toward it, the poems of D. H. Lawrence may be cited:

While a wage-slave works, he leaves life aside  
and stands there a piece of dung...  
men should refuse to work at all, as wage slaves.<sup>19</sup>

New houses, new furniture, new streets, new  
clothes, new sheets  
everything new and machine-made sucks life out  
of us...<sup>20</sup>

Why have money?...  
why have industry?  
why have the industrial system?  
why have machines, that we only have to serve?...  
why have working classes at all, as if men were  
only embodied jobs?<sup>21</sup>

But as for the mills of men  
don't be harnessed to them.  
The dead give ships and engines, cinema, radio  
and gramophone,  
and they say: Now, behold, you are living the  
great life!...  
As you know, it is a complete lie.  
You are all going dead and corpse pale  
listening to the lie.  
Spit it out...<sup>22</sup>

The most ominous note in man's bitter protest is the most contemporary. The inventions of the past quarter-century have

---

18. The Effects of Civilisation, 40-1. Quoted in Gray, The Socialist Tradition, 264.

19. Pansies, 40.

20. Ib., 38.

21. Ib., 42.

22. Ib., 32.

thrown an apocalyptic gloom over those who see the machine as the devil's curse on the world. The author of The Twenty-fifth Hour, a mid-century novel arising out of the internment camps of central and eastern Europe, asserts that the great danger facing civilization is "the mechanical slave"; that the slave now outnumbers humanity and has started to dehumanize man by making his life a series of uniform, automatic and anonymous reactions. When man has adopted the way of the mechanical slave completely and has become contemptible and despised as an individual, the revolution will be complete.

"This slow process of dehumanisation is at work under many different guises, making man renounce his emotions and reducing social relationships to something categorical, automatic and precise, like the relationship between different parts of a machine. The rhythm and the jargon of the mechanical slaves, or robots if you like, find echoes in our social relationships and our administration, in painting, literature and dancing. Men are becoming the apes of robots. But that is only the beginning of the tragedy..."<sup>23</sup>

Nothing in Dickens, Morris, Eric Gill, Aldous Huxley or Arthur Koestler presents the human reaction to the machine quite as despairingly as Gheorghiu's epic of the concentration camps.

The purpose of the foregoing quotations has not been to set forth the actual conditions of man's work, but rather his feelings about them. Despite Gheorghiu's dire predictions, the "mechanical slave" has not yet routed man. Many modern governments and private organizations are rapidly bringing order out of industrial chaos, and in some parts of the world working conditions and standards have vastly improved in the past hundred years. Nevertheless there remain thousands of plants and factories that are barely

---

23. V. Gheorghiu, The Twenty-fifth Hour, 36-42.

subsisting economically, and have no available funds for the improvement of facilities. In such places morale and sense of meaning in work are difficult to maintain. It is poor equipment and clumsy machinery, as much as anything, that gives man the impression that he is becoming the ape of the robot. Another contemporary contributor to the loss of meaning at work is the fear of war, particularly a technological war. The difficulties in the way of a Christian's acquisition of a sense of Vocation in a brewery may seem small when measured against the vocational problems in an atomic bomb or bacteriological warfare plant.

A recent American study found that "boys and girls regard all occupations other than professional careers as just mere ways of earning a livelihood."<sup>24</sup> If a young person is forced to go to work in a damp mine or a dirty foundry, he may be excused for rejecting the application of Vocation to his wretched labors.<sup>25</sup> Probably John Knox, the Reformer, did not regard his servitude as a galley slave as his Calling. Yet the difficulty lies in the fact that God has not called His worshipers to withdraw from life; the tares must grow up with the wheat, and many dirty jobs appear to be unavoidable. Certainly there can be no path to a solution of the vocational problem which does not lead through the smoke of modern industry.

### 3. The Romantic Reaction.

One reaction from the growing sense of futility that is most important to modern conceptions of Christian Vocation has been

---

24. Fleege and Malone, in JEP, 1946, v. 37, p. 77. (See bibliog.)

25. Even the word "work" has become taboo among many laborers in America today, who invariably refer instead to "putting in time".



the rise of a romantic view of work. Unlike the sense of meaninglessness, the romantic reaction did not spring from the lower levels of employment. It came from those who owned or were served by the machines rather than from those who worked them: a fact which failed to halt its invasion of the modern Soviet Union. Our aim is not to trace the development of the movement but to identify it.

Thomas Carlyle, who combined in himself many opposites, was an early romanticist of modern labor. His expressions at times closely approximated what Weber calls the "spirit of capitalism". For his "Gospel of Work" Carlyle took the old Benedictine motto, laborare est orare, but shifted the emphasis to the laborare.

"Happy," my brother?...What difference is it whether thou art happy or not?...The only happiness a brave man ever troubled himself with asking much about was, happiness enough to get his work done.<sup>26</sup>

There is a perennial nobleness, and even sacredness, in work...Blessed is he who has found his work; let him ask no other blessedness...properly speaking, all true Work is Religion.<sup>27</sup>

Produce! Produce! Were it but the pitifullest infinitesimal fraction of a Product, produce it, in God's name!...Up, up! Whatsoever thy hand findeth to do, do it with thy whole might. Work while it is called Today; for the night cometh, wherein no man can work.<sup>28</sup>

Many romantics have been less sensitive to the tragedy of industrial life than was Carlyle, whose citations above represent but a facet of his thinking. For example, hundreds of clergymen have made use of the still popular story of the three

---

26. Past and Present, III, iv.

27. Ib., III, xi, xii.

28. Sartor Resartus, II, 9.

workmen on the cathedral, who, when asked what they were doing, replied in turn, "I am chipping these stones," "I am earning my wages" and "I am building a cathedral". No one ever seems to have doubted that the third man had the straight of it.<sup>29</sup> The value of the story lies in its emphasis upon the whole as an end; its dangerous quality is that it seems to dispose of the problem of meaningless effort in modern labor, when in fact its romantic setting is medieval. Even today workers can take pride in sharing the construction of an airplane, a locomotive, a ship or even a cathedral;<sup>30</sup> yet for millions of workers no such feeling of participation is possible by the very nature of their work.<sup>31</sup>

A modern Christian youth devotional book contains a sonnet by Henry van Dyke which romances quietly about work:

Let me but do my work from day to day  
 In field or forest, at the desk or loom  
 In roaring market-place or tranquil room;  
 Let me but find it in my heart to say,  
 When vagrant wishes beckon me astray,  
 "This is my work; my blessing, not my doom;  
 Of all who live, I am the one by whom  
 This work can best be done in the right way.

Then shall I see it not too great, or small,  
 To suit my spirit and to prove my powers..  
 Because I know for me my work is best.<sup>32</sup>

---

29. It is worth noting that when I related this story to Dr. Emil Brunner he commented, "I would choose the second answer, for with wages one can maintain a Christian home."

30. This is true even in times of severe unemployment. See the literature associated with the launching of the Queen Mary in 1930; also T.M. Heron, Man at Work, in Prospect for Christendom (Reckitt, ed.), 120.

31. An American study of industrial problems relates an interview with a worker in a large automotive plant in words which form a good contrast to the cathedral story: "What do you do?" "I make C-64." "What is C-64?" "I don't know." "How long have you worked at it?" "Ten years."

32. R. and E. Doidge, Epilogues, 41.

Obviously it is not difficult to build a concept of Christian Vocation around the mood and atmosphere of work expressed by van Dyke. Christian apologists have sought for such expressions because they have made the task easier. Meanwhile the more sinister issues connected with modern work, such as have been noted in the writings of Ruskin, Hall, Morris, Gheorghiu, etc., have been ignored in the interests of Christian idealism. Young people listening to van Dyke's poem on Sunday evening, and going to work in Hall's manufacturing plant on Monday morning, could only conclude that the Christian attitude to work was unreal.

More recently Miss Dorothy Sayers has spoken and written as an artist on the subject of work. Her attitude represents an earnest Christian effort to reinterpret work meaningfully.

Work is the natural exercise and function of man....Work is not, primarily, a thing one does to live, but the thing one lives to do. It is, or should be, the full expression of the worker's faculties, the thing in which he finds spiritual, mental, and bodily satisfaction, and the medium in which he offers himself to God.<sup>33</sup>

These statements on the meaning of work are not easily put aside, for they seem to carry validity for many persons, particularly for those engaged in some kind of creative activity. Nevertheless the doctrine of work Miss Sayers sets forth is charged with romantic idealism which has little in common with Biblical Christianity. The Bible says at no place that man "lives to work" or that work is his "natural function" any more than plan or sleep. There is a Biblical view of work, or rather several balancing views, as will become evident in the next chapter. It is only necessary to point out how completely hopeless for modern man--

---

33. Essay "Why Work?" in Creed or Chaos, 54-5.

whether or not he tends a machine--is a doctrine of work or of vocation which bases itself upon what "should be". Miss Sayers herself has described "the advertisements imploring and exhorting and cajoling and menacing and bullying us to glut ourselves with things we did not want...and the fierce international scramble to find in helpless and backward nations a market on which to fob off all the superfluous rubbish which the inexorable machines ground out hour by hour, to create money and to create employment..."<sup>34</sup>

Such is the actual situation as Miss Sayers has vividly portrayed it; and there is not much assurance that under a capitalist system it will ever improve much. Men will continue to work at miserable jobs and poets and preachers will continue to romanticize them. All of the foregoing citations have been taken, of course, from the "bourgeois-intelligentsia" class. How is it, then, with the other half of the world which now lives under a "workingmen's democracy" or "dictatorship of the proletariat"?

The fact is that the Soviet Union has far exceeded the western world in weaving romantic fancies about the field of work. The work-fantasies are today part of the normal indoctrination by Soviet agencies, and are combined with the deliberate cultivation of work-fanaticism.<sup>35</sup>

Lenin was as ardent an enthusiast of work-idealism as Carlyle, as a speech he made in the spring of 1920 indicates:

34. Ib., 49.

35. Such work-fanaticism is today by no means restricted to Russia or even to war-ravaged countries; it is common to all of life. Cf. Brunner: "When a man loses (the) divine perspective, he throws himself into work and becomes a work-fanatic; or he sees no meaning in work and runs away from it." (Christianity and Civilization, ii, 70.)



Communist labour in the narrower and stricter sense of the word is unpaid labour for the use of society, labour undertaken, not for the serving of some definite obligation, not for receiving the right to certain products, not according to already arranged legalized standards, but voluntary labour, labour outside the ordinary labour, given without any thought of reward or condition of reward, labour according to a habit of working for the common good and according to a conscious (already becoming a habit) attitude to the necessity of work for the common good--labour as the demand of a healthy organism...<sup>36</sup>

The combination of this idealism with work-fanaticism is seen in Lenin's life, for he was a victim of his own labors, literally working himself to death at the age of fifty-six. Instead of being labeled work-obsession or work-neurosis, his feverish expenditure of energy is considered by the Soviet theorists a mark of high virtue; he is called a martyr of work.<sup>37</sup>

The rise of the Stakhanovite movement in Russia is, in a sense, a fulfilment of Lenin's spirit. The hero-worship that has been paid to Alexei Stakhanov, a young miner in the Donetz basin who "discovered" a way to increase his daily output of coal from seven to 227 tons, illustrates the development of both work-romanticism and work-obsession.<sup>38</sup> The movement has been delib-

---

36. Fox, Lenin, A Biography, 306.

37. Stalin, Lenin's successor, has cautiously avoided this distinction. Cf. W.B. Smith, Moscow Mission.

38. See Koestler, The Yogi and the Commissar, 161-2. According to Koestler, Stakhanov's method was an application of the western principle of the division of labor. Forrester suggests that "Stakhanovitism may be more harmful morally than big business," while Mairet concludes: "Satisfaction cannot be injected by any kind of Stakhanovism: that is a sort of heroics, which makes a bravado of the activity desired, and in rewarding with money and publicity those who drive their machines hardest, it really directs attention to the singular tedium that has to be borne." (Forrester, Cunningham Lectures, 1950, v; Mairet, A Civilization of Technics, in Prospect for Christendom, (Reckitt, ed.), 76.) The apocalyptic promise of good things to come, which is used to bolster the Stakhanovite movement, contains highly romantic and utopian elements.

erately cultivated by the government with such statements as the following, made at the Stakhanovite conference of 1936 by Vyacheslav Molotov:

It is not a question...of overstrain. . . .  
Counting minutes and seconds during one's work  
means introducing a rhythm...means introducing  
culture in one's work. It is therefore not a  
question of overstrain on the part of the worker  
but of a cultured attitude towards work.<sup>39</sup>

In the achievement of this phenomenon may be noted the absolute polarity from meaninglessness. The frantic effort of the worker to yield more units of output, in response to artificially created stimuli, produces not a rhythm but a dangerous unbalance in his personal life. A stable society is not attained through work-martyrdom any more than it is achieved through the fevered efforts of the western statesman or business man who "loses himself" in his work. The increasing destructiveness of war has nevertheless heightened the need for heroic expenditure of effort in work, and along with increased meaninglessness there will undoubtedly be further exploitation of the "romance" of work. Such romancing only makes it all the more difficult for man to discover the solid values in his work, in the "what is" rather than the "what should be". Yet it is only as he discovers those solid values that his work can ever be to him a Vocation.

## II. The Rise of the Human Factor.

Le Play, the French engineer who discerned a century ago many of today's outstanding industrial problems, once asked what was the most important thing that came out of the mine. Various products were named; then he answered: No, the most important

---

39. Koestler, op.cit., 162 (emphasis Molotov's).

thing that came out of the mine was the miner.<sup>40</sup> Le Play's remark has been at the heart of most of the criticism that has since been leveled at the western capitalist order. Throughout the years when the machine was bringing increased efficiency and indescribable misery into the world, when automatism, uniformity and anonymity were afflicting the soul of man, there was set in motion a strong and challenging reaction which insisted that man had significance as a human being.

The reaction has taken many forms. In the scientific world it has given rise to the "human" or social sciences. Within Christianity it produced the "social gospel". In philosophy it found expression as humanism. Socialism and Marxism have both sought to give political shape to the reaction; and so have American "rugged individualists" with their insistence upon free enterprise and the "uncommon man". Kierkegaard, Unamuno, Aldous Huxley and George Orwell, to cite four divergent examples, have all been spokesmen at one time or another for the reaction which may perhaps best be described as the emergence of the human factor.

In recent years the rulers of capitalism have not been unaware of the mounting dissatisfaction with their methods of mechanization and industrialization, and ownership and management have set themselves to many epoch-making reforms, all featuring prominently the human factor. Personnel departments have increased in importance; ordinary labor, once treated as a commodity on the open market, is now wooed with security plans, free services and morale-building programs. Viteles has expressed the new

---

40. Quoted in Mumford, op.cit., 359.

approach concisely: "Human efficiency at work, in terms of optimal production and maximum satisfaction, can only exist when the total personality of the worker is given due consideration in arranging the task and the conditions of work. The disregard of a worker's capacity to feel, think and grow is a subtle but menacing danger in breaking down his social and spiritual morale."<sup>41</sup> Within the element called the "human factor" there may appear those qualities which carry significance for a modern concept of Christian Vocation, however "secular" they seem to be. The present search must be confined to two general areas: satisfactions in work and the differentiation of function.

#### 1. Satisfactions in Work.

The most difficult task in relating the problem of incentives and work-satisfactions to Christian Vocation is to avoid the extremes of being drugged by the periodic injection of idealist platitudes, or being overwhelmed by cynicism. In the secular world men who write about incentives tend to fall into the two categories: those who are still committed to the ideal (of their own choice or for reasons of public policy), and those who have become disillusioned.

The first group is not purely secular; it includes some Christian romanticists who take the general attitude expressed in the "cathedral story".<sup>42</sup> One idealistic statement may be considered representative of both Christians and secularists: "To be one of a corporate society working with a common purpose for the common good is the highest incentive to the doing of one's

---

41. Viteles, The Science of Work, 369.

42. See pp. 106-7.



best work."<sup>43</sup> The statement, it should be noted, makes a supreme claim for the social incentive and so becomes theologically suspect.

Keeping strange company with the idealists are Lenin and his followers, including Stalin. They have set up numerous "new incentives" in the Soviet Union, such as: "collectivism to replace individual competition; voluntary discipline instead of economic and legal coercion; the consciousness of responsibility toward the community; international class-solidarity to replace chauvinism; the dignity of labour to replace dignity of birth or position; a spirit of fraternity among equals to replace the pater-  
 nity of God and Leader; persuasion instead of compulsion." Koestler claims that within "a generation after the experiment started, the new incentives have been replaced without exception and in all walks of life by the old, abandoned ones."<sup>44</sup> The idealism has collapsed, yet the breakdown has been cleverly concealed by official statements which have made the revival of competition, Orthodoxy and nationalistic imperialism seem to be simply an extension of Marxist socialism. Officially the Russian laborer still works for the "common good"; unofficially there are now proletarian millionaires.<sup>45</sup>

The other side of the issue can be equally discouraging when studied in its extreme form. Many who have pondered the incentives question have concluded with Sir Alexander Gray that "it remains true and regrettably true, that the only effective incen-

43. Rev. P.T.R. Kirk, Man the Worker, 19.

44. Koestler, The Yogi and the Commissar, 194. Cf. Viteles on the role of non-financial incentives and socialist competition in the U.S.S.R., in Keller and Viteles, Vocational Guidance throughout the World, 213 ff.

45. Koestler, op.cit., 194-5, 163.

tives are of a material character, with an appeal to the individualistic and competitive instincts of mankind which we are supposed to be eradicating...---the desire of gain and comfort."<sup>46</sup> Nigel Balchin refuses to believe that any community can ever be created in which "people work because they believe it their duty to society to do so."<sup>47</sup> Even a Christian writer sounds the materialistic note: "The main incentive...is and must continue to be for some time...the financial one."<sup>48</sup> A collation of various work incentives suggested by British psychologists and industrial economists would include the following: Money, security, hope of promotion, opportunity for personal recognition and prestige, emulation, professional pride, craft interest, the drive of good leadership, need for physical and mental activity, desire for variety of experience, aesthetic patterning of experience and activity, desire for outlet for manual skill, desire for companionship, prospect of helping on some common aim, desire to win approval of those among whom one works, desire to build a set of social values around the job and into the factory community.<sup>49</sup>

It will be noticed that the above collection has a few genuinely social incentives which distinguish it from the American "job-factor sheet" used in giving vocational guidance at Michigan

- 
46. Economics: Yesterday and Tomorrow, in Adv. Sci., vi, No. 23, Oct. 1949.  
 47. Satisfactions in Work, in Occ. Psych., xii, No. 2, Apr. 1948.  
 48. G.W. Davis, Men at Work, 46.  
 49. Symons, Work and Vocation, 24-5; Prof. Raymond Firth, Anthropological Background to Work, in Occ. Psych., xii, No 2, Apr. 1948; W.B.D. Brown, Incentives Within the Factory, ib., xix, No. 2, Apr. 1945.

State College.<sup>50</sup> Even so there is tragically missing from the list the incentive which Christians have called the "chief end of man"--the desire to glorify God and to enjoy Him. The real bankruptcy of the term Vocation can be realized from such an omission. Mace has pointed out that men do not act from single motives; that they work, in his opinion, partly because they know they must in order to eat; partly because they like to, and partly because of a "natural sense of responsibility or obligation". Yet he believes even the mixed motivation "has nothing essentially to do with political, social, moral or religious ideals".<sup>51</sup> The concept of Vocation is given no share in bringing the worker to his work. Two significant pioneering studies have been conducted by social scientists in the field of work-satisfactions and incentives. One is generally known as the Hawthorne Experiments, conducted at the Chicago plant of Western Electric Company, and referred to earlier.<sup>52</sup> The other is an analysis of autobiographical reports from wage workers and salaried employees of both sexes in various parts of Germany in 1924-6, made by Henri De Man and known as Joy in Work.<sup>53</sup>

Many of the conclusions of the Hawthorne experimenters are similar to those advanced in theoretical writings, but because the emphasis is different, and because the Hawthorne results were so different from what were expected, they deserve to be quoted in part as much as possible in the experimenters' own words:

1. "The worker is not an isolated, atomic individual; he is

---

50. See p. 87.

51. Satisfactions in Work, in *Occ. Psych.*, xxi, No. 1, Jan. 1948.

52. See p. 76; also Mayo, The Social Problems of an Industrial Civilization, 68-112.

53. Originally published as Der Kampf um die Arbeitsfreude, 1927.

a member of a group, or of groups. Within each of these groups the individuals have feelings and sentiments toward each other, which bind them together in collaborative effort...Output is a form of social behavior."

2. "As a result of the (experiments), the Hawthorne researchers became more and more interested in the informal employee groups which tend to form...They became interested in the beliefs and creeds which have the effect of making each individual feel an integral part of the group...in the social codes and norms of behavior by means of which employees automatically work together in a group...They studied the important social functions these groups perform for their members."

3. "Most of us want the satisfaction that comes from being accepted and recognized as people of worth by our...work associates. . . We want the feeling that comes not so much from the amount of money we have in the bank as from being an accepted member of a group."<sup>54</sup>

Various industrial studies in Britain have confirmed the importance of harmony within the informal working group as an index to individual attitudes and to the actual quality of the output. Mace has linked the importance of the group to the sense of social obligation by showing that "individual responsibility is socially conditioned...(and) depends upon something being expected and upon the sustaining influence of someone else's valuation."<sup>55</sup> Oldham, in turn, says that "the value set on one's effort by others, particularly by one's work group or immediate

---

54. Roethlisberger, Management and Morale, 23-5.

55. Op.cit.



associates, is all-important."<sup>56</sup> Finally De Man's investigations have confirmed the Hawthorne assertions that the "size of the pay envelope" is not the greatest incentive to doing good work or deriving satisfaction from it. De Man found that "the acquisitive instinct...is what drives the worker to his work. . . . But this motive is not a positive and intrinsic constituent of joy in work. On the contrary...thought about daily bread, thought about earning, kills joy in work."<sup>57</sup>

If it be true that to be accepted by some group is one of the deepest incentives behind all human work, Christianity is presented with unexpected validation of the statement, "Man does not live by bread alone". There is no need for Christian faith to invent romantic fictions which turn bargain basements into cathedrals, in order to hide the ugly facts about work. It is clear now that much unpleasant but necessary work can be made pleasant by a harmonious group. Nor is it necessary to turn cynical, ascribe all work motives to mammon and the curse,<sup>58</sup> and claim even that the telephone repairman fixes the lines more from professional distaste at seeing his work go wrong, than from a desire to serve the public. The nonsense in much materialistic and idealistic speculation about incentives and work satisfactions can be discarded for what has been demonstrated to be a basic and satisfying motivator: loyalty to the group and recognition by

---

56. Oldham, Work in Modern Society, 22-4.

57. Joy in Work, tr., 50.

58. Catholic sociologists Borne and Henry declare that Christians who say, "because Adam was guilty, you must work and suffer in working, accept your lot and then be happy in another world," actually betray their Vocation. (A Philosophy of Work, tr., 190-1.)

the group.

When the Christian joins such a group, he is soon known for what he is, as the Hawthorne researchers suggest, both as to his professed creed and his actual social behavior. How important the working group is to the development of a modern Christian concept of Vocation will be made evident in the following chapter.

## 2. The Differentiation of Function.

In any study of Vocation and vocational guidance the differentiation of function is bound to occupy a position of importance. Since Plato first set forth the principle that "there are diversities of natures among us which are adapted to different occupations", differentiation of function has been a fundamental aspect of work. As Plato indicated, it consists of two parts: the "diversities of natures" or individual differences, and the "different occupations" or the division of labor.<sup>59</sup> They will be considered separately at first.

### a. Individual Differences.

There is no more significant quarrel on the face of the globe today, whether cultural, political or military, than the dispute over the individuality of the human being. Individualists are contending for the "dignity" and "uniqueness" of persons, the right to "freedom" and to a chance to fulfil one's "innate aptitudes" or "natural abilities". To such people the influence of heredity on personality usually seems important. Socialists on the other hand maintain that it is environmental conditioning that makes the man. They lay lighter stress on

---

59. See pp. 59-60.

"gifts", seeking rather to "create" scientifically a "new type of human being" who will be better adjusted to the conditions of modern society and better able to supply its needs. "We must grow men," in Stalin's words, "as carefully as the gardener grows his plants."

If one looks to the Bible for guidance on this ticklish question, it soon becomes apparent that the Old Testament Jewish society had not progressed far enough for the matter of individual differences to be raised in any serious way. Adam, according to Genesis, was not asked by God whether he had the natural qualifications of a farmer; he was simply told to till the earth.

In the New Testament the subject is treated by Our Lord in the Parable of the Talents, wherein Christ suggests that all of His followers should use the period of waiting before the Parousia by putting to work the endowments God has given them for the direct increase of His glory.<sup>60</sup> The implications of the parable are drawn in Peake's Commentary: "Gifts that are not employed are lost; capacity is extirpated by disuse. The real reward... is a place in the Kingdom...and as the two-talent man gets the same guerdon as the five-talent man, it is not a question of much or little, but of loyal purpose and honest endeavour."<sup>61</sup>

The modern English word "talent" actually has some roots in the Greek talanton, which meant not only a coin but also "that which is weighed out or apportioned to one".<sup>62</sup> The Peake Commentary follows the customary metaphorical interpretation of talent as gift, endowment or inner capacity. The parable itself

---

60. Matthew 25:14-30.

61. Peake's Commentary, in loc. (A.J. Grieve).

62. Liddell and Scott, Greek-English Lexicon (abridged), 1929.

gives weight to the interpretation by suggesting that the talents were distributed "to each according to his ability". Christ frequently used figures of speech in his parables. The metaphor is certainly preferable to the literal interpretation of eighteenth and nineteenth-century Puritan capitalists, who held the parable to be a simple statement of business policy, and who justified their unconcern for the poor on the "Biblical" basis of "to him that hath shall be given".

Three rather full discussions of the nature of individual differences are found in the letters of Paul.<sup>63</sup> As a whole his attitude is similar to that expressed in the Parable of the Talents, though Paul goes into far greater detail, and he adds a new and highly important factor: the variety of spiritual gifts. By using the term "diversities of gifts" rather than Plato's "diversities of natures", Paul seems to be dealing with a different set of attributes altogether, but the appearance is deceptive. Some of his catalogues of "gifts of Grace" or "gifts of the Spirit" are indeed limited to liturgical functions, or to a charismatic type of gift such as prophesying, interpreting, miracle-working or healing. Yet Paul does not hesitate to include genuine Vocations such as teaching, pastoral work, missionary activity, evangelism, stewardship and care of the unfortunate; and he strongly suggests that some are better fitted than others for these tasks by virtue of being so gifted. "Grace was given to each of us according to the measure (metron) of Christ's gift. . . And his gifts were that some should be apos-

---

63. Romans 12:6-8; I Corinthians 12:4-7; Ephesians 4:7-13.



ties, some prophets" etc.<sup>64</sup> "Each has his own special gift from God, one of one kind and one of another."<sup>65</sup>

Paul believed therefore in the reality of individual differences among workers, and he explained it on the basis of "gifts" or "calling", which terms he sometimes used interchangeably. In their commentary on Romans, Sanday and Headlam maintain that what Paul considers spiritual gifts are in a sense the natural distinctions between individuals. "St. Paul's meaning is: By natural endowments, strengthened with the gifts of the Spirit, you have various powers and capacities: in the use of these it is above all necessary for the good of the community that you should show a wise and prudent judgement, not attempting offices or work for which you are not fitted, nor marring your gifts by exercising them in a wrong spirit."<sup>66</sup> Dodd's commentary similarly refers to the gifts in Romans 12 as "individual abilities and faculties", and "special talents".<sup>67</sup> In his book Christian Vocation Norman Blow concludes from the passage that "everything we call our own (except our sins) comes from God, and is the endowment which we are to use for the furtherance of the Kingdom...this includes our natural gifts (as we call them) of energy, intelligence, artistic or other capabilities forming the raw material which through faith we offer to God to be moulded. . . The Christian must therefore...know himself, and...face the facts of his character and capabilities."<sup>68</sup>

---

64. Ephesians 4:7, 11.

65. I Corinthians 7:7.

66. Sanday and Headlam, Romans (ICC), 358-9.

67. Dodd, The Epistle of Paul to the Romans (MC), 195.

68. Blow, Christian Vocation, 46-7.

The use of the term "natural" in connection with Paul's concept of gifts would appear to be justified, with respect at least to some of the gifts, by the arguments cited, and by the fact that Paul is quite certain that his own gifts and Calling were established even before his birth.<sup>69</sup> It may be significant, too, that when Paul wishes to describe the functions of the various gifts he adopts similes of natural behavior, such as the body and its members.

As was indicated in Chapter II, the problem of individual differences did not arise in the thinking of the medieval or Reformation Church in any significant way. Thomas Aquinas recognized that there were "different aptitudes for different occupations among different men", and ascribed the diversification to natural causes.<sup>70</sup> Since his day the Church has labored under the supposition that the ecclesiastical functions of man are more important than his natural functions as an individual. The Church accordingly dropped the matter of innate gifts and capacities into the lap of secular society, where things lay undisturbed until the nineteenth century. Occasionally a protest arose from some isolated secular source, and at rare intervals even a Christian voice was lifted, as when Francis Bacon wistfully wrote, "They are happy men whose natures sort with their vocations."<sup>71</sup> But an acquisitive society had little time for such details.

---

69. Galatians 1:15. The idea of natural gifts may also have played a part in the construction of I Corinthians 7:20 with its counsel to "abide in one's calling".

70. See p. 25.

71. Essay "Of Nature in Men".

The reaction came in the nineteenth century. As a modern Marxist describes it:

From Plato to Robert Owen the best minds of humanity had dreamed of a new society, a new attitude to life which should allow man his greatest individual freedom, a development which would give room for him to employ his faculties in endless creation, give him his full status in the world... Their dreams had remained unrealized because... the vast majority of men and women (had to) remain slaves to the very machines which human genius had created for the domination of matter. Freedom was the privilege only of a tiny group. But a revolt of the slaves could clear the way for the development of a new life.<sup>72</sup>

For Karl Marx the question of individual differences was interwoven with the economic issue of the division of labor, and for that reason it becomes necessary, before proceeding further, to conduct another brief excursus into history.

#### b. The Division of Labor.

The only division of labor that primitive society knew existed between the sexes. By and large the occupations of men were hunting, fishing and fighting; those of women were cooking, dressmaking and agriculture.<sup>73</sup> Occasional specialists appeared, such as the medicine man, and as man developed new arts and industries it became customary for the son to follow in his father's craft. The division of labor among the ancient Hebrews was autocratic and patriarchal, and showed traces of Egyptian influence. Few Hebrews attempted to rise above the occupational level of their forefathers, and the situation was viewed with satisfaction by the writers of Prov-

---

72. Fox, Lenin, A Biography, 304.

73. Macdonald, A Scheme of Vocational Guidance for Use in an Educational Area, 1939.

erbs and Ecclesiasticus.

Plato in his Republic made the first scientific study of society from the point of view of the division of labor. But Plato's ideas remained theoretical for over two thousand years, while Greek, Roman and medieval civilizations worked out an abysmal division of labor based on the slave and the freeman.

Our Lord participated in the economic specialization of the day by learning the trade of a carpenter. He did not discuss the division of labor as such, but did something far more significant: He established the principle of social cohesion. That concept is most clearly set forth in the discourse on the Vine and the branches<sup>74</sup> which, of course, has affinities with Paul's doctrine of the Body of Christ.

Paul was not interested, as Plato was, in the organizing of an ideal civic state; but within the society that Paul knew best, namely the Church, he employed a division of labor carefully constructed around the person of the risen Christ. Using the analogy of the human body, he explains, "For as in one body we have many members, and all the members do not have the same function, so we, though many, are one body in Christ and individually members one of another. Having gifts that differ according to the grace given to us, let us use them..."<sup>75</sup> The social integration Paul sought was as complete and thorough as that which nature achieved in the body of man. No modern planner ever presented a more explicit theory of social utility than

---

74. John 15: 1-14.

75. Romans 12:4-6 (ARSV).



Paul did to the primitive Church: "We are to grow up in every way into him who is the head, into Christ, from whom the whole body, joined and knit together by every joint with which it is supplied, when each part is working properly, makes bodily growth and upbuilds itself in love."<sup>76</sup>

The division of labor Paul recommended on the basis of the differentiation of function was actually implemented in the Church, and became the basis of its future organization. But the idea of "gifts" became more and more theoretical with the centuries, so that individual differences came to mean as little in the Church Vocations as in the distribution of occupations in the outside world.

The rise of capitalism brought about a change in the division of labor from that which existed under feudalism, but at least two factors kept the new bourgeois society from making much improvement on the old division of labor. One was the rise of industrialism; the other was the adoption of the economic philosophy classically expounded by Adam Smith. For it was Adam Smith's conviction that the division of labor is founded not on native differences in individuals, nor on the scientific assessment of society's proper needs, but rather upon what he called "the propensity in human nature to barter".<sup>77</sup> The bartering was motivated by the selfish instincts of the individual. Thus instead of conceiving of human personality in terms of proper function, as Paul did when planning the Christian community, Adam Smith conceived of it purely in terms of self-

---

76. Ephesians 4:15-16. (ARSV)

77. Adam Smith, The Wealth of Nations, I, 15.

regard, and based his socio-economic theory upon the acquisitive instinct. As the capitalist economy expanded, the native capacities of millions of individuals got no chance to develop. For them the idea of the secular Calling became a mockery. Some protests arose among secular writers over the misfit problem;<sup>78</sup> but by the time the industrial revolution had become established, it was too late to alter the social structure in order to bring the human factor into the division of labor.

When the nineteenth century revolt came, Karl Marx declared that the division of labor had become identical with private property; that it implied unequal distribution both of labor and its products; and that it lay therefore at the root of all class struggles. He proposed that the existing rigid division of labor be abolished in the communist society. Marx could logically recommend such a course of action because he had accepted the thesis of Robert Owen that human nature was universally plastic and could be molded and conditioned at will by its environment. In Marx' words, "Nobody has one exclusive sphere of activity but each can become accomplished in any branch he wishes."<sup>79</sup>

The result of the new arrangement was to be that each individual would have "the opportunity to develop and exercise all his faculties, physical and mental, in all directions", so that "productive labour will become a pleasure instead of a burden".<sup>80</sup> Lenin carried the point a step farther and looked forward "to the education, training and preparation of people who will have ver-

---

78. See p. 61.

79. Marx, The German Ideology, 22; cf. Sir A. Gray, The Socialist Tradition, 204-5, 306, 325, 478.

80. Engels, Anti-Duhring, 322.

satile development and versatile training, people who will be able to do everything".<sup>81</sup> In the communist future the toilers will be "able to show themselves, to develop their capabilities, find out their talents, which have an inexhaustible source in the people, and which capitalism has held back, suppressed, stifled in thousands and millions of people".<sup>82</sup>

It should be noticed that in all the flourishing growth that is to be, no mention is made of the use of native capacities. Marxism does not believe in native capacities. The "talents" and "capabilities" Lenin speaks of are to be found in everybody in equal or approximately equal amounts; what appears to be "more" or "less" is just the result of social (i.e. capitalist) conditioning. Thus Viteles, who studied the vocational guidance programs in Moscow and other Russian cities for two years, found that when the psychologists began to measure scientifically the varying abilities of individuals, they stirred up an ideological row. Their tests were discredited and they were forced to "confess" their "error", for the official view taken was that such measurements have "tended artificially to perpetuate 'class differences' by stamping certain children as incapable of benefiting with others from the opportunities available in the Soviet Union".<sup>83</sup>

Modern Marxists have accepted wholeheartedly the dictum of J. B. Watson, founder of behaviorist psychology, that "there is no such thing as an inheritance of capacity, talent, temperament, mental constitution and characteristics."<sup>84</sup> Everything Plato,

---

81. Lenin, "Left-Wing" Communism, 33; Little Lenin Library No. 16.  
 82. Speech of Lenin, Jan. 1918, quoted in Fox, op.cit., 306.  
 83. Keller and Viteles, op.cit., 240n.  
 84. Watson, Behaviorism, 74 ff.

Paul, Thomas Aquinas and others mentioned in the foregoing pages have stated about the value of individual gifts is therefore irrelevant both to the Marxist and to the behaviorist. But are such extreme attitudes consonant with the facts? Psychologists and responsible scientists generally have repudiated the Watsonian claim that "there is nothing from within to develop". Allport, a trait psychologist whose views generally are moderate, believes that "no feature of personality is devoid of hereditary influences"; and that while environmental conditioning is admittedly of vast importance, it can hardly account for the structural differences to be found, for example, in glands.<sup>85</sup>

If the behaviorist claims are unacceptable to most scientists, as is admitted, one may well ask why the assumptions of Marxists about the nature of individual differences should be any more sacrosanct. A Marxist writer makes the assertion that "the economic environment furnishes the influence which is all-important in shaping the character of human habits, thoughts and institutions".<sup>86</sup> Christian teaching, with many more years of experience, suggests that there are elements in human personality which cannot be accounted for by social or economic conditions. It is worth asking at this point whether the prophet Micah got his ethics from the corrupt society around him, or Marx his sense of justice from the injustices of the western European capitalism in which he grew up.

There is no need for the faith to take up the cudgels for

---

<sup>85</sup>. Allport, Personality, 103-4.

<sup>86</sup>. B. Schoenfeldt, Social Objectives in Soviet Education, quoted in Keller and Viteles, op.cit., 223.



heredity as against environment, but there is need to emphasize that individual differences of temperament and capability are indeed deeply ingrained, far more than is appreciated by those who would facilely change everything from without by commissar methods.

Individual differences are important to Christians for many reasons, but the particular reason in view here is that if the inherent capacity has a validity of its own, then it may well be looked upon by Christians as a gift from God; and if it be so understood, then it may be used in turn as the basis for adapting and reconstructing the concept of Christian Vocation for today. The task of discerning the individual's gifts and measuring his capacities will then provide a natural meeting ground for Christian faith and scientific method in a program of Christian vocational guidance.

The presence within us of given innate qualities imparts to personality some of its claim to sacredness. Leaving aside the question of evil, the Call of God may be said to be heard in part in the way He designed us. We are at least on the way to finding out God's will for our lives when we discover what He made us able to do.<sup>87</sup> But if we are (as the Marxists claim) merely the pawns of our environment, the picture is changed. God's influence upon us can then only be studied as it is mediated through the world around us. This world is in constant flux and is so played upon by human passions and "neutral circumstances" that the hand of the Creator in our conditioning is often difficult to discern.

---

87. A remark frequently made by Ligon. See p. 134 n.

In any event, under a thoroughgoing environmentalism such as Marx proposes there could be no development of our "inexhaustible resources" (the phrase is Lenin's), for self-development involves freedom of choice, and there is no real freedom for those who are only the victims of circumstance.<sup>88</sup>

Nevertheless the Christian cannot commit himself wholly to the principle of individualism while he considers himself one of the branches of the Vine. Individualism has run rampant in the past, producing German "supermen" and American multi-millionaires with disastrous social results for which the penalty is still being paid. When Goethe declared that "nature appears to have planned everything with a view to individuality",<sup>89</sup> he was only stating part of the truth. The other part is that the glory of nature's individuality can only be appreciated within a framework of order and control.

Where then can the Christian take his stand? He cannot proclaim simply the gospel of individualism, as in the words of one of Howard Spring's characters: "What I want to do is to enjoy life...by working at the one thing on God's earth that (I) feel worth while...I'm not a planner. I'm not going to pretend that I know what I want to do. I only know what I don't want to do."<sup>90</sup>

Christians may sympathize with such a reaction, but it offers

---

88. The correct Marxist reply would be that under a communist society the people would be, in Marx' own words, the masters of circumstances. Such an answer fails to conceal the fact that a society which believes in "the extended modifiability of human behavior" must continue to deprive man of freedom in order to condition him; and without freedom man is still victim rather than master of circumstance. Given freedom, he may by selection and rejection act upon and partly mold his environment. (Cf. Temple, Nature, Man and God, 227-9; Earle, Psychology and the Choice of a Career, 2.

89. "Die Natur scheint Alles auf Individualität angelegt zu haben."

90. Spring, There is No Armour, 564-5.

no real solution to anything. A society in which individual men and women did nothing but enjoy life by "developing their own inner capacities" without regard to the social whole, would be intolerably chaotic even with machines to take over the routine work.

At the opposite extreme is the equally intolerable society in which persons as such have no meaning, but are rather measured in terms of their contribution or social function. E. H. Carr concludes his scholarly biography of Karl Marx with a summary that lays bare the impersonalism of Marx' logic as he studied the future of mechanized society.

Marx understood that, in the new order, the individual would play a minor part. Individualism implies differentiation; everything that is undifferentiated does not count. The industrial revolution would place in power the undifferentiated mass. Not man but mass-man, not the individual but the class, not man the political animal but man the social animal, would be the unit of the coming dispensation. Not only industry, but the whole of civilization, would become a matter of mass-production.<sup>91</sup>

The Christian answer to the problem of the individual is neither the concept of individual man nor the concept of collective man; rather it is the idea of the fellow-man.<sup>92</sup> The principle of love for one's neighbor as for oneself, which is the basis of Christian ethics, leads to the middle ground which alone offers hope of a solution. Individual differences and capacities in human beings can serve society properly only as they are redeemed by the Spirit of Christ into the common life of man. Freedom is

---

<sup>91</sup>. Carr, Karl Marx, 302.

<sup>92</sup>. Cf. Oldham, Work in Modern Society, 41; Barth, Die Kirchliche Dogmatik, Dritter Band, Zweiter Teil, 273.

found not in licence but in permanent self-determination by the love of God and neighbor.<sup>93</sup> But Christ died not just for individuals but for the whole world, which means that society as a whole must now more than ever feel the transforming power of His redemption if mass-man is not to destroy the purpose of individuality, and if Gheorghiu's menacing "citizens" are not to take the place of persons. The heart of Christian social teaching is found in the parable of the Vine and the branches, and its corollary, the image of the Body of Christ. They furnish the raw material out of which a cohesive and workable social order may be built even in a machine age. They are the source of the differentiation of function among neither individuals nor mass humanity, but among fellow-men.

A final word should be added to make it clear that no reflection is intended on the obvious value of conditioning, training and growth. The Christian Church believes in gifts, yet it also believes in the molding power of environment. It seeks to create a favorable environment for all men in which character can be changed and transformed through faith.<sup>94</sup> But it has not believed that the deep, innate aptitudes, abilities and gifts which have distinguished men and women from each other since pre-historic times, are susceptible to easy manipulation. Gifts may indeed be "extirpated by disuse", but that is a long way from saying that they are equally distributed by nature so that "anybody can do anything".

Individual differences will be dealt with in succeeding

---

93. Cf. Ritschl, J & R, 293.

94. J. Oman, Concerning the Ministry, 9-10.



pages only from a functional point of view. Yet the question of their existence had to come before there could be any discussion of vocational functioning. For if the concept of individual differences based on natural gifts is false, then the Church is describing as a "creation of God" what is primarily the creation of man, namely, the interaction of man and his environment. Such a view makes nonsense of the doctrine of the Calling; or rather, more accurately, the Calling is abolished. For man as a disobedient creature (to speak Biblically) and as a reacting organism (to speak psychologically) simply cannot "call" himself. Men can and do call each other, but the "call of duty" and the "call to arms" serve human ends which require no divine summons for their attainment. The need and the possibility of a Creator and Caller only become apparent when we are perceived to have been made in certain unique ways, which require to be called into full activity. The "human factor" of individual differences requires careful study in order that it may contribute to the adaptation of the Christian concept of Vocation to modern life.<sup>95</sup>

- 
95. Highly interesting efforts are currently being made in America to isolate innate individual differences. The experimenters are not all engaged in pure research; at least two groups are seeking to couple their work with occupational guidance and adjustment.

At Union College, Schenectady, N.Y., Ligon is conducting a "Character Research Project" which cooperates with several Church Schools in seeking to combine scientific principles with the Sermon on the Mount for purposes of character training. Ligon has followed Allport in personality trait theory, and has built a profile listing 59 such traits. Among them are four groups which he calls special aptitudes. ("A special aptitude is defined as an innate ability which shows individual differences and does not depend directly on any other ability.") The four aptitudes are: imagination, artistic ability, musical aptitude and mechanical ability. Ligon also refers to these groups as "natural endowments" and "gifts of God". He prefers however not to deal in abstract or metaphysical terms: "Character traits have no real (See next page)

### III. Efforts Toward Adapting the Concept of Vocation.

An upsurge of interest in the concept of Christian Vocation has been apparent in recent years among groups of quite varied theological outlook. As a result many different proposals for adaptation of the doctrine have been put forward. Some theologians have emphasized the more philosophical aspects of the Calling, some the more spiritual. Others have confined their discussion to the problems of modern work, while still others have preferred to excise the spiritual element and remove the Caller from the Calling. Before proceeding to a formulation in Chapter IV it will be profitable to consider the above four attitudes in turn.

---

(cont. from preceding page) meaning except in terms of the personalities possessing them." Many personality traits are, he considers, simply combinations of habits and specific attitudes, which can be altered by the processes of learning. (Their Future is Now, ix-x, 50; The Psychology of Christian Personality, 119-20, 155-7.)

In New York City a quite different approach to individual differences has been made by the Human Engineering Laboratory, founded by Mr. Johnson O'Connor. "The Laboratory's research began (in 1922) by trying to learn what jobs required inborn abilities, and then trying to determine a means of measuring these talents...Seventeen aptitudes, which are believed to be true ones, have been isolated and can be measured with reasonable accuracy." The aptitudes are: Personality (Objective or Subjective), accounting, ideaphoria or creative imagination, structural visualization, inductive and analytical reasoning, finger dexterity, tweezer dexterity, observation, memory for design, tonal memory, pitch discrimination, number memory, eye dominance, proportional appraisal, grip, visual imagination or intellectual vision, and tapping. (C.V. and M.E. Broadley, Know Your Real Abilities, 1-14; J. O'Connor, The Unique Individual, 164-5.)

Practical efforts at isolating and measuring the more tangible individual differences, such as the "human engineers" have made, have much to commend them, but it is possible that more fruitful results will ultimately come from the research in individual types carried on by Eduard Spranger, C.G. Jung, E. Kretschmer and W.H. Sheldon. These psychologists have all made classifications of human beings which penetrate deeper than the surface aptitudes, thus doing more justice to the uniqueness of personality and approximating more nearly Paul's concept of "spiritual gifts".

## 1. The Emergence of a Vocational Ethic.

In his Gifford Lectures Archbishop William Temple declared that "the solution of the outstanding problems of Ethics is to be sought in terms neither of Utilitarianism however ideal, nor of Intuitionism, but of Vocation".<sup>96</sup> He thus indicated that the term Vocation has still another meaning: in the field of philosophy and ethics it connotes divine guidance in the tasks of duty. The great value of Vocation so understood is that it helps to clarify the Christian solution to man's ethical dilemma as expressed in the words, "What ought I to do?" The idea of the Calling provides a vocational ethic which is peculiarly adapted to the modern mood, but whose value is yet recognized by only a few Christian thinkers.

The crisis in ethics today has not been caused simply by loss of faith, but also by misunderstanding of faith. The rigid Kantian ethic with its categorical imperative and its moral principles served well enough perhaps in the nineteenth century, though prophets such as Kierkegaard, Nietzsche and Marx saw its structural weakness. In the twentieth century world conditions have helped to make such words as "duty" and "honor" relative, while "righteousness" has disappeared into the vocabulary of theology. The abandonment of interest in Kantian or Puritan (or, as Marx would say, bourgeois) moral principles led twentieth century man to seek a new basis for ethical action. The search ended in a rank forest growth of utilitarian, opportunistic and prudential morality, best symbolized by the proverb, "Honesty is the best policy". Utilitarianism is now the chief system of ethics

---

<sup>96</sup>. Temple, Nature, Man and God, 407.



taught in many American state universities. It asks not that an action be "good" either in essence or in relation to other persons, but only that it be useful. All "duties" are reduced to the one duty of producing utility values, and the problem of relating principle and circumstance is solved by making the principle not a principle at all, but a method.

Between the Scylla of a legalistic set of moral principles and the Charybdis of a relativism with no principle, there stands the vocational ethic. "Duty," in Forrester's words, "is relative to vocation. Vocation differentiates duty, and the varieties of duty explain the differences of conscience."<sup>97</sup> The Calling relates principle to circumstance by revealing the will of God in the "existential moment"; that is, in the concrete, particular moment in which we are living. The Call with which God calls us to act is personal and it is contemporary; it comes not from any law or principle that can be known beforehand, but from the free, sovereign God Himself.<sup>98</sup>

To the continental thinkers of the Barthian school and to their predecessor Kierkegaard is due the credit for the theological conditioning necessary for the rise of a vocational ethic. Barth rejected the "ethics of conscience" which he found prevalent in modern theology, substituting an "ethics of Grace". Thus the Christian's ethical life is lived, according to Barth, not by the moral law but by the fact that "in the existential moment when the Word of God reaches us in Justification and Sanctifi-

---

97. Forrester, Cunningham Lectures, 1950, I; also personal letter dated Sept. 9, 1950.

98. Cf. Brunner, DI, 83.



cation, it discovers to us also the problem of our neighbour."<sup>99</sup> Brunner brings the idea of the Calling into the "ethics of Grace", so that the Good consists in doing what God calls us to do at any particular moment.

Both Barth and Brunner pour scorn on those who regard the reform of life as a principle, and who condemn others from a sense of moral indignation but without any prophetic Vocation. The "professional" reformer, says Brunner, "feels himself called upon to 'clean up' these places within the world before he can decide to live in them himself, and finally this 'cleaning up' process becomes to him life itself." Brunner points out that the "idea of the Calling" on the other hand "makes us free from all feverish haste, from bitterness, and from the--finally inevitable--hopeless resignation of the reformer; at the same time it keeps the door open for me to undertake such reforming work when it is the duty appointed to me in the exercise of my particular 'office'."<sup>100</sup>

There is a definite appeal to the modern mood in the words of the Swiss theologians. Even Christians are weary of trying to maintain the reality of moral principles in the face of the blistering assaults of relativism. Dr. Oldham urged at the Dollarbeg Conference on Work that "we put Christian principles on the shelf for awhile and stay on the job of the immediate problem". Upon being questioned he gave his opinion that there were only two basic Christian principles, to love God and one's neighbor;

---

99. Barth, Römerbrief (4th ed.), 478-9; cf. McConnachie, Significance of Karl Barth, 212-17.

100. Brunner, op.cit., 202-3; cf. Barth, op.cit., 493.

that to add even such principles as freedom and responsibility would only distract attention from our own instant situation by bringing in a philosophical argument. One can use one's body of experience, Dr. Oldham believed, to good advantage only if it has not hardened into a set of principles that are always more or less irrelevant to the issue at hand.<sup>101</sup>

The true value of a vocational ethic then lies in a fact which both Paul and Luther seem to have understood: that it can secure the conscience in the performance of duty without stooping to rationalization or compromise, and yet without forcing an artificial withdrawal from the world. Duty seen in this light becomes duty to God in the best sense.<sup>102</sup> Because the concept of the Calling is rooted in God and His redemptive love in Christ, it becomes "the natural connecting link between dogmatics and ethics".<sup>103</sup> And because God's Call is to action now, in the uniqueness of the moment, the vocational ethic is always fresh, always relevant, always adaptive to the needs of the present.<sup>104</sup>

Archbishop Temple has indicated the way in which "vocational guidance" (here used for once in a proper sense) is available for the Christian: by a man's "considering with sufficient thoroughness his own nature and his circumstances", "by the

---

101. Lecture, Nov. 1, 1950

102. See page 33; cf. I Corinthians 1:26-31, Romans 14:7-10.

103. N.H.G. Robinson, The Place of Vocation in Christian Ethics, in Theology, May, 1950, 172.

104. It might be objected that the vocational ethic is really only another way of drugging the conscience. Thus a prison guard, it could be claimed, would seek to ease his feelings of guilt by telling himself that God, who has called him to his post of duty, forced him therewith to torture his prisoners. But torture in such case would be a direct violation of the Gospel principle "love thy neighbor" which, as Dr. Oldham suggests, is still valid.

ordinary exercise of a mind which has in prayer committed itself to the divine guidance", and by "a conscious communion of the mind with God".<sup>105</sup> N. H. G. Robinson has shown further how badly the Christian world stands in need of a vocational ethic. For in Church history the Christian life has usually been portrayed "as a succession of duties or as an accumulation of virtues and graces or as both". Robinson asks, "If the idea of obedience to God and that of love are each inadequate to express the task of Christian discipleship, may it not be that the idea of vocation more truly meets the case?"<sup>106</sup> For Vocation suggests something given (God's Call, which invokes all of man's experience and resourcefulness) plus something variable, namely the pressures and problems of the immediate moment.

There is no doubt that in the fields of philosophy and ethics the concept of Vocation will play an increasing role as Christians reinterpret the meaning of the Good for our day. Such development is needed to undergird the efforts of the non-theologically-minded to make coherent Christian decisions in everyday life with a conscience free from the harassments of anxiety.<sup>107</sup>

## 2. Withdrawal to a Religious View of the Calling.

Within the Roman Catholic Church, as has been noted, the traditional concept of the religious vocation is very much alive.

---

105. Temple, op. cit., 408.

106. Robinson, op. cit., 175.

107. A vocational ethic would explain Christian's behavior in abandoning his wife and children, as related in A Pilgrim's Progress, and thus answer a long-standing moralistic charge against Bunyan's hero. Applications of this ethic to other problems of behavior (e.g. Biblical polygamy and modern pacifism) will be found in Forrester's forthcoming volume, The Call and the Calling.

The same may be said for the Church of England, whose various orders rest on the doctrine of vocatio. Such revivals of interest in this doctrine as may take place are outside the scope of the thesis.<sup>108</sup> Protestant Christianity has also maintained steadfastly a spiritual view of the Calling as classically formulated by the Westminster Confession's statements on "effectual Calling". If the Reformed churches have on occasion slackened their emphasis upon the Christian Calling as shared by all believers, there have been Lutheran churches and evangelistic sects which have never allowed the concept to be dissociated from the other basic theological teachings such as redemption, justification, conversion and sanctification. The "high calling of God in Christ Jesus" continues to be one of the most popular expressions in expository preaching.

Calvin did not successfully link the spiritual doctrine of the Calling to his theory of dividing labor into "callings", and his failure is reflected in the Westminster Confession, where the sacred and the secular Calling are treated separately. In such an age as our own, when neo-orthodoxy has arisen to challenge the secularizing trends in the churches, it might be expected that a reaction would develop, and that there would be a swing to the traditionally evangelical as opposed to the "worldly" view of the Calling. That change is in fact taking place. It is not uncommon to find contemporary statements such as: "Our Christian vocation is primarily to receive the gift of God..."

---

108. Attention may be called to two Anglican works, Called of God by Lucius Cary and The Religious Vocation by R.M. Benson, published in 1937 and 1939, respectively, by Mowbray, London.



therefore it is one vocation for all."<sup>109</sup> Or to quote another: "The man or woman of the world may choose a career. The Christian realises a divine vocation. . . The only choice in respect of such a vocation is between response and refusal. . . Outside of this (divine) plan, anyone is a misfit."<sup>110</sup>

Emil Brunner, the Swiss theologian, appears to have changed his views somewhat on the subject of the Calling, as compared with his earlier writings. The following statements made in the summer of 1950 indicate his new position:

I do not think that Luther's idea of Vocation will stand up today. It has used up its blood. I realize that I am partly responsible for reviving it, but I am afraid that it will not do in our highly technical, industrialized society.

The fact is, the earlier Pauline concept of vocation is more truly built on the whole concept of Christ--the idea that we are called to be Christian. This is independent of function.

The trouble with the common concept of vocation is that it doesn't mean very much. You can't bring it down to earth, to every day work. You say to a man on an assembly line, "This is your vocation"--it means nothing. But give him a vocation as a Christian, a missionary at his work and everywhere, maintaining a home, living in the community--that is something. A calling to be a Christian, to evangelize and make other Christians--this I think is where the vocational emphasis has got to come.

The human comes first, of course, for you cannot evangelize unless you are a person; in fact it is important just to have a calling to be human, dealing out humanity to others and seeking to live a decent life. I don't think we can revive the concept of vocation in the present world except in the human-evangelistic emphasis.<sup>111</sup>

Perhaps the most significant phrase in the statement is:

"Give him a vocation as a Christian, a missionary at his work

---

109. N.H.G. Robinson, op.cit., 172.

110. Rowland Hogben, Vocation, 13, 28.

111. From notes of interview with the writer, June 6, 1950, at Zürich.

and everywhere, maintaining a home, living in the community...a calling to be a Christian, to evangelize and make other Christians..." If this suggestion is related to the discovery made earlier in the chapter, that the modern worker gets his greatest work satisfactions out of his relationship to the informal group with which he is engaged on a common task, then a provocative truth comes to light. The place of work appears to offer a field of evangelism that is unrivalled. The witness on the job becomes more significant when it is seen that the Christian's social contacts are considered vitally important to production itself. And since the contacts are so important--whether for production or in themselves--the need for Christian lay workers with a sense of mission, a Calling to win souls to Christ, seems one of the immediate imperatives facing the Church.

Brunner's suggestion that Christians go back to the Pauline doctrine of the Calling is not just a retreat from the world into conservatism. Paul, as has been noted, did not set forth his doctrine simply as a call to holiness and separateness. He considered the Call to be an active assignment to a life mission.<sup>112</sup> And no doctrine of Vocation in the modern age will get beyond the stage of platitude unless it recognizes the sense of mission as the yoke of every Christian. We are called to share the good news, and missionary opportunities are a part of our Vocation.

If all that were needed had now been said, the problem of the thesis would be solved. No more attention would need to be paid to modern work, since the Calling would be independent of function.

---

<sup>112</sup>. See p. 17.

vocational guidance could well be left to the state. Unfortunately it is not so simple. Most Christians for example cannot make tents and evangelize intermittently, as Paul seems to have done. Whether or not they feel called to be itinerant preachers, most people must stick to the tent-making or mimeographing for fifty weeks a year, and they want to find some reason for their work besides "maintaining a home". They want to discover meaning in the work itself, and if Christianity cannot supply that meaning, there are other ideologies that can. If it is no longer possible to sweep a room and call it "divine drudgery" (as in George Herbert's verse)<sup>113</sup> then Lenin can give the sweeper a doctrine of work. If cows cannot be milked or drill presses operated to the glory of God, the toiler will find the people's revolution eager to dignify and even to glorify his efforts.

The only tool that Christianity has for the interpretation of human labor is a doctrine of Vocation that has become rusty with disuse. If we discard the tool, we abandon the field of which Christ said, "My father worketh hitherto, and I work."<sup>114</sup> Christians cannot extract the evangelistic content out of the Calling and then discard the rest as worthy only of the "world", hence of perdition. We have no warrant to burn the soup, neglect the chores, "soldier" at our work and then hand out tracts, and thereby consider that we have been fulfilling our Vocation. Our warrant is rather to sharpen the tool and put it to use for the redemption of the worker and the toil itself.

There is another reason why Vocation cannot be divorced from

---

113. Church Hymnary, Rev. ed., No. 511.

114. John 5:17 (AV).

life work. Life invariably produces a small group of persons--artists, statesmen, geniuses--whose endowments are so obvious and so magnificent that spiritual persons of whatever creed insist on linking their noblest efforts to the Creator God. To millions of Christians Luther was called to cleanse the Church; music-lovers are certain that Bach was called to his composing; humanitarians say that Madison was called to draft the American constitution, and Florence Nightingale called to found the nursing profession; Churchill is believed by much of the western world to have been called to lead an empire through crisis. Even if the persons themselves do not, after the manner of Joan of Arc, proclaim their own assurance of Calling, those who have rejoiced in their achievements thrust the sense of Vocation upon them. Under such conditions it makes little difference whether theologians try to restrict the doctrine of the Calling to a narrow sphere. The world--including the Christian world--simply will not have it so.

### 3. Adaptation by Emphasis upon Work.

A third and perhaps more typically modern way in which the effort to adapt has been made, is the current movement to dignify labor. If, in the new emphasis on the spiritual side of the Calling, there is little attempt being made to give meaning to daily work, we are now faced with quite an opposite tendency. For many contemporary Christian writers are grappling with the problem of Vocation on an activist level. Vocation is work, it is service, it is toil, it is creative endeavor. The classic statement of this position is found in Alexander Miller: "The man most like Christ is the man who is faithful to God in his own calling as



Christ was faithful in His." Christ was called to preach, but other Christians are called to pilot ships or trim hedges. The emphasis is upon "the place to which God calls us," which, though 'it be the most humdrum of occupations, can yet have a "high and holy meaning...provided it is directed to the common good."<sup>115</sup>

Miller and the other Christian writers invariably posit God as the One to Whom the worker's efforts should ultimately be devoted. Thus Miss Dorothy Sayers has written that "the work should serve God, and man should serve the work." Yet characteristically the emphasis is usually upon the latter phrase, for the object in view is to penetrate the factory with a doctrine of Vocation that has utility value. To quote Miss Sayers again, "The very first demand that (an intelligent carpenter's) religion makes upon him is that he should make good tables."<sup>116</sup> W. G. Symons, a Christian economist, writes, "Vocation...is concerned first of all with the purpose of the job; and secondly with the worker's suitability for it."<sup>117</sup> In the opinion of an American Quaker, Elton Trueblood, the Church should "preach the principle of vocation in season and out of season" because "the chief way to serve the Lord is in our daily work."<sup>118</sup>

All of these statements have a certain claim on the truth. To be sure the Christian carpenter must turn out good tables, providing he has the skill and the materials. All of our daily work should serve the Lord--if that is possible. The trouble is that

---

<sup>115</sup>. Miller, Christian Vocation in the Contemporary World, 29.

<sup>116</sup>. Creed or Chaos, 58, 64.

<sup>117</sup>. Work and Vocation, 31.

<sup>118</sup>. The Common Ventures of Life, 87.

each of the above statements, like Miller's earlier remark, appears to make a supreme claim not for God, but for the work itself. The carpenter can only conclude that if for some reason it is impossible for him to make good tables, then God cannot be served; hence he has no Vocation. We have arrived at a point very close to a doctrine of salvation by works, the "works" being the quality of the day's output.

These writers and others have investigated the nature of our social fabric with Christian insight; they have clarified the interrelatedness of all our working functions; they have brought out the fact that a good deal of modern work has dignity and divine significance, because it is necessary to the unifying and proper ordering of human life. Yet none of them has succeeded in showing just how the bus conductor or the glass blower's assistant can develop a real sense of Vocation that cuts deeper than the idea of "serving the common good". The reason is that their discussions, so far as can be found, contain no suggestion that a part--probably the most important part--of the Christian Calling is the command to witness to the love of Christ among one's fellow-workers. The Great Commission has never been abrogated; it is as relevant to our Vocation today as in the days when it was first given. The significance of social contacts at work, revealed by the Hawthorne experiments, only underwrites the necessity for seeking to win fellow-toilers to Christ, by spoken word as well as by efficient workmanship.

Miss Sayers tells the Christian leaders, "When you find a man who is a Christian praising God by the excellence of his work--

do not distract him and take him away from his proper vocation to address religious meetings and open church bazaars. Let him serve God in the way to which God has called him."<sup>119</sup> Setting aside the matter of the bazaars, the man who is a good workman as well as a Christian is often the person whose testimony is most effective, whether he is addressing Christians or non-Christians. His words are most apt to carry the ring of integrity and sincerity, whatever his mastery of syntax. He above most others is the one whom God particularly wants to be "ready always to give an answer to every man that asketh".<sup>120</sup> For if the New Testament is to be believed, God has never been satisfied simply with a man's activity in his craftsmanship, even when it is combined with church attendance.<sup>121</sup> If the testimony of the Word is left only to those who are formally called to preach, the Church loses its regenerating power and can produce no Covenanters or Wesleyans. We may be called to different functions in the Church and in the world, but we are all called to a common witness for our Lord.

The Christian then cannot afford to remain simply "faithful in his calling as Christ was in His". The mantle of Christ has fallen upon each one of us, making us His spokesmen. We are called to apostleship as well as discipleship; and any adaptation of the concept of Vocation that leaves out the divine mission to proclaim the good news might better be left unwritten; it is doomed to be drowned in a bath of its own verbiage. The still unanswered question as to how the witness is related to the problem of work,

---

119. Sayers, op.cit., 61.

120. I Peter 3:15.

121. Cf. Romans 10:9-10.

will be left for consideration in the next chapter.

#### 4. Secular Adaptation.

At the end of Chapter II a critique was attempted of the concept of vocational guidance, in which the statement was made that the concept of Vocation which lay behind the vocational guidance movement was completely inadequate for the proper guidance of modern youth toward the choice of life work. Yet it was hardly the fault of the vocational guidance movement that the word Vocation, by the time Frank Parsons wrote his book in 1909, had become thoroughly secularized; and that its Anglo-Saxon equivalent, Calling, was in something very near disgrace as a doctrine of Puritanism.

History has disclosed that Christian writers played no inconspicuous part in helping the process of secularization, whether consciously or unconsciously. Today the impulse toward a secular concept of Vocation continues even among Christians, and forms a handicap to the true spiritual discernment of the meaning of God's Call in the life of man. There are many contributors to this impulse outside of the vocational guidance program. By isolating those contributors it may be possible for the present study to proceed more directly toward its goal.

##### a. Vocation as Social Duty.

All of the writers cited in the previous section--Sayers, Miller, Trueblood, and Symons, as well as T. M. Heron, Philip Mairet, J. H. Oldham and others--have suggested that Vocation is a divine event, whose ultimate source is lost in the mystery of God. They have placed varying stress on the theological aspects of the concept, yet none has sought to deny them or to explain



too facilely the ways of God with man.

Where the vision of God fades in western culture, it often leaves behind a strong sense of duty and morality; and so it is that other writers have emerged who think of Vocation no longer in relation to the divine, but in relation to social obligation. As an example of such an attitude, the "framework of a revised doctrine of vocation for our time" proposed by a New England theological professor, Robert L. Calhoun, may be cited.<sup>122</sup>

Calhoun agrees with Miss Sayers that the basis of Vocation is work. Work is, he says, an insistent and universal requirement which embodies a general call to all men. He sets up three principles to which he says a modern theory of Vocation must conform: (1) "A vocation must...be regarded as a systematic and persistent doing of needful work"; and this "meeting of genuine needs" is more important even than "the desire to please God". (2) "A vocation may be regarded...as an absorbing, inclusive, and purposeful putting forth and development of an individual's own constituent powers." (3) "A vocation should be a willing contributive share in the world's work and the common life."

Calhoun sums up his proposal in these words:

To do needful work, then; to lose oneself and find oneself therein; to participate thus in a common task and a shared life: this, and the summons to it, we shall mean by vocation. Such doctrine professes to begin not with wishes nor with dogmas about God nor about man, with what appear to be facts and likely inferences therefrom.

At the end of his exposition he ventures the opinion that "ultimately" his doctrine of Calling may be regarded as coming

---

<sup>122</sup>. The quotations from Calhoun are from God and the Common Life, 54-9, 71-2; and from God and the Day's Work, 47-53.

"from God".

The view expressed by Calhoun is not essentially different from that stated more succinctly by the missionary statesman John R. Mott: "A need known and the capacity to meet that need: that constitutes a call."<sup>123</sup>

There is no need to spend time in showing why such views of Vocation are even less acceptable than those discussed in the previous section. Everything that has been said in the present work stands in denial of any attempt to equate Vocation with the demands of a secular society for the undertaking of its routine tasks. Vocation is neither duty nor citizenship nor morality, though it may issue in all three. First and last Vocation is a personal, active relationship with God in which God calls and man hears and obeys. A social conscience, however buttressed by Puritan moralism, or pragmatic considerations, cannot substitute itself for that relationship; nor can it pretend to the divine qualities of a Vocation.

#### b. Vocation by Tape-Measure.

Because men have abilities that differ, and because scientists are progressively discovering new ways of measuring those abilities, there is a temptation in our scientifically-minded age to think that even Christian Vocation can be put on a tape-measure. Indeed, some aspects of Vocation, as the next chapter shows, are quite susceptible to scientific measurement--a fact which makes the problem of criticism the more difficult. But danger is present

---

123. Quoted in Miller, CVCW, 59. In the Jan., 1951 issue of the Iona Community Coracle, Miller demands a "critical" and "political" reappropriation of the Reformation doctrine of the Calling which, as he elaborates it, may prove even a more drastic revision than Calhoun's. Mott, despite the above, would not agree with Calhoun (see bibliography).

whenever the suggestion is made that man can, with the aid of scientific mechanisms, "discover" his own Vocation.

The above paragraph would not have been written if such danger did not in fact exist. Liberal Protestant churches in America are now introducing vocational guidance into their Sunday Schools with such statements as the following: "All men and women, as children of God, have missions to fulfil. It is their responsibility to discover what is the will of God for their life work, using every method known to modern science to discover what that will is." Such a claim might be satisfactory enough if placed in a context in which Christian methods are given standing alongside the scientific ones: for example, prayer, worship, Bible study, Christian discussion, pastoral interviews, courses in Christian Vocation, etc. Taken by itself it is hopelessly inadequate.

Scientific method will tell a man "how God made him" and will acquaint him with the conditions of employment, and thus provide a rational basis for making an occupational or even a vocational choice; but as Ligon, the American pioneer in Christian vocational guidance, has recognized, rationalism is insufficient when one is dealing with God. William Temple points out that "His call is sometimes to self-sacrifice as well as to self-fulfilment."<sup>124</sup> And even if it be claimed that such sacrifice is really self-fulfilment after all (thus Jesus at the Cross), the fact remains that God in history has appeared to extend the most "irrational" Calls to men, starting with Abraham. Further, God has apparently

---

<sup>124</sup>. Temple, Christianity and Social Order, 69.

included the capacity to respond along with the Call.

The scientific method is an important tool for discovering one's interests and native endowments, but not for apprehending the full range of God's will for one's life mission. "The source of my vocation is in God and not in me."<sup>125</sup> To claim too much for science will only hamper its effectiveness and the ability of the Church to use its conclusions.

c. "The Vocation of Leadership".

There is a final attempt at adaptation which has taken a wrong turning, but may be studied with profit. When Sidney and Beatrice Webb wrote their comprehensive study, Soviet Communism: A New Civilisation? they introduced the term "The Vocation of Leadership" in describing the role of the Communist Party within the Soviet Union.<sup>126</sup>

The Communist Party assumes the vocation of public leadership. . . This Vocation of Leadership may well be deemed the dominant political feature of Soviet Communism. . . (It) seems to have been devised and principally worked out by Lenin and Stalin themselves.

In a rather strange form, the idea of Vocation is thus planted at the nerve center of the soviet socialist state. It gives purpose, significance and a sense of "chosenness" to those who have given their lives to fulfilling the dictatorship of the proletariat. The fact that the Webbs and not the Communist Party used the term Vocation is important, but the description given of the Communist Party leaves no doubt that there is present

---

125. Ib.

126. The quotations from the Webbs are from the first edition of their work (1935), 1, 415; 11, 1132; and from the second edition (1937), 1, 339, 1072.



within the party itself some sense of special mission.

(It is) an artificially constructed category that we can best describe as one of super-citizens. These men and women are not withdrawn from ordinary life or common citizenship. They have a conscious responsibility greater and deeper than that of the plain man or woman. They are held to a higher standard of behaviour, under a more stringent discipline. They are, in fact, selected out of the mass for the exercise of a specific vocation, and the fulfilment of a particular duty based on a definite creed, namely that of "Marxism", as authoritatively interpreted from time to time.

A sense of Vocation without belief in God has been branded already by Forrester as extremely dangerous.<sup>127</sup> In view of the discussion in these pages it would seem also to be a contradiction in terms. It conveys no proper meaning. Since Marx himself would be the first to eliminate any terminology suspected of sacred origin, so the Webbs' case for adaptation must be judged a failure.

Before the word Vocation can become a proper verbal symbol, it must suggest that someone besides man is doing the calling. The action must come from the environment. To speak theologically, the word has no future apart from God. The Calling implies a Caller, and the Vocation, a Vocator.

---

127. Cunningham Lectures, 1950, V.

### Summary.

The problem of bringing the modern post-Reformation concept of Vocation into a useful relation to modern life is complicated at the start by the enormous influence of the power machine on modern work. Vocational guidance is affected by the fact that the nature of work is often misjudged today: it is either rejected as meaningless or it is idealized beyond reason. Further, the machine has inevitably set in motion trends toward standardization and collectivism.

Nevertheless there are hopeful elements which have entered the working picture, resulting from the recognition given to the value of the human factor. The importance of group relationships at work is coming to the fore, and more careful scientific study is being given the field of individual differences.

The positive efforts at vocational adaptation, for the most part, have tended toward extremes. On the one hand there has been a retreat into the "classical Pauline concept" with emphasis upon the Calling to an evangelical witness. On the other hand many Christian social thinkers are today concentrating on the relationship of Vocation to work without dealing properly with the question of witness; some go so far as to leave God Himself well out of the picture.

One promising adaptation has been made in the field of Christian ethics, where Vocation is being put forward as the theological answer to the philosopher's question, "What ought

I to do?" But all of the efforts at adaptation made thus far seem to share a common disadvantage: they fail to take seriously enough either the meaning of the Christian Calling, or the necessity of carrying that meaning squarely into the difficult field of modern work.

## CHAPTER FOUR

# TOWARD A MODERN CONCEPT OF CHRISTIAN VOCATION

### Outline.

#### I. The Historical Basis of the Concept.

1. Biblical Views of Calling and Work.
2. The Contribution of the Reformation.

#### II. A Definition of Christian Vocation.

1. Vocation as Service Through Witness.
2. Vocation as Function in God's Creation.
3. Advantages of the Integrated Concept.

#### III. The Vocation of Church Leadership.

#### Summary.



To choose your career for selfish reasons is a worse sin than, let us say, committing adultery, for it is the withdrawal of the greater part of your time and energy from the service of God.

-- William Temple

The same question kept thrusting itself forward: "Why shouldn't you be ordained?"... The question stared at me from the blue foolscap on which I was drawing pleadings; it lurked in the pages of briefs; it met me in the Courts; it encountered me in the underground railway; it followed me down the Embankment to Chambers; it went to bed with me at night; it rose with me in the morning.

-- Cosmo Gordon Lang

My dear Miss Florence, it would be unusual, and in England whatever is unusual is thought to be unsuitable; but I may say to you...if you have a vocation for that way of life, act up to your inspiration and you will find there is never anything unbecoming...in doing your duty for the good of others. Choose, go on with it, wherever it may lead you and God be with you.

-- Dr. Ward Howe to Florence Nightingale

## I. The Historical Basis of the Concept.

### 1. Biblical Views of Calling and Work.

In the attempt to restore relevance to the Christian concept of Vocation that is now to be made, one presupposition is paramount. It is that the resources for such a restoration are already to be found in the Bible. Many Christian writers engaged in similar research have discovered such resources either in the Biblical teaching on the Calling or in the Biblical attitudes to work. The view adopted here is that both doctrines are necessary.

In the examination made earlier of the Calling as set forth in the Old and New Testaments<sup>1</sup>, it was discovered that the classic characteristic of the Call was not a summons out of the world into a new order of being (though this was often an important element); rather it was a commissioning to the performance of a duty or task, quite frequently a life task. Hebrew and Christian leaders from Abraham to Paul were filled with a sense of mission. Further, as Paul repeatedly pointed out, the missions were not identical but complementary. They were intended to function together for the glory of God and the upbuilding of the Church. The view of Vocation here set forth will derive its spiritual support from such considerations.

In addition to the Biblical view of the Calling, however,

---

1. See Chapter I, pp. 5-22.

there is a Biblical view of work, and much of the difficulty of adaptation noted in chapter III is due to an incomplete understanding of the teaching of Scripture on the subject of work. There is not one simple doctrine; rather there are five different views to be found, not mutually exclusive yet able to be combined only in the larger framework of Christian theology. A brief exposition of the five views is necessary before the discussion can proceed:

(1). Work is part of the created order and is basic to God's purpose for man. Adam was given the Divine command, "Make the earth subject unto you", and more specifically was "put into the garden to dress it".<sup>2</sup> In many Biblical passages work appears to be good; it is a blessing and privilege, an expression of man's nature and a mode of his earthly existence.<sup>3</sup>

(2). God Himself, being a Worker engaged in establishing, sustaining, reclaiming and renewing His created order, has imparted to work something of His own dignity. When man works there is a sense in which he shares God's creative activity. "My father worketh hitherto, and I work...Greater works than these shall you do."<sup>4</sup> The Sabbath itself reflects the godliness of work.

(3). Work is a necessary functioning of man for the maintenance of the human community. "If any will not work, neither

---

2. Genesis 1:28, 2:15. (AV).

3. E.G. Exodus 20:9, Psalm 104:23.

4. John 5:17, 14:12 (AV).

let him eat."<sup>5</sup> By participating in work for the common good, the individual discharges his group obligations and establishes his claim to the benefits of society.

(4). Work is nevertheless a heavy burden for man. It is part of the curse of his fallen nature: "In the sweat of thy brow shalt thou eat bread."<sup>6</sup> Work is full of "thorns and thistles"; in practical life its noble qualities are obscured by arduous and hostile conditions. Its rewards are uncertain and meager, yet its demands seem incessant. Sin has turned the Divine command of Eden into the ache of toil.

(5). The redemption of the world wrought through the atoning death of Our Lord Jesus Christ on the Cross affected not only man, but also his work, which was somehow changed and restored. "Behold, all things are become new."<sup>7</sup> The curse upon man's work has been lifted "in principle", though not in fact. All creation is further promised a share in God's ultimate triumph, when presumably the work of men's hands will be established.<sup>8</sup>

The theological issues raised by the fifth point are complex and yet there is undoubtedly such an emphasis in Scripture, and it requires a hearing. All five points are in fact important for any understanding of the Biblical view of work. They help to explain why the Christian toilers of Roman times were able

---

5. II Thessalonians 3:10. (AV).

6. Genesis 3:19 (AV).

7. II Corinthians 5:17. (AV).

8. Romans 8:18-24; Psalm 90:17.



to avoid falling into romanticism or abject despair. They show, too, the lack of a Biblical basis for some prominent Puritan teachings of a later day: that work was sent by God to keep men out of mischief, and that economic assiduity was in itself a guarantee of moral integrity.

As thus set forth, the Biblical doctrine of work appears to have only occasional points of contact with the idea of the Calling. As was mentioned earlier, the idea of the Call as mission which is so characteristic of the Scriptures as a whole, does in most cases relate itself to the life work of the one who is called.<sup>9</sup> I Corinthians 7 also contains a suggestion that the work of man is included in his status or Calling. Yet when Paul admonished the idle among the church-folk of Thessalonica, and spoke of his own "toil and labor", he was apparently not applying the idea of the Calling directly.<sup>10</sup> His Call to apostleship did not necessarily exclude a Call to tent-making or to any other work with his hands, on the evidence of Scripture, but Paul by no means claimed such a relationship.

The view of Vocation as a combination of witness and work does exist in some of the personalities and events of the Bible, even though it may not be expounded as a clear doctrine. Nehemiah the wall-builder, Amos the prophet and dresser of sycamore trees, Lydia the seller of purple, Priscilla and Aquila

---

9. See p. 8.

10. I Thessalonians 4:11; II Thessalonians 2:6-12; Acts 18:3.

the tent-makers, are a few prototypes of the concept, to whom others could be added.<sup>11</sup> Yet it remains true that the Scriptures and equally as well the writings of the early fathers and the medieval schoolmen, lack a concise statement of the case. The question fairly rises: What then are the legitimate Christian grounds for claiming that Vocation consists of an integration of witness with work? The answer is to be found in the Reformation.

## 2. The Contribution of the Reformation.

During the spiritual and social upheavals in northern Europe in the sixteenth century, the concept of Vocation emerged in unprecedented form. What was latent and implicit in Paul, and to some extent in Aquinas, Antoninus and Tauler, became manifest and explicit.<sup>12</sup> Luther, with his conviction that God could be fully and joyfully served in the world without recourse to pilgrimages or other ascetic acts, is the true source of the modern concept of Vocation. As has been seen, after Luther liberated Vocation from its monastic confinement the term gradually acquired a more specialized significance. It had consistently embraced work, in Luther's mind, along with status and worldly activity in general. Not many years had passed however before Vocation became chiefly and rather distinctively applied

---

11. Nehemiah 2:5; Amos 7:14; Acts 16:14, 18:2-3.

12. "The Reformation idea of the call is something entirely new. The thing, in truth, is present in the New Testament writings...more richly than in Luther. But the thing is not fixed in a word, not developed into an idea..."--E. Billing, Our Calling (tr. from Swedish), 7.

to work, even in Luther's thought. Thus he refused to make distinctions of value between types of daily labor. He considered that all proper work held the potential of witness and service, and where all work was good there could be no "better part".<sup>13</sup> His insight may be judged true or false, fruitful or unfruitful, but it remains an historical fact. Luther, and Calvin after him, insisted on linking the daily life and labor of men with the will of God. The Reformers owed much to Scripture and to the mystics and late medieval writers; yet the Reformation view of Vocation remains a unique creation of its own times. It stands with Justification by Faith and the Priesthood of All Believers as a foundation stone of the young Protestant movement.

A present-day effort at reconstruction of Vocation could properly take its inspiration from the Reformation without necessarily inheriting the weaknesses of the positions taken by Luther and Calvin,<sup>14</sup> and without adopting any of the post-

---

13. See p. 32. Bainton has collected some of Luther's picturesque sayings from the Tischreden and other sources, in which God is described as calling men to common labors because He so works. God tailors a coat and makes boots for the deer, He is a cook, a butler who feeds the sparrows. Christ worked as carpenter, Mary did housework, the shepherds continued to tend their flocks after visiting the Christ child. Says Bainton, "Luther never tired of defending those callings which for one reason or another were disparaged." (Here I Stand, 233-4.)

14. Luther's traditionalism tended to harden his view of the Calling so that it became an instrument to make the worker "keep to his station". Calvin's treatment of effectual Calling and the worldly Calling as separable phenomena (cf. his Institutes) was the start of the rift so apparent in late Puritanism. See pp. 36-9.

Reformation aberrations which sought to sever the secular from the sacred, the "everyday word" from its "holy day splendor".<sup>15</sup> So purged and restored, the doctrine might possess an unlimited potential.<sup>16</sup> There lies before it the possibility of a complete reinterpretation of the significance of work in a machine age. But if the Reformation's contribution is rejected and the Church severs its doctrine of Vocation from work without further ado in order to make of it a purely "spiritual" concept, the opportunity will be lost. For Christianity has no other useful tool with which to enter the industrial field as an intelligent participant and critic. As long as the Call remains completely "heavenly", the Church's contribution to the problem of work will be limited. Indeed, the world may see no revival of faith until genuine Christians have outgrown their reputation for practicing holiness on Sunday and driving sharp bargains during the week. A working doctrine of Vocation therefore may be said to be the key to the Church's future.

---

15. Billing, Our Calling, 5.

16. Roman Catholic writers are increasingly, if unconsciously, accepting the Reformation view of the relation of Vocation to witness and to daily work. They refer to the need for "reconciliation between the vocation of labour and the religious vocation of man", and the laymen's vocation as "witnesses of truth and Christian life". (Borne and Henry, A Philosophy of Work, 183; Pastoral Letter of the Quebec hierarchy, Montreal, 1950. See also Letter to The Times, Dec. 21, 1940, in A Christian Basis for the Post-War World, 13-16.)



## II. A Definition of Christian Vocation.

The relevance of the Biblical views of the Calling and work now being indicated, and the contribution of the Reformation established, the time has arrived to set forth with as much lucidity as possible a modern concept of Vocation: Vocation is service to God by witnessing to Jesus Christ in and through function in the social order for the welfare of God's Creation.

The definition is not perfect, for it fails to convey the explicit sense of "action on the part of God"; but that action is still best defined by the word Call. The significant fact that is expressed is that the Christian is fulfilling God's commission to manifest God's truth in and through his life and work. The extremes the definition seeks to avoid are, on the one side, the restriction of Vocation to a Call to apostleship that is largely verbalized activity, and on the other a whole-sale "consecration" of labor along lines of pagan or Marxist idealism. The conditioning phrase by witnessing to Jesus Christ makes it clear that the Divine initiative is conceived of in terms of the Christian Gospel. The expression "function in the social order" has a slightly wider frame of reference than the word "work". Social function would include leisure-time activities and voluntary work, such as teaching in a Church School or serving through the Red Cross. Social function, in fact, has points of contact with Luther's first transforming idea of the Calling as service to God in worldly activity, which he expressed in the St. John's Day sermon of 1522.<sup>17</sup>

---

17. See p. 32.

It should be noticed however that historically God's call is linked with the idea of mission, which characteristically issues in life work. To separate social function from work can therefore be dangerous; it may even confuse Vocation with "avocation". The basic point the definition seeks to emphasize is that social function, seen in its wholeness, is not just a contribution to state or society, but rather a witness to the Kingdom of God that Christ proclaimed. Vocation thus becomes the mediation of divine love to human persons and the penetration of the sacred into the secular.

### 1. Vocation as Service Through Witness.

The first part of the definition now needs to be examined. What does it mean to "serve God by witnessing to Jesus Christ?"

The answer that is finding an increasing response among Christians today is that the primary witness must be to Jesus Christ as Lord. He is "king of kings and lord of lords", and His sovereignty over all nations and all of life is the meaning of the Incarnation.<sup>18</sup> Christ's Kingship is attested to by the gospels and epistles in various ways: He was Co-Creator with the Father; He assumed all power and authority to Himself; He commissioned His disciples to go out and to claim the world; He promised to complete their work at the end of history. Jesus is One who is "far above all rule and domin-

---

18. "God became man...clothed Himself in the physical, and thereby declared holiness to be inseparable from 'material' considerations." -- G. F. MacLeod, We Shall Re-Build, 18. Cf. W. A. Visser t'Hooft, The Kingship of Christ, 80-100.

ion", Who has "put all things under his feet"; at His Name "every knee should bow, in heaven and on earth and under the earth".<sup>19</sup>

The Christian witness to Jesus Christ then is not an apology for a quaint young Semite with a gift for spiritual utterance, who founded one ancient religion among many. Rather it is a proclamation that Christ stands at the very center of the universe, of reality itself, demanding by divine right the allegiance of every mortal, and offering Himself in loving fellowship to all who choose to turn to Him. The imperial claims made by Christ upon human life are after all a gesture of love; the Cross itself is a revelation not of naked supernatural power but rather of the love of a heavenly Father. Since the divine sovereignty is asserted in and through the divine love, it follows that God is glorified and His Name hallowed in the quietly-spoken, friendly half-phrase at the lathe as well as in the most impressive service of worship.

There is more to Vocation, to be sure, than half-phrases. Generally speaking whenever man shares the glad tidings of God's loving and redeeming purpose for His children, as revealed supremely on Calvary, and whenever human beings are led into a living relationship with the risen Lord, then Vocation is being obeyed in the sense of witness. The man who

---

19. John 1:1, 10; Matthew 28:18-9; Mark 13:26-7; Ephesians 1:21-2; Philipians 2:10 (ARSV).

speaks for God is engaged in the service of God. He has proved his freedom from the shackles of animal behavior. He has risen above the orbit of necessity established by the inexorable interests of self and social order. He has become a genuine person serving his Creator in his proper capacity, a son testifying to the Father's love. Such activity is not work as it is ordinarily conceived. There is no social compulsion behind it, and it serves no "useful" purpose. By restricting the term "work" to that which is done within the functioning human community, and "service" to those free acts associated with the Gospel witness, it may be possible to distinguish more clearly the meaning of Vocation.<sup>20</sup>

With the nature of the Christian witness now in mind, it may be useful to consider inductively the method and place of witness. Where does one perform the service to God here set forth as the Christian Vocation? The categorical answer is "everywhere". Yet the average Christian has only a limited number of places in which he moves: his home, his church, the homes of friends, occasional public gatherings, a few streets, one or two centers of leisure time activity, and his place of work. In all of these areas the possibility of witness is present, though environmental conditions are such that the fruit-

---

20. Such statements of Jesus as "No man can serve two masters," and "Him only shalt thou serve," suggest that the term "service" in the Christian view may properly be restricted to that which is rendered to God alone. Much activity that in capitalist societies is termed "service to one's fellow-man" on the other hand, since it is devoted to the victims of those societies, is only the payment of society's debt and might better be classed as "work". Cf. Matthew 4:10, 6:24. (AV).



fulness of the spoken word is not always the same. So far the great and uncharted region remains the place of work; and since our formulation is directly connected with work as the vehicle of Vocation, major consideration must be given to the problem of witnessing to Christ at one's place of work.

Work today has become the most important thing in life for millions of people. As thoughtful Christian critics of modern life have already discerned, an industrial society tends to gravitate increasingly not about the town hall, the store or the church, but about the factory.<sup>21</sup> The one fixed geographical locus in normal times is the "plant", the house of the machine. It determines the approximate locality of human residences. It may even determine the shape of mountains and the course of rivers. Wherever there is a heavily industrialized area, therefore, work naturally assumes a predominant importance. The farmer may interrupt his spring plowing to observe the Sabbath, but the Bessemer furnace that takes weeks and months to heat cannot be left untended for a moment.

Because modern man is aware of the importance of industrial work, he normally brings to his labor the full scope of his efficient powers. The work usually extracts from him the best part of the energy he expends during the day. The machine does not ask a worker's philosophy--whether he is one who "lives to work" or "works to live"--it only demands the output of

---

21. Cf. The Witness of the Church to God's Design, by the World Council of Churches.

effort. Once away from the scene of toil, the industrial worker usually plunges himself into an environment calculated to offset the fatiguing effects of his labor. Some may find renewal at a church meeting, but most working people prefer to relax at home or in a place of amusement or fellowship, where spiritual issues may be argued, but they are seldom studied.<sup>22</sup>

A Christian witness at work is therefore at a great advantage over many of the more familiar patterns of evangelism. The contacts with others are more easily made. Many laborers in office and factory have almost no social intercourse outside of their work. It would never enter their minds to attend a church; yet they will discuss the claims of Christ with a fellow-employee. Then too, it is at work that the Christian can be seen for what he is, and not for what he says he is. His Vocation takes on a new and significant aspect when his fellow-workers watch him react to the conditions they face: temptation, unfairness, the "speedup", trade union corruption, dangerous work, ennui, abuse and all the rest. The Christian's spoken testimony is gauged by his conduct and by what he does to help in the struggle for a better order of work. The value of his witness in leisure hours, in church or on the street corner, will depend upon the way in which he pursues his Vocation at the place where he works.

Objection may be raised that when a man is at work he cannot be expected to follow his Christian Vocation to persuade

---

22. Cf. F. Zweig, Labour, Life & Poverty, 58 ff.

men. Such activity, it is held, is apt to disrupt the work; it may jeopardize human life. Even if the Communist in his propagandizing on the job, looks at the work itself with contempt, the Christian cannot do so. There is indeed for the Christian worker "a time for silence and a time for speech".<sup>23</sup> Yet having admitted that the Christian worker is often called to witness in silence, one can hardly rest there. Scientists are finding the "time for speech" has a direct effect on the end product; that is, industrial research has heightened the significance of the social atmosphere of work in its relation to output. The Hawthorne experiments, as has been indicated earlier, showed that "man's desire to be continuously associated in work with his fellows is a strong, if not the strongest human characteristic."<sup>24</sup> The informal working group has been found to be the key to successful production. Relations between personnel as a result are being given special study, and instead of these relations being restricted, they are deliberately encouraged as the basis of cooperative endeavor. There are of course some types of work that naturally prohibit social intercourse, but the average working man in an urban area, whatever his function, usually has ample opportunity for social relations on the job. Further, modern men and women are organizing increasingly in professional leisure time activities--trade groups, farm groups, unions--which emphasize the common

---

23. Ecclesiastes 3:7 (Moffatt).

24. Mayo, The Social Problems of an Industrial Civilization, 99. See pp. 76, 116-8.

interests of their work.

The opportunity for Christian witness on the modern working scene is clear. If the group is--as industrial science has proved--so powerful a social force, then it must become the medium through which the Gospel is spread to working men and women. It must be besieged and captured for Christ. The strategy is now apparent; the remaining problems are concerned with tactics.

The average Christian working layman does not usually conceive that he has any Vocation to witness for Christ, because of his faulty indoctrination. He does not like to think of himself as an apostle or an evangelist, particularly at work. Evangelism is a term he prefers to associate with a type of "professional" speaker. Within the informal working group such a Christian is subject to the temptation to disguise his faith for the sake of group harmony. In such decisions the Church suffers a severe defeat. But there is another attitude that the Christian layman may take towards the group. He displays it when he uses his faith as a mallet to attack his fellow-workers. Such an attitude may be as harmful as complete suppression, though the harm may not be obvious to the one causing it. The zealous layman who cannot relax, who is constantly "ablaze for God", who "button-holes" those around him at every idle opportunity, demonstrates by his aggressiveness and anxiety the lack of the peace of Christ. That peace, which was so obviously a possession of the



early apostles, is known as the gift of the reconciliation at the Cross. Without it a man's witness is usually a tumult of empty phrases. Worse still, what he says for Christ may betray his own inner insecurity as it takes the form of ostentation or becomes an abusive critique of other ways of belief.

Whenever the verbal behavior of man differs from the quality of his daily living it takes on an air of unreality, as is classically shown in the parable of the Pharisee and the Publican.<sup>25</sup> The most devastating charge ever made against the Church is always the charge of hypocrisy. For that reason witness cannot be accepted as something over against and different from the social situation in which the Christian is participating. The work, the social function, is also a form of Christian behavior and Christian witness; as such it is inseparable from Vocation.

The New Testament emphasizes the need for a spoken witness: the "confession made with the mouth".<sup>26</sup> But the confession is notably simple: it is that "Jesus Christ is Lord". Little more seems to have been required as a spoken testimony from those who were not called to Church leadership.<sup>27</sup> Once personal faith in the Kingship of the risen Christ was understood to be confessed, the New Testament writers devoted their major efforts to ethical instruction in the Christian life. The emphasis shifted to "doing the will of my Father", to "walking worthy of

---

25. Luke 18:9-14. See also Parable of Two Sons, Matthew 21:28-32.

26. Romans 10:9.

27. Cf. Cullmann, Die ersten christlichen Glaubensbekenntnisse, 53.

the Vocation wherewith ye were called".<sup>28</sup> The early Church apparently was well aware that the simpler forms of belief are not highly verbalized.

The Christian worker today is still expected to have a spoken witness, however minimal. He is not expected to conceal it from his fellow man behind the mask of his work, to the neglect of the field of social intercourse. Neither is he expected to parade it to the neglect of his work, and thus brand it with his own incompetence. The Call to witness is probably best obeyed at work by steering a middle course that avoids the contempt of one's associates, and wins admiration for what one says for the Faith by the way in which one works and lives. Such a course may seem difficult, but the life of the Church in the industrialized future depends heavily upon the reinvigorating and proper grounding of a Christian lay witness.<sup>29</sup>

## 2. Vocation as Function in God's Creation.

The Scriptures contain abundant evidence of God's historic interest in social order among men as an expression of His love and righteousness.<sup>30</sup> Yet the value of the social order for the maintenance of the Gospel and the Church is often ignored by

---

28. Matthew 7:21; Ephesians 4:1.

29. Workers who are puzzled as to how they can witness on the job might profitably study the tactics of the Communists in the west. They usually seek to establish a genuine friendship with a prospective candidate, then invite him to a meeting where Marxist doctrine can be explained in more detail.

30. Cf. Exodus 20-34, etc.

modern Christian protagonists. Paul in his day was quite cognizant of the benefits of Roman civil society. In medieval culture the Church and the social order were almost identical. Today it is not always clear to some Christians that God has a "stake" in the order of society; yet even the most ascetic Christian minister should be able to realize that the Gospel he preaches, and the service he renders to God, could not be carried on for a week if the social order ceased to function: if the baker stopped delivering bread, the farmer milking cows, and so on. Function in the human community is necessary to sustain life, the gift of God. As man performs his function and helps to maintain life, he serves God. In so doing he fulfils a part of his Vocation.<sup>31</sup>

It is easy to exaggerate the relationship of work to Vocation and to make inordinate claims for it.<sup>32</sup> The ro-

---

31. Such a worker would not necessarily have to be a believing Christian in order to serve God. For example, it would be difficult for the Christian evangelist to deny that the agnostic garage mechanic who repairs his automobile, is by his work contributing to the cause of Christ.

32. Sir Stafford Cripps describes a missionary and a cobbler who fell into a conversation and the cobbler was asked, "What do you do to carry out your religion?" He replied, "I cobble." Sir Stafford defends the cobbler's contention that his religion and his work were essentially one. In the same vein Alexander Miller writes, "In my days in Sunday School we used to be told an 'improving' story of a cobbler who, when asked what his business was, said: 'My business is saving souls, but I mend shoes to pay expenses.'" Miller declares, "We can see now how blasphemous...this story was. We know that a Christian cobbler's first business--his chief service to God--is to mend shoes and to mend shoes well." Both writers have established a valid point, yet they are only one step away from non-Christian romanticism, which proclaims flatly that "work is the mission of man in this earth" (Carlyle). True Vocation is not the mending of shoes, but the witness of God in Christ through the mending of shoes. Thus the mending (Cont. on next page)

manticist is ever tempted to impart to work a quality of "blessedness" which it does not possess. Only in a limited sense can it be said that laborare est orare. The tendency to clothe the routine work of society in pious phrases can lead to serious reaction and repudiation on the part of the ordinary toiler, who knows better than to describe his work as "holy bridge-building" or "Christian street-sweeping". Nevertheless there is a sacramental rendering of service to God in the proper discharge of one's social task. The Christian needs but to be cautioned that the Biblical understanding of work prevents our identifying any social order too closely with God's will.

There are still traditional professions in the world in which, because of the humanitarian nature of their work, the problem of Vocation seems to many to be solved rather easily. The teacher, the doctor, the nurse, the social worker, the farmer, and the judge are frequently mentioned in Christian literature as serving in Vocations which are themselves a part of God's plan. They are obviously "functioning in the social order for the welfare of God's creation". Yet in truth the matter is not so simple. In each of these professions there exist ethical problems which are becoming increasingly serious with the expansion of modern industry. The doctor, for example, may be engaged in very useful and necessary work for

---

(Cont. from last page) of shoes can become a vehicle through which the cobbler may find life. And it is Christian teaching that fullness of life, rather than work, is the mission of man in this earth (John 10:10). (Cripps, God in Our Work, 51; Miller, CVCW, 19; see also MacLeod, We Shall Re-build, 118.)



society, yet find himself faced with problems of conscience which destroy all of his sense of Vocation.

Outside the professional field there are other forces conspiring to keep the Christian from finding work that he feels to be a worthy Vocation. The fluctuation of the labor market, the corruption of special interests, the creation of synthetic public demands, the outbreak of recurrent wars, the military and labor draft, and the failure of industrial leadership to recognize inherent individual differences among men, all have aggravated the situation. No utopian solution is proposed here, but out of the vortex of modern working conditions, out of the struggle of men and the sin of man, it may be possible to fashion a sense of Calling that carries meaning for the Christian worker today.<sup>33</sup>

Three cardinal points appear to condition the discussion:

(1). The first is that where working conditions are unsatisfactory either from a social or a Christian point of view, the sense of Vocation requires that the Christian engage in serious activity to improve the work, wherever possible, to the point

---

33. Dr. Forrester has suggested that the Church needs to work out a system of "vocation values" for the various types of human endeavor. (Cunningham Lectures, V.) The Marxist standards of measurement will scarcely suffice for the purpose, since a materialist distinction between "producers" and "non-producers" is invalid from the Christian point of view. If the Church undertakes vocational guidance on the basis of Vocation, it may be able to distinguish in some manner between the "vocation values" in bricklaying, antique collecting, musical composition and sidewalk photography. A pointed question, however, is: What would Paul or Luther have said to such distinctions?

where he feels that it really does serve God's Creation. Whether such work consists in political or trade union action or some other type of social criticism, the duty is incumbent upon him. To follow one's Vocation in work within the social order means that the working conditions and the product itself must be kept under the judgment of God, and brought into fuller alignment with God's purposes whenever and wherever possible.<sup>34</sup>

(2.) The way in which the Christian works at his task is a part of his witness. The "workman who has no need to be ashamed",<sup>35</sup> who shows competence in his Vocation, is more likely to influence his fellows for Christ than the inept but zealous hand who may be better trained in the Gospel. It was no accident that Jesus Christ established His following among the Galileans by proving Himself a better fisherman than they were.<sup>36</sup> Real craftsmanship in a Christian not only serves God through the social order; it can inspire direct admiration in those about him, both for the craftsman and for his faith.

(3.) The third point of importance is that Vocation is never simply work, nor can it be said to be based upon work. Vocation is witness in and through social function, and Vocation uses work as a primary instrument of its purpose, which is the mediation of God to man. Whether the Christian be a headmaster serving in a genuinely humanitarian capacity, or a clerkess

---

34. It is the merit of Miller's little book, Christian Vocation in the Contemporary World, that it makes social criticism a proper part of the Christian's Vocation. See also Brunner, DI, 424.

35. II Timothy 2:15 (ARSV).

36. Luke 5:1-11.

selling cosmetics of uncertain utility value over a counter, his or her Calling is first of all not to be a worker but to be a person in the service of God. The Biblical Call to a life mission, it will be remembered, was more than a Call to the daily task, important as the daily task was. It is Christian teaching that fullness of life, rather than work, is the goal of man on this earth. However, in order to function effectively as a person in one's total Vocation, one must give major consideration to one's function in work. That means there must be witness in and through one's daily labor, for daily labor is a most important ingredient of one's general behavior as a person in society.

With an understanding of the above presuppositions it is possible now to approach some of the common problems any doctrine of Vocation must face in the field of modern labor. The objections that working men and women will raise to any attempt to consider their toil and travail as a vocational possibility, are capable of a rough classification:

1. The work is monotonous.
2. The work is trivial.
3. The work is distasteful.
4. The work is hampered by restrictions.
5. The work is immoral or morally ambiguous.
6. The work is useless.
7. The working environment is unsatisfactory.
8. The work is unsuited to one's abilities and capacities.

Millions of working men and women, including large numbers of Christians, would not hesitate to include their daily employment under one of the above categories. One of the reasons why workers have left the Church in such large numbers is that the Church has been unable to meet such objections with a meaningful doctrine of Vocation. The objections must now be faced.

1. The work is monotonous. Monotony in itself is not an insuperable barrier to Vocation. All work has its monotonous aspects, but it often simply has to be done because social necessity requires it. As for those tasks which involve complete monotony, the Hawthorne experiments and others studies have disclosed that many men and women--usually those with low I.Q.'s--unquestionably prefer monotonous work to any other kind. There is a stipulation involved, however: the work must maintain a group relationship. Two or three men will tend a machine in routine fashion without complaint, where a solitary worker would rapidly become unfit for duty. Where group harmony is such that monotonous work is not objectionable, Christian Vocation can be taught on the basis of the value of the work and the opportunity for Christian witness. Where the monotony is intolerable from the Christian viewpoint, Vocation must take the form of social criticism.

2. The work is trivial. Many of the statements that apply to monotony apply also to triviality. The Christian can maintain his family, evangelize and engage in social crit-



icism while working at a trivial task. Further, much work that seems trivial is really necessary, so that what is at fault is not the work but one's attitude toward it. If the work really is trivial, Vocation calls for personal action toward making it more significant if possible.

3. The work is distasteful. Some of the most essential tasks in the social order--for example, the conducting of autopsies--would prove distasteful to many; yet they have to be done. Most work has distasteful aspects, which are partly subjective and partly objective. From the vocational standpoint two points are fundamental: the distasteful work should be necessary, and it should be shared. If possible, the distasteful aspects should be assumed by the machine or otherwise eliminated by responsible action; where that is not possible, the Christian will not find that his job lacks any of the potentials of a Vocation simply because it is not always as clean and sweet-smelling as he could wish.

4. The work is hampered by restrictions. Seldom today does one find a type of work that is not bound by restrictions. Such is the nature of our economic order that the restrictions are increasing rather than decreasing. It is no longer possible to go west like Daniel Boone in search of "more elbow room"; the rugged individualists of past generations are fast becoming museum pieces. The modern writer cannot subsist on his family inheritance and write as he pleases; he must "slant" his material to suit the market. The bricklayer can no longer

lay bricks to suit himself; he must stay within the quota prescribed by his union. Such restrictions have always grated on the spirit of the man who yearns to be wholly free, and they can hobble a sense of Vocation. Yet a realistic Christianity always looks upon the world as a place where perfect freedom has been lost. Such freedom as is obtainable today is conditional upon the rights of others, and the current changes in our economic order are aiming toward the better distribution of such freedom as is possible to men. Within the restrictions of one's work it is possible to serve God well, as Paul suggests in a verse much discussed in this thesis.<sup>37</sup> In the opinion of a modern interpreter of Paul, the Christian has no right to push his search for a different and better economic order until he has first asked concerning the present order, "How can I serve within it?"<sup>38</sup>

5. The work is immoral or morally ambiguous. Immoral work is a permanent obstacle to the development of a sense of Vocation. However, not all Christians are agreed as to what constitutes immoral work, and outside the Church the confusion is worse. The nature of our economic system is such that we find ourselves easily drawn into dishonest practices, sometimes before we are aware of them. Many who consider their business practices to be legal would admit under pressure, as Zacchaeus did, that they are not ethical. Some

---

37. I Corinthians 7:20, "Let every man abide in the calling wherein he is called." (AV).

38. Brunner, DI, 401, 426.

Christian workers would defend their employment in distilleries and armament plants on grounds which other Christians would find morally unacceptable. Extra-legal operators such as the racketeer, the fraudulent stock promoter, the prostitute, the pornographic writer and the counterfeiter condemn themselves, but there are hundreds of thousands of men and women in other occupations, including a large proportion of Christians, who are not certain whether their jobs are morally worthy or not. They are caught in the flux of economic tragedy. If they ever had a sense of Vocation, it has become anemic through the making of continuous dubious decisions. Under such circumstances it may be hard to change one's job, harder to change the conditions that created the job. It is perhaps still harder for a Christian to ask God's forgiveness for remaining in such work against his conscience. Some Christians would maintain that God never calls a man to compromise on a moral question. Others are not clear on the point. But this much at least is clear: the Christian cannot use a morally ambiguous job as an excuse for curtailing his witness to Jesus Christ and his struggle for a better order of work.

6. The work is useless. Three classifications may be made under the heading of "useless work". First there is work that is recognized by objective observation to be useless. A simple example is the reported practice in the United States during the pre-war depression, which required candidates for government relief to dig holes and to fill them up again. The

second category would consist of work which might not appear useless to the objective observer, but which the Christian engaged upon the work was convinced was useless. An example would be a Christian solicitor of advertising who believed that the products with which he was connected had no value whatsoever. The fact that others considered them of value would make no difference from the vocational standpoint. In both the first and second cases the Christian could serve the work only under active protest, and meanwhile devote his best efforts to render his work worthy of a Vocation. The third classification is work that fails of its fulfilment. If a builder erects a house only to see it burn before it is occupied; if an author writes a worthy book only to suffer the loss of the manuscript before it is published, there will be a recurring temptation to think of the work as "useless". The Christian cannot so dismiss it. To God no good is ever lost; hence what may seem useless to man is not necessarily valueless to God. Further, the tragedies of work are seldom without some meaning in which the Christian may divine the voice of God, and so retain his sense of Calling.

7. The working environment is unsatisfactory. The Christian finds a congenial working atmosphere a tonic to his faith and a buttress to his sense of Vocation. Where either the physical surroundings or the human companionship are unpleasant the problem of Vocation may be greatly increased. There are many historical instances of Christians whose sense of



personal Calling has waxed stronger in the face of adversity, but there are many today who feel unable to rise to the demands of heroism--especially at work. Attention may be called again to the three conditioning factors of this whole discussion, which apply not just to "heroes" but to all Christians: (1) the requirement to engage in social criticism to improve the working environment, (2) the demands of good workmanship, and (3) the realization that Vocation is not simply work, but witness in and through work as a primary aspect of life. Through study of these factors the Christian may be able to decide whether the work he is doing is a true Vocation despite the unsatisfactory environment.

8. The work is unsuited to one's abilities and capacities. The final objection, one of the most clamant in modern life, leads directly to the question of Christian vocational guidance, and will be reserved for discussion in the final chapter.

### 3. Advantages of the Integrated Concept.

The view of Vocation as set forth in the foregoing pages hardly pretends to be more than a tentative statement which, it is hoped, will contribute to the current discussion of the subject in Christian circles. Its claims to originality are slight, for it is in good part a reflection of recent Christian group thinking in Scotland. For that reason certain advantages that accrue to the concept may properly be suggested.

(1). The element of balance is, perhaps for the first

time, consciously present. No longer is Vocation thought of as completely static ("keep to your station") or as completely dynamic in the wrong sense ("work for the work's sake"). No longer may it be spoken of as just a heavenly Calling, or just an earthly task. The problem of relating the sacred to the secular is not solved, but it is presented as a problem of the integrating of witness in work. To preserve the balance it is essential that no attempt be made either to divorce the work from the Calling, or the Calling from work.

(2.) The inclusion of work and social criticism as part of the Calling makes it possible for the Christian to view the rise of the machine and the development of industry without feelings of anxiety or despair. Such lessons as the machine can teach mankind may be welcomed by the Christian, even while he insists that "the human factor" is of more importance than any and all schemes for mechanical or industrial efficiency. Thus freed of a "Frankenstein complex", the Christian worker can more easily find joy in work, and recognize the eccentric nature of all romantic and nihilistic reactions to modern life.

(3.) The restriction of the term Vocation would help somewhat to unravel the current confusion over what the word really means. Some of the rather arbitrary secular definitions-- ("Vocation is a social institution which covers all the diversified organized labour of man"<sup>39</sup>) --would be outlawed. Further, it would be incorrect to speak of a "vocation to friendship" or

---

39. J.H. Coffin, Personality in the Making.

a "vocation to neighbourliness".<sup>40</sup> Since witnessing involves the love of neighbour, and working involves diversification, the problem and others like it would be solved by substituting the whole for the part.

(4.) The foundation would be laid for a truly Christian approach to vocational guidance in the modern sense. The heart of that foundation has been aptly expressed by Reeves and Drewett: "The Christian does not choose his vocation, he is chosen for it. He does not seek it out, he accepts it."<sup>41</sup>

### III. The Vocation of Church Leadership.

Since the day when Luther liberated the word Vocation from its "religious" confinement, the status of the Call to the ministry and to related functions has been rather ambiguous. Protestant writers of the past, if they happened to be members of the clergy, often described the ministry as a holy Calling. That it was more spiritual and closer to God than other Callings was usually inferred if not actually stated. Puritanism, generally speaking, tended to establish an arbitrary division: the minister received a divine and holy Calling, while the tradesman followed a calling of quite another order. Yet the logical consequences of such a separation of sacred and secular were never drawn, because they led back

---

<sup>40</sup>. Reeves and Drewett, What is Christian Education?, 14-15.

<sup>41</sup>. Ib., 11.

inevitably to the idea of a religious Vocation which the Reformation sought to exterminate.<sup>42</sup>

The modern revival of the concept of Vocation forces a re-examination of the basis upon which the ministry and ecclesiastical work in general is entitled to qualify as a Calling. Unless the Church is prepared to embrace the doctrine of religious Vocation as set forth in the Catholic Encyclopedia,<sup>43</sup> it can no longer pretend that the Call to the ministry has the slightest extra dispensation of Grace over any other kind of proper work. That is, the minister's rounds must henceforth be acknowledged to be no higher in spiritual values than the grocer's, the doctor's, the dustman's or the undertaker's. To each is given the commission to serve God by witnessing through the work; and in that service each accumulates his daily count of achievements and failures. Meanwhile each is making his necessary contribution to the maintenance of God's created order.

Under such a vocational evaluation the unique function of the minister appears not to be his witness (which is no different from any Christian's) but his work. By the division of labor the minister is given a specific social function to discharge. That function is not always recognized by the secular elements of western society, but it exists nevertheless. Since

---

42. There were occasional Puritans such as William Perkins of Cambridge who endeavored to reduce the distance between the Church and other "offices and callings". Cf. Workes, i, 481; Haller, The Rise of Puritanism, 125.

43. See p. 26.



the dawn of history men have had ministers, and they probably always will have. The tribal shaman, the ecstatic prophet of ancient Egypt, the whirling dervish, the Levite, the magus, the high priest, the lay preacher, the king's bishop, the lady evangelist and the Communist Patriarch of Moscow all share an occupational--though not a vocational--relationship.

The particular social function which the Protestant Christian minister performs is to lead his Church. The ministry can therefore be described best as the Vocation of Church Leadership.

Before the ministry can be analyzed further some statement should be made as to the Church's relationship to society. The Church is by definition a fellowship of those called to witness to the Gospel of Jesus Christ. Its members are not usually gathered from any particular field of work (although churches attached to industries are increasing in number); rather it is the witness that binds them together. But the witness to the Gospel is not just a "spiritual" entity; it touches life at every point because it is attesting to the truth of the Incarnation, to the Christ Who came into the world to redeem it. Though the Christian be called "out of the world and into the Kingdom", in a sense he never really leaves society, for the Church is a part of human society; it is itself "in the world". Its members earn wages, patronize stores, live in houses and send their children to schools. In the past the Church has frequently been alluded to as a "colony of

heaven".<sup>44</sup> It is important to remember also that it is an organism in society known as the Body of Christ, an association of human beings with a mission to fulfil.

The function of the ministry is a function within that Church. The pastor is, as his name implies, a shepherd to his flock. He is the leader. The preaching of the Word of God, the Christian training of youth, the inspiration and encouragement of working men and women, the ministry of divine healing to the sick, the assurance of God's love for the aged, the comfort of the friendless, the building of a healthy environment for fruitful Christian living, and all the other activities that fall to the Church leader, are the raw stuff of his Vocation. As a leader he is called upon to venture and pioneer in new directions for the extension of Christ's Kingship.

It is not appropriate in this work to enter into a discussion of the theological issues that are raised by such a view of the Christian ministry: issues involving the status of ordination and ecclesiastical authority. The most significant fact to be emphasized is that the minister does not suffer by the re-evaluation; he gains. By losing the false distinction which put him in a special class as a "holier" person, the minister recovers his status in society as a whole, as a worker for the common weal. The demand of Lenin that ministers and

---

44. Philippians 3:20 (Moffatt).

priests should have to qualify for their rations by becoming "producers", is correctly appraised as anti-religious prejudice rather than legitimate social reform.<sup>45</sup> When it is made clear that the Christian value of any proper work is on an equal plane with the minister's function, then the minister may claim on the basis of the division of labor that his own work is as useful in the sight of God and man as any other task in the community.

What has been said about the minister applies equally to all who are trained in Christian work, whether educators, missionaries, evangelists, administrators or specialists. St. Paul established no distinctions of value among such workers.<sup>46</sup> Today their activity is often erroneously referred to as "full-time" or "whole-time" Christian service, a term unsuitable to describe the Vocation of Church Leadership according to the principles here set forth. As the late Rowland Hogben discerned, such a classification creates a false split in the Christian community.

"Whole-time service" is a mischievous phrase if it be applied, as it is, to a religious vocation to the exclusion of other callings which Christian men and women may follow. Whole-time service is due from every child of God. And

---

45. Final proof of the point may be seen in the Soviet restoration of the traditional Russian Orthodox Church, including its monastic orders.

46. Ephesians 4:11. The primitive Church soon came to attach a unique importance to the apostleship, but there is no suggestion that other workers in the Church were not equally called, whatever their degree of responsibility. Cf. I Corinthians 7:7.

every Christian renders whole-time service if he is serving God wholeheartedly in the sphere of His choice...whether his daily task be religious or secular.<sup>47</sup>

Where there is Vocation there is always full-time Christian service. At this point the distinction between occupation and Vocation appears most clearly. Occupation is work; Vocation is witness in and through work. Whoever draws a salary or wages from a Church organization is receiving pay for his work, but unless his work is the means of his Vocation he has no business functioning in the Church at all. Sunday School teachers, Church officers and other volunteers, on the other hand, do not receive their livelihood from the Church, but their functioning and witnessing is part of their Vocation. The vital condition is that such service in the Church be integrated with their working life.

Whatever the future may bring, it is certain that years ahead will yield an increasing demand for effective Church leadership. The nineteenth century and its methods are now sufficiently faded into the past for exploratory movements to assume greater prominence. The minister, the missionary and the Christian educator all stand on the brink of a new opportunity for service to God. In the ministry itself a foreseeable shortage of replacements may result in the revival of a lay ministry over wide areas, possibly along lines now being investigated by the younger churches in the east. The seminary-

---

47. Hogben, Vocation, 24.



trained minister of tomorrow may in turn associate himself more and more with the places of work that provide the economic basis of his parish, in order to interpret the Gospel of Jesus Christ more significantly to the walks of daily life.

### Summary.

The resources for a twentieth century concept of Vocation are to be found in the Biblical views of the Call and of work. The form of the concept took shape at the time of the Reformation, in Luther's proclamation of God's Call to activity in the world. Vocation may now be defined as service to God by witnessing to Jesus Christ in and through function in the social order for the welfare of God's creation.

To witness to Christ means that He is pointed to by the Christian as the Savior of mankind and the Center of Life. Such witness may be made in any social situation, but one of the most significant and effective fields for witness today is the place of work.

To function for the welfare of God's creation means to assume one's share of work in the social order for the good of the whole. When the claim is made that work has value in esse in God's sight, however, it quickly becomes apparent that there are many forms of modern work which seem to defy any kind of vocational interpretation. Such problems are partly met by the fact that the Call of God also carries the imperative of social criticism. The advantage of Vocation thus viewed as witness in and through work is that it preserves a balance which may give the Christian worker a chance to avoid becoming involved in extreme types of behavior, without losing his true Christian identity.

The status of the Call to the Christian ministry is clarified by the rejection of the use of the term "full-time Christian service" to describe a Church Vocation. The work of the ministry is now understood to be no higher in God's sight than any other proper function in the community; and conversely the human status of the working ministry is firmly established as being no less important than any other effort of society. The minister has his witness like any other Christian, and his work or function which is the Vocation of Church Leadership.

## CHAPTER FIVE

# TOWARD A PLAN FOR CHRISTIAN VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE TO COLLABORATE WITH STATE - CONTROLLED AGENCIES

### Outline.

- I. The Desirability of a Closer Relationship.
- II. Practical Problems.
  - 1. Stalemate in Church and School.
  - 2. Preliminary Efforts Toward a Solution.
- III. Christian Vocational Guidance.
  - 1. The Minister as Counselor.
  - 2. Collaboration with the State.
  - 3. Conclusion.

Summary.



Every profession, politics included,  
crying out for men to come and lead;  
men of high principle and indomitable  
will, diligent, conscientious, brave  
and wise; men with faith in God and  
faith in themselves. . . If only some-  
one...had talked to me like that. . .  
Oh no. Nothing of that sort was ever  
said.

-- J. C. W. Reith

Youth is the only time  
To think and to decide on a great course:  
Manhood with action follows; but 'tis dreary,  
To have to alter our whole life in age.

-- Browning

## I. The Desirability of a Closer Relationship.

The problem of relating the Christian concept of Vocation as set forth in Chapter IV, to the modern vocational guidance movement as described in Chapter II, is far from easy. The basic ideas have quite different historical origins, and for the most part have developed independently of each other.<sup>1</sup> Today Christian Vocation and vocational guidance remain as far apart as ever. Yet their ultimate goals are not mutually exclusive. Christianity has always attached the greatest importance to Jesus' words, "I am come that they might have life, and that they might have it more abundantly," while vocational guidance aims at enabling the individual to attain "not only the good life, but the happy life."<sup>2</sup>

There would appear to be much that could be gained by the Church, by educational science, by industry and by youth, if in some manner the idea of God's inner Call and the idea of satisfactory personal adjustment to work could be brought closer together. The spiritual insights of the Christian Gospel into the nature and motives of men would widen the horizons of vocational guidance, while the disciplines of scientific method would strengthen the effectiveness of the Church's approach

- 
1. If vocational guidance really has its roots in Plato, as evidence in Chapter II suggests, then Bainton's assertion that "our expression 'vocational guidance' comes directly from Luther" is not true. The Christian origins of vocational guidance are at most indirect. See pp. 59-60. Bainton, *op.cit.*, 233.
  2. John 10:10; see p. 56.

to youth.

The desirability of an exchange of thinking between Christian theologians and vocational educators may be brought out more clearly by illustration. While studying motivation in the choice of a career among a selected group of Edinburgh young people, Macdonald attempted to measure what "would seem to be" the order in which the boys and girls were motivated to seek life work. The most important motives for boys, he claimed, were, in the order of their importance: (1) security, (2) active tendencies, (3) freedom and independence, (4) superiority, (5) social conformity, (6) ease, pleasure and amusement, (7) social admiration, (8) humanistic tendencies, (9) power. The girls' scale was not far different.<sup>3</sup>

Such attempts to classify the motives of men and women are quite common among vocational educators. They have a certain value if the specification is made in advance that only surface impulses or secondary motives are being considered. Usually however the guidance researcher is convinced that he is dealing with the whole field of motivation. If Christian apologists could, without rancor, expose the shallowness of such interpretations of personality, they would be doing a favor not only to their faith but to the social sciences. For while the motivation-tabulators may not be aware of it, many psychologists are maintaining that the chief motivating factors lie below the

---

3. A. Macdonald, A Scheme for Vocational Guidance for Use in an Educational Area, 330.

level of the active consciousness. Such factors cannot always be expressed readily by a youth seeking to choose his life work, yet their influence on his choice may be decisive. For example, a young man may state flatly that he wants a particular type of work because it is "easy", when the real reason may be anything from fear of failure to a heart murmur.

Henry A. Murray, reporting on a famous experiment at Harvard Psychological Clinic with fifty young men of college age, said:

In a number of cases it appeared that choice of vocation had been guided by infantile or adolescent complexes. One subject who had fantasied the death of his parents in an automobile accident...became a salesman of automobile insurance, which necessitated his hurrying to the scenes of accidents. . . . A subject who had been seriously injured by striking a keg of dynamite became a chemist, and another, who had developed an exploratory compulsion after his mother had lied to him (at the birth of a sibling) about the origin of children, chose research. . . . Several subjects who had had oral fixations or inhibitions went in later for public speaking. . . . A stutterer selected philology for his life-work, and a chronic bed-wetter, bridge-building.<sup>4</sup>

The psychological discoveries of Murray, when added to the research in personality types conducted by Kretschmer, Sheldon, Jung et al., should give pause to those who place too much emphasis on what may be the superficial reasons given by young people for their choices of work. Murray's linking of complexes to vocational choices may seem in some instances

---

4. Murray, Explorations in Personality, 734.



rather too facile, but his report suggests that there are genuine grounds for distinguishing between primary and secondary vocational motives.<sup>5</sup>

Christian faith, however, can do more for vocational guidance than correct its psychology. Modern educators--perhaps fully as much as the young people themselves--need to be made aware of the concept of Vocation. They need to be told that unnumbered persons have experienced what they consider an authentic Call of God in their lives, and that many others have felt a "leading" which, though perhaps not expressed in Biblical

---

5. The writer is not aware of a really thoroughgoing study of vocational motives from a psychological viewpoint. There is need for deep research along such lines, to help us understand why people choose certain kinds of work. Most of the available material is drawn from practical statistical surveys, of the order of the Michigan "job-factor sheet" (see p. 87). The inadequacy of any superficial survey of vocational motivation may be seen from the variety and range of the following reasons given personally to the writer by individuals or gleaned from vocational publications, and here condensed for convenience:

- I am following the advice of a fortune teller.
- I want to compensate for a childhood incident.
- I want to be respected.
- I am following my scoutmaster whom I admire.
- I am obeying a message that came in a dream.
- I am following up a chance remark dropped by a visitor to our home.
- I want to go to sea because of a (marine) picture that hung in our home.
- I am a victim of habits that are forcing me into this work.
- I want to show up someone who laughed and said I couldn't do this work.
- I am satisfying my curiosity.
- I am intent on righting a personal wrong.
- I want to conquer a personal handicap, weakness or temptation.

terminology, was none the less real.<sup>6</sup> If the idea of Vocation is ever grasped by the guidance counselors it will make a vast difference in their counseling. Their work will continue to be filled with the measuring of details, but the details will not be substituted for the essentials. Somewhat more of the sacredness of human life will pervade their efforts at guidance; a greater emphasis will be placed upon the full span of the working life, and upon the fullness of self-realization. Thus the wisdom that has been preserved for centuries in Christian doctrine may well broaden the vocational scientist's viewpoint and strengthen the validity of his conclusions.

The need for an exchange of thinking between theologians and vocational experts may be further illustrated by an incident which sheds a different light altogether. In the early months of 1951 a Christian student conference was held in Great Britain on the subject of Vocation. During the conference the whole area of vocational guidance was not once mentioned. After the students had discussed the choice of life work for three days, a question arose as to how one might best distinguish between alternative offers of work, when the sense of Calling appeared equally strong in either case. The solution seriously proposed by one of the leaders was that in such difficult circumstances the Christian might "pitch a penny".

---

6. The latter category most certainly includes many genuine Vocations. The youth Samuel, a classic example, had no idea he had received a divine Call until it was so interpreted to him. (I Sam. 3:8-9.)

When such a dichotomy exists between thinking within the Church and thinking outside the Church on the subject of life work, it is the Church that suffers. The state of guesswork and penny-pitching was passed forever by modern science back in 1908, when Frank Parsons laid down the three "broad factors" of knowledge, understanding and reasoning as the basis of vocational guidance.

From a theoretical viewpoint, then, there seem to be genuine gains in prospect for both the Christian Church and the vocational guidance movement from a closer inter-relation of ideas and programs. Objections to such a suggestion usually crop up when proposals are made for practical implementation. If the Christian concept of Vocation is to mean anything to young people seeking to decide upon their life work, there must be something done besides the exchanging of views between theologians and educators. There must be something done, too, beyond the Christian training of a vocational counselor who can only spend ten minutes interviewing each of his subjects. But what is to be done? Who, to be specific, will give the Christian vocational guidance? If it be the Church, how will such guidance be related to occupational placement and the state agencies now being developed to expedite such placement? And how will the idea of Vocation be taught so that it becomes a significant part of the young person's thinking about life work? Such questions lead to a consideration of the presently existing relationship between the Church and the state voca-

tional education programs of Britain and America.

## II. Practical Problems.

### 1. Stalemate in Church and School.

The question has been raised on both sides of the Atlantic as to whether the Church should interest itself in vocational matters at all. "Convert the vocational guidance experts and let them do their own job with the youth." "Let the influence of Christianity penetrate the state educational institutions and so reach the students." Such are typical clerical responses to the problem.

There are, from the Church's standpoint, tremendous advantages to having an expert layman giving vocational counsel that is truly Christian. He is familiar with the technical aspects of the field and can call on the resources of modern science to help the young person understand his own abilities, acquired skills and interests. Such a counselor also has the experience that produces efficient workmanship. As a Christian teacher he is the Church in action, and forms a natural medium for the transmission of the idea of Vocation. Yet the difficulties connected with relations between Church and state are such that in most western countries the public school teacher of today cannot or will not teach Christian Vocation.

To understand the situation it needs to be recalled that the vocational guidance movement has had its own historical development quite apart from the Church. Much of the exploratory



work was done by educators and other government workers, and there is a certain justifiable pride taken by their disciples in the success of the rapidly-spreading movement. There is, by way of corollary, a certain professional dislike for the introduction of any foreign concepts.

Out of the different approaches to vocational guidance in the school systems of America a kind of vocational philosophy is already emerging. The ideas are not always perfectly blended, but the influence of William James and John Dewey is generally visible. Without any federal vocational guidance system to provide the framework, secular educators have been able to agree on many points. The result is that the vocational guidance movement now has its own "doctrine of man" and proposes to formulate its own answers to the problems of life. The recent appearance of an "Encyclopedia of Vocational Guidance" (without any treatment of the word Vocation) has contributed to the growing feeling that the movement is to a large extent complete in itself.<sup>7</sup> One indication of this tendency, noted in Chapter II, was the liberal application of the word "guidance" to nearly the whole range of human activity. A trained staff of "guidance experts" presumably would be able to "guide" the young individual to every happiness in this life, and possibly (through "religious guidance") into the Kingdom of Heaven!

Such developments are not manifest in Britain to any extent;

---

7. See bibliography.

yet as the full program of state-controlled vocational guidance expands in the years ahead, it should produce some kind of vocational philosophy. The emerging outlook may not make universal claims for itself but is likely to develop resistance to competing attitudes. The Church may therefore, with the passage of time, find it increasingly difficult to penetrate the field of youth guidance either in Britain or America with a Christian view of Vocation.<sup>8</sup>

Late as the hour is, however, the needs of Christian youth persist and challenge the Church to respond in the name of Christ. State-controlled vocational guidance has been shown to be insufficient for the charting of a full life of Christian service.<sup>9</sup> A doctrine of Vocation is required that will provide the right kind of motivation upon which a truly satisfying choice can be made. No amount of testing, measuring or counseling can compensate for the absence of a sense of Calling.

Perhaps the difficulties are now more clearly seen that stand in the way of the suggested policy, "Convert the vocational guidance experts and let them do their own job with the youth." The Christian lay guidance counselor at school is a valuable link between the Church and the state-controlled program, but it is unwise and unfair to ask him to shoulder the

---

8. In the nations within the orbit of the Soviet Union it is of course too late for warnings. The state has taken especial care to see that religious issues play no part in the selection of a young person's work.

9. See p. 78.

whole burden of conveying the concept of Vocation to his charges. Two of the most practical difficulties are: (1) if the counselor has been trained in the ordinary secular vocational approach he will hardly care to drop it, in ordinary circumstances, for another approach; and (2) even if he did hazard the change, he would have little time to teach Christian Vocation to individuals, and less time for the research needed in the field. Even in Britain where the Christian emphasis in the schools opens the door to the teaching of Vocation, the careers master is normally too hard-pressed with occupational placement to spend much time expounding the Christian meaning of witness and work.

The issue, by a process of elimination, is nailed to the doors of the Church. The fact that the Church in the past has not looked upon vocational counseling as its normal responsibility does not obviate the present necessity. The case of Mr. Earn in the experiment recorded in the Appendix may illustrate the point. Mr. Earn, aged seventeen, had already attended the confirmation class in which the young communicants are led into a closer relationship with the Lord Jesus Christ. At some point in the curriculum he may even have heard a brief exposition of Vocation. Yet because he was prevented from fulfilling his desire to go to sea, Mr. Earn's moral and spiritual behavior had begun to disintegrate. He had become a misfit, and it is hard for the misfit to maintain communion with Christ while his "talent" remains deeply buried in himself.

The situation being what it is, the Church must needs prepare to enter the lists, not in competition with the state agencies, but in the interests of its own message. To remain outside longer is to neglect dangerously the Christian potential of youth at work, and to leave the young people without a basis for true guidance.

## 2. Preliminary Efforts Toward a Solution.

As early as 1917 John M. Brewer, an American educator and churchman who pioneered in vocational guidance, wrote, "Groups outside of schools have often done successful work in life careers. Settlements, churches, scout patrols and corporation schools might with great advantage undertake the work of organizing and carry on occupations classes."<sup>10</sup> Twenty years later Viteles found that most of the groups mentioned by Brewer had begun such activities in America--all in fact but the churches, the bearers of Vocation. "Vocational guidance," reported Viteles, "is by no means confined within school buildings." He described the testing, counseling and placement services operated by the Kiwanis, the Altrusa Clubs, the Y.M.C.A., Y.W.C.A. etc.<sup>11</sup>

Today the churches in America are advancing, with some hesitance, into the field to which educators invited them nearly thirty-five years ago. A "Vocational Guidance unit" of

---

10. Quoted in F.J. Allen, Practice in Vocational Guidance, ch.iii.

11. Keller & Viteles, op.cit., 58-9.



instruction has been developed by Ligon at Union College and is being used in the churches supporting his system of character education. The material in this "unit", which is adapted to all Sunday School ages, marks a beginning in the direction of Christian vocational education.<sup>12</sup>

There seems little doubt that eventually the larger branches of the Christian Church will follow Ligon's precedent in giving serious attention to the Christian aspects of vocational choice as it affects church youth. As an example of the changing attitude of the churches, the following statement by the Rev. Laurence P. Byers may be quoted from a recent pamphlet entitled, "Christian Vocations", published by the Department of Life Work of the Presbyterian Church, U.S.A.:

Wherever young people congregate to discuss vocations, they register surprise when the term "full-time Christian service" is applied to mechanics, carpenters, secretaries, engineers, union leaders, lawyers, doctors, and any field of labor not directly under the heading of the Church. . . Young America has sat at the feet of that generation which looked upon Christianity as a vague idealism not concerned with the throbbing affairs of everyday life. . . But Christian youth must learn to consider their choices of vocations in the framework of God's purpose and will for their lives. They must go into society charged and transformed by Christ to act as leaven...

The pamphlet seems to suggest that the day of Christian guidance of youth in choice of Vocations is not far off. Yet in America

---

12. Ligon's material unfortunately is weak in theology. It expounds the Lord's Prayer and the Sermon on the Mount brilliantly, but ignores the whole area of the Apostles' Creed. The concept of Vocation suffers accordingly.

the established churches are still concerned primarily with the pressing problems of recruitment of future Church leadership. The nature of this incessant demand makes it difficult for an objective national approach to the subject of Vocation to be undertaken. One denomination has hired a psychometrist who scores tests hundreds or thousands of miles from the testee, and encloses written advice with the results. The advice is sent to the minister, who is expected to hand it on to his young client. The usual extent of the emphasis on Vocation, however, is the issuing of leaflets for youth discussion groups and the preaching of an occasional sermon. A real program of Christian vocational guidance, with teaching content, measurement data and proper interview procedure, has yet to be developed either nationally or in a local church.

In Great Britain the Church has given little thought to the need for developing its own vocational guidance program. There have always been cordial relations between Church and school, and recognized Christian leadership on the school teaching staffs. As early as 1908 a clergyman sat at the information and employment bureau conference of the Edinburgh school board. In the intervening years no particular necessity has been seen for adapting the concept of Vocation to the needs of Church youth, or providing special guidance for youth in the choice of life work. It seemed sufficient if the young people were warned by sermon and admonition to be "aware of the dimension of the eternal" as they went out to seek jobs.

Today however there are indications that a changed attitude may be forthcoming. Books and pamphlets in increasing number have been appearing on the subjects of Christian Vocation and the Christian doctrine of work. English and Scottish church study groups are scrutinizing the concept of Vocation with a definite view to adaptation. There is a steadily growing emphasis on the Christian significance of secular labor, and it has penetrated the Sunday School curricula of the various denominations. Yet because of the confusion that reigns as to the meaning of Vocation and its relationship to work, it is difficult for the churches to get beyond the first stage, the stage of platitude. And there is abundant evidence that the platitudes of the Church mean nothing to British youth today.

By way of illustration, a series of youth fellowship meetings in an Edinburgh church was devoted recently to the general topic, "Christ and My Job." The subject is full of interest for younger Church leaders in Britain; two books bearing the titles "My Faith and My Job" and "Christian Faith and My Job" have appeared since the close of World War II.<sup>13</sup> The young people who spoke to the youth fellowship, however, had not read the books. One girl dramatist expressed what must have been a widely prevalent opinion when she said, "Christ-- apart from a few personal disciplines--has nothing whatever to do with my job. It is a matter of myself and my abilities and

---

13. See bibliography.

self-expression."

There is an answer to such a viewpoint. It is to revive the Christian idea of the Call of God as it came to Abraham and Isaiah and Paul, link it to the Biblical view of work, and offer to mid-century British youth a genuine sense of Vocation.

Institutions such as the Iona Community, the Christian Frontier and the Industrial Christian Fellowship have broken new ground in studying the meaning of modern secular work for the Christian. They have not specifically urged Christian vocational guidance, but they have pointed the way by insisting that even in the present world of collectivism, mechanical slaves and hydrogen bombs there can be a Christian doctrine of work. In a speech to the Christian Youth Assembly of Scotland,<sup>14</sup> Dr. George MacLeod, leader of the Iona Community, challenged the young people to take the "dog-collar" off the word Vocation. Little by little the churches of Britain are coming closer to a big task of the immediate future: the implementing of Christian vocational teaching in a way that will provide solid ground for a young person's choice of life work.

### III. Christian Vocational Guidance.

#### 1. The Minister as Counselor.

One of the first questions to arise in any discussion of Christian vocational guidance, as soon as the level of theory

---

14. February 17, 1951, at Edinburgh.



is passed, is: "Who is going to give it?" Ligon's answer is that the Church School teacher will give it as part of his regular Sunday morning instruction. Most churches however would be reluctant to yield the time so urgently needed for instruction in the New Testament, Church history and practical theology. More important than the question of time is the question of ability. Not many laymen, even among church-going vocational guidance counselors, are sufficiently endowed by the Holy Spirit to teach an integrated concept of Vocation, or to build a guidance program on such a concept.

The issue comes back inevitably to the minister. He is the theologically-trained churchman at work in the field. He can combine a sense of Calling with easy accessibility to the young people. His is the Vocation of Leadership which means leading into new fields of spiritual exploration. Above all the needs for technical assistance, for research by theologians, for textbooks on Vocation by Christian educators, there is the basic demand for practical experiments in guidance by busy ministers who will give their time to it.

The involvement of the ministry in such an enterprise raises a good many problems. It may be useful therefore to quote from the record of an interview<sup>15</sup> with a leading vocational guidance official of Zürich, Switzerland, on the relevance of pastoral participation in the cantonal guidance program:

---

15. June 17, 1950.

Miss B. Baehr, head of the girls' department of the Städtische Berufsberatung in Zürich, stated that in Zürich canton there are eleven school districts, each with a vocational guidance section which includes a male counselor for boys and female counselor for girls. These trained counselors attend an annual week-long vocational guidance school.

Miss Baehr declared that if Protestant pastors of Zürich could become interested in young people and give indications that they are able to give counseling to them, the vocational guidance bureau would be glad to refer cases to them. As it is, the bureau provides some counseling but is not staffed to give more than two or at most three interviews to an individual.

In the Roman Catholic cantons of Uri, Unterwalden and Schwyz, many priests are now acting as vocational guidance counselors. They also attend the annual state training institute for vocational counselors.

The Protestant pastors take pains with their confirmation classes, but not with the problems that the young people have at confirmation age with regard to choice of life work. The vocational guidance administration would be glad to welcome the pastors to the annual training institute.

The suggestion that ministers should become Christian vocational guidance counselors is likely to call up the portrait of the harassed parson, overworked in attempting to serve his parish, now forced to add one more burden to the load. Imagination does not always serve the facts. Large numbers of ministers do indeed work long hours, but well-organized parishes have laymen trained to do much of the work once performed by the clergy. As a result in countries like Switzerland and America, where there are often two and sometimes more ministers to a parish, the ministers are beginning to specialize in areas where their talents are most effective. To suggest vocational

counseling in such parishes is not unthinkable, assuming that a minister really wants to make Vocation grow in the lives of his young people and is willing to learn how to do it.

The experiment reported in the Appendix to this thesis showed that there is a present need for vocational counseling among Church youth and that the minister is in a position to do it. Discussion of the essential elements involved in a Church guidance program might be reserved with profit until the experimental data is presented.<sup>16</sup> The qualifications of the minister or Christian counselor, however, may be properly considered now. Out of the experiment a "Decalogue for a Christian Vocational Counselor" has emerged, suggesting the way such a program might be approached by the leadership of the churches.

### Decalogue

#### For a Christian Vocational Counselor.

##### I.

The Christian counselor shall wholeheartedly give himself to the effort to assist the young person in planning his life, avoiding the extremes of over-friendliness and excess of piety.

##### II.

The counseling program shall recognize and respect the differentiation of aptitudes, abilities, gifts and interests in individuals.

##### III.

The giving of advice shall be rejected in favor of coun-

---

16. See pp. 253-4.

selling which is primarily nondirective in spirit, until such time as the young person is clearly on his way toward his chosen goal.

#### IV.

A middle course of counseling shall be sought between deep analyses of personality problems and guidance which is simply job placement.

#### V.

The program shall avail itself of the modern scientific disciplines, achievements and spirit as much as possible, in order to insure maximum effectiveness.

#### VI.

A realistic balance shall be sought between primary and secondary impulses in vocational choice.

#### VII.

The welfare of the young person shall not be considered apart from the needs of the Kingdom of God and the social order of mankind.

#### VIII.

The counselor shall seek to elevate the young person's confidence in his ability to achieve a useful, meaningful and joyous life, through his dignity and significance as one called of God.

#### IX.

The counselor shall preserve his identity as a servant of Jesus Christ by fostering a relationship designed to lead the



young person into a deeper understanding of and appreciation of Christian faith and life.

X.

Counseling shall only be given after preparatory study of the Christian view of Vocation as service to God through witness, and service to God's creation through functioning in the human community.

Because all ten points have emerged out of the context of the experiment, they are empirically rather than theoretically conditioned. They are a serious attempt to combine scientific objectivity with the claims of Christianity--a most difficult undertaking in theory, but not so difficult in practice. Some of the points require further explanation.

The term "wholeheartedly" in point one is intended to suggest that the Christian counselor is not simply "interested" in this program. He is dealing with persons as Jesus did. (Luke 15:3-7).

Interests, as specified in the second point, are of course created in good part by environmental conditioning. It is part of the Christian counselor's teaching function to create Christian interests in the young person.

There is no need to exclude either the personality problems of normal people or the occasional opportunity for job placement (point four) from the sphere of the Christian counselor.

The difference between primary and secondary impulses,

as mentioned in the sixth point, is the difference between the deeper drives of human behavior and the more easily measured surface traits. It may be possible to interpret this distinction theologically or from the standpoint of the social sciences.

The tenth point is intimately related to the third. There can be no healthy use of nondirective techniques in Christian vocational guidance until a foundation of Christian understanding has been established. If the concept of Vocation as set forth in the previous chapter can be made the basis of the program, there is less likelihood that the nondirective counseling will start from some adolescent whim or caprice.

## 2. Collaboration with the State.

Assuming the desirability of a Church program of Christian vocational guidance, the problem still faces us as to how such a program would collaborate with existing vocational guidance agencies operating under state control. The clue to a solution might be taken from the suggestion of the Swiss counseling expert, Miss Baehr. Her proposal of cooperation between pastor and vocational counselor would give the ministers considerable freedom to develop the concept of Vocation in their work with youth of the local parish.

In Britain, and to a lesser extent in the United States, the amicable relationship between the Church and public

education is conducive to a degree of cooperation. It is not the purpose of this thesis to suggest the specific cooperation to be sought. There should be a minimum of overlapping, for the Church's whole aim should be to supplement rather than to duplicate the state vocational guidance program. Ideally the situation would be reversed: the state would supplement the Church's program of Christian vocational instruction with guidance at its own levels.

There seems no reason why a minister who wants to guide his young people vocationally should not familiarize himself with the more practical achievements of the vocational guidance movement. That a working knowledge of psychology is a positive asset to the parish minister is a fact widely recognized today. For his own increased efficiency a minister should have a general knowledge of the standard psychological tests in use. Many ministers are in fact using them regularly in youth work, and report them to be of great value in establishing rapport with young people.

There is an added question, however: should the minister go further in vocational guidance and help his young people to find the right job or position? Miss Baehr's conclusion was:

It is very difficult to keep in contact with all the different professions if you only give vocational guidance occasionally. Therefore it might be well if the minister cooperated with the guidance counselor, and instead of giving the youngster complete guidance, were to deal with specific problems of vocation or personality, and leave the question of actual placement to the state counselor.

In actual practice, however, ministers have helped thousands of young people to find jobs--in Switzerland no doubt as in Britain and America. Since such activity does seem to get into the clerical calendar whether it is supposed to or not, it might be reasonable to see that ministers were provided with information that would make their efforts less haphazard. Metropolitan cities regularly publish occupational guides to assist young people in surveying the openings in the labor market and in the professions. Such publications have been issued in Edinburgh by the Educational Advisory Committee for Juvenile Employment, and in Glasgow by the Careers Council. They would have a useful place in a local minister's library, even though he is hardly expected to become an employment officer. The minister does not lose prestige among his young people when he is able to provide practical as well as theological information.

To illustrate ways of collaboration with the state, a practical situation may be chosen and examined for its possibilities from the viewpoint of Christian vocational guidance. In Dalton, Massachusetts, a secondary school has instituted a "Career Determination Program" to "help youth to help himself in becoming a self-determining individual".<sup>17</sup> The elective course for juniors and seniors consists of one year's study of "Career Essentials" and a second year's study

---

17. Career Determination, art. in Trends, Nov. 1950, 16.



of "Career Selection and Planning". The following extract is taken from a descriptive article:

High school juniors in Dalton who elect Career Essentials attend one class each week to learn the basic requirements of a broad field of career selections. The course covers major elements of all careers in relation to the individual's family, social and community relationships...the economic value of general education (!) and extra curricular activities...the effect of careers on health, environment, marriage, social obligations and personal characteristics developed by particular professional and business occupations. General principles and philosophies helpful to all careers are not overlooked and are explained in relation to their satisfaction from doing well a creative or productive job.

The senior course in Selection and Planning exposes important characteristics of different careers through comparisons of their requirements and the chances for success for individual students. After reviewing briefly career fields and occupational areas and job opportunities, the course gives students sound fundamentals in attaining placement.

The Dalton plan has a six-point program:

To enable the graduate to make a complete inventory of his own assets and liabilities.

To determine work patterns of interest...and to provide occupational information concerning the work of the student's choice.

To appraise opportunities in limited career fields...

To match personal qualifications with requirements...

To plan procedure following graduation...

To make the personal contacts required for placement.

In the Dalton plan may be glimpsed the nature of the Church's problem in seeking to collaborate with state agencies. The most pertinent facts revealed are:

(1). The Dalton plan anticipates no interest by the Church in its program. "Career determination" is implicitly regarded

as separate from ecclesiastical functions. Yet the plan has enlisted the aid of industry, business, service clubs and government offices, all of which are presumed to have vocational interest.<sup>18</sup>

(2). An eclectic educational philosophy, aimed at producing work satisfactions, is substituted for the concept of Vocation. This philosophy is considered sufficient to cover such important fields as the relation of work to health, to marriage and the family, and to community relationships. It further presumes to be able to "inventory completely" a young person's "assets and liabilities".

(3). The counseling remains individualistic. The welfare of the social order, that is to say God's creation, apparently is not directly considered, although it is to preserve that order that most work is done at all. The emphasis at Dalton seems to lie rather upon "chances for success for individual students".

The Dalton plan, the Eureka School plan and other modern guidance schemes are genuine steps in the direction of more useful and worthwhile living, and the criticisms of procedure made here are not intended to be a complete analysis. They

---

18. Deliberate efforts to interest the local churches were made under the Eureka, Calif., School Plan, which was launched two decades earlier along similar vocational lines. That the churches failed to respond as rapidly as did civic organizations indicates how great is the need for wider discussion of the meaning of Vocation. Cf. Allen, Practice in Vocational Guidance, 27.

are designed to show rather the value of establishing a creative relationship between the Church and the state-controlled vocational guidance program. There is a great deal that the Church can learn, and in turn can offer without compromising the principle of separation of Church and state which is so essential to the American tradition. A strong concept of Vocation, sedulously and intelligently taught by the Church could prove to be both the critic and the conscience of the state vocational guidance movement in the local community.

The Dalton plan is of course an American phenomenon, and would be considerably modified before ever being instituted in the British school system. Yet if, as is suggested, British educators and labor administrators are moving toward similar goals, the path of action is indicated. Rapport between the Church and the state authorities should be exploited to the full in order that Vocation may assume its rightful place in the training of a Christian nation.

One way of bringing Vocation into the thinking of government agencies, whether British or American or otherwise, is the arrangement of conferences between Christian leaders and state vocational experts. As vocational counselors are usually receptive to any sign of interest on the part of the Church, a lay vocational conference under Christian auspices

is certain to produce stimulating thought.<sup>19</sup> With such a concrete proposal, leading as it does to new fields of inquiry, the body of the thesis may properly be brought to a close. The research has isolated a need and has even suggested a possible line of activity; it cannot legitimately do more.

### Conclusion.

The basic problem of the present study was seen to be not the overcoming of opposition from secular agencies, but the revitalizing of a word which had gone stale.<sup>20</sup> That staleness was not altogether due to inept thinking about Vocation by churchmen; it was partly caused also by the problem of modern man and his work.

It now appears to be clear that if the present-day Christian Church can claim its heritage and apply itself seriously to its historical tradition, the resources for a solid doctrine of Vocation with modern relevance can be found. The problems of adapting such a doctrine to the types of work that Christians have to do may be difficult, but at least they can be squarely faced.

---

19. Remarkable advances have been made on the continent of Europe in bringing together Christian workers in the same trade or profession--technicians, solicitors, doctors, farmers etc.--for vocational conferences dealing with matters of common interest, from the standpoint of Christian faith. For details see S. de Dietrich, ed., Professional Life as Christian Vocation; also Jahresbericht des Vereins "Reformierte Heimstätte für den Kanton Zürich," 1949 and 1950, Boldern ob Männedorf, Switzerland.

20. See pp. 43-4.



Once the Church has reached a fair unanimity on the concept of Vocation, it has a robust opportunity to use that concept in guiding Christian young people as they face the world. The increasing efforts at state guidance make it clear that the opportunity will not last indefinitely. Meanwhile however it is still rich with possibilities. The educational experts are not unfriendly. The youth of the Church are responsive. The theology behind such guidance is sound. The issue seems to come home to rest with the willingness of the Christian minister to respond to the challenge.

"Many a conversation with a minister is spoiled," Oldham once said, "because the other party is afraid the minister is going to take the answer out of his pocket." One of the basic stipulations to Christian vocational guidance is the minister's eagerness to study not only the history of the Bible and the Reformation, but the lessons that the secular life around him has to teach. If that condition is fulfilled, the possibilities in the field are limitless.

The task of Luther in the Reformation was, symbolically speaking, to free Vocation from confinement in the cloister. The task today, symbolically speaking, is to place the work Vocation not only in the Encyclopedia of Vocational Guidance but in the Dictionary of Everyday Life. Difficult as it seems today, with indifference and antagonism to faith apparently on the increase, the situation could scarcely have looked much more hopeful in the early sixteenth century when Luther

began to take seriously the problem of Vocation. The element most needed now may be neither intelligence, nor the mastery of technique, nor ecclesiastical zeal. Rather it may be, as in the past, simply a fresh examining by a small group of earnest Christians of the underlying purpose and significance of the Spirit, the gifts, and the Call of God.

### Summary.

There is reciprocal value to be derived from a closer relationship between the Church's concept of Vocation and the state-controlled vocational guidance program. The Church, by pointing to new dimensions in guidance, can help to elevate the state's goals, while the state can bring useful and practical considerations into the Church's formulations. For the Church to allow the servants of the state to take complete charge of the direction of youth would be disastrous, yet the signs are pointing in that direction.

Educators in the western democracies have never been inimical to the interest of the Church in youth guidance. Today preliminary efforts in the field are being made by some American churches, while in Great Britain the climate is growing more favorable for experiment.

The entry of the minister-counselor into the guidance field heightens the need for a clear statement as to what he is seeking to do. A tentative statement is attempted in the "Decalogue". Some of the opportunities and problems connected with the minister's entry are illustrated in such phenomena as the "Dalton Plan" in Massachusetts. One valuable method of entry might be the holding of conferences for lay educators and vocational experts under Christian auspices, along lines now being used on the continent of Europe.

There are the resources for a solution of the relation of Vocation to vocational guidance in the Biblical and Reformation heritage. The minister's willingness to learn is the main ingredient now needed, for the interest of the educators and the young people is manifest.



## APPENDIX

# AN EXPERIMENT IN CHRISTIAN VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE IN SCOTLAND , 1950 - 1951

1. Report of Procedure.
2. Detailed Case Study: Miss Awe.

## 1. Report of Procedure.

Since the thesis was conceived along lines of practical as well as historical research, the question may be raised: Pending the development of Christian vocational guidance on a wide scale, is there anything that can be done now vocationally by the average minister for the young people in his parish?

In an attempt to answer such a question, an experiment was undertaken between January and May, 1950, at Newington and St. Leonard's Church, Edinburgh, with a group of fifteen young people drawn from the Sunday Afternoon Bible Class and the Youth Club. There were advantages in the choice of this church. It is neither well-equipped nor wealthy--hence the experiment had no "coddling". It is located in an older, industrialized section of the city, and the church members are drawn for the most part from the poor-white-collar and skilled-labor groups. The minister has served the parish capably for ten years. His abilities have received some recognition in the city, and in earning the degree of Bachelor of Education he has won the confidence and friendship of academic leaders. While his congregations are not large, his popularity among the youth of his parish has grown steadily.

The minister was receptive to the suggestion of an experiment in Christian vocational guidance, and commended it to his young people. As the Experimenter (hereafter to be designated

as E.) I was cordially welcomed. Throughout the experiment the cooperation from the minister (hereafter to be designated as M.) and the young people remained at a high level.

The form and continuity of the experiment was arranged in conferences. No attempt was made to set up special conditions which would be difficult for the average minister to reproduce. The one feature of this experiment which differed from an average church vocational guidance project based on similar lines, was the presence of two persons rather than one in the counseling capacity. As it developed, the dual relationship proved an asset in the preinterview stages, when E. was still relatively unfamiliar with his subjects, but was dropped after the first round of interviews when it appeared that the presence of three persons was hindering free expression.

After two months of preparatory work in which study materials and tests were arranged, the latter in conference with Dr. Semeonoff of the University of Edinburgh, the experiment was commenced in January, 1950. A procedural record of activity follows:

January 8, Sunday: Talk by E. at the church before a "Church Community" group of 35 adults and young people, in which the proposed experiment was discussed. Simultaneous appearance of parish magazine containing article by E., "Guidance for Our Church Youth".

January 15, Sunday: Morning worship conducted at the church by E. Sermon delivered on topic, "The Calling of the

Lord". Text, Romans 12:6, "Having gifts that differ according to the grace given to us, let us use them."

January 22, Sunday: Opening of experiment's first session in afternoon. Number enrolled, 18.<sup>1</sup> Opening devotions and closing prayer. Materials studied: "Boxing the Future's Compass, I". Comment on materials: The study sheet, which was read in turns, was a synthesis of collected data which introduced the concept of Christian vocation to the group. Criticism appears below.

January 29, Sunday: Second session of experiment. Number attending, 15. Meeting opened with special devotions and closed with prayer. Materials used: 1) Revised Beta Examination, a non-verbal I.Q. performance test (McGill University, Montreal); 2) Reasoning Test, developed by British War Office Selection Board in World War II, verbal, non-I.Q., standardized with British norms and percentiles. Comment on materials: satisfactory.

February 5, Sunday: Third session of experiment. Number attending, 14. Opening devotions and closing prayer. Materials used: 1) Bell Adjustment Inventory (Stanford University, U.S.A.); 2) Allport-Vernon Ethical Values Test (Houghton-Mifflin, Boston); 3) A self-description: "Write a description of yourself as (a) your best friend and (b) your worst enemy would describe you." Comment on materials: Allport-Vernon's vocabulary proved

---

1. The number dropped to fifteen, all of whom completed the tests and interviews. Absentees made up the work in special sessions.



too difficult for some subjects, and is on the whole unnecessarily complex. The self-description would have been more satisfactory if, instead of "worst enemy", the words "severest critic" had been substituted.

February 12, Sunday: Fourth session of experiment. Number attending, 12. Opening devotions and closing prayer. Materials studied: "Boxing the Future's Compass, II". Materials used: Murray Thematic Apperception Test (TAT) in adapted form. (Harvard University, U.S.A.) Comment on materials: The study sheets as presented need complete revision to conform to the concept of Vocation set forth in this thesis, and additional study hours are required. The TAT adaptation consisted of the following instructions: "Select a picture card from the pile, on which you would like to write an imaginative story dealing with life work. It may be true if you wish, dramatic if you wish, and as long as you wish. Write at least two hundred words."

February 19, Sunday: Fifth session of experiment. Number attending, 14. Opening devotions and closing prayer. Materials used: California Occupational Interest Inventory (Lee-Thorpe, Los Angeles, U.S.A.) Comment on materials: satisfactory. The "OII" is a new inventory questionnaire which has won wide popularity in America. Several words were altered to conform with British usage.

February 26, Sunday: Sixth session of experiment. Number attending, 11. Forthcoming interview procedure was explained

by E., who then introduced the special speaker, Mr. James Goodbrand, local Youth Employment Officer. Meeting closed with prayer. Comment on session: From the point of view of the experiment, the chief difficulty was not unexpected. The speaker made no effort to link his discussion with the concept of Christian Vocation. The fault was not his, since his normal frame of reference was secular. The officer's discussion concerned "choosing the job, finding the job and keeping the job", and took up technical problems of youth employment which are not the intimate concern of the Church. Christian vocational guidance is more interested in general areas of choice and in motivation than in specific job selection.

February 27, Monday: First interview. Prior to this interview, two extended conferences were held between M. and E., during which each of the fifteen young people was discussed in the light of the test results.

March 26, Sunday: Seventh session of Experiment. Purpose, evaluation. Number attending, 9. Discussion was held on the value of various phases. Certain technical changes in the tests and the method of conducting them were recommended; for example, it was suggested that the two I. Q. tests be given on different days, and that the OII should not betray its scoring categories by listing them in the front of the test. A significant discussion arose over the question of standardizing the experimental procedure for use in the average church. An excerpt from

stenographic notes of the meeting is enlightening in this respect:

"Mr. Lydoch suggested that the relationship in the experiment was a bit complicated by the added presence of M.; that in his opinion the giving of tests and conducting of interviews should be done ordinarily without the minister being present. Mr. Morar agreed with this; in fact all seemed to. E. asked if this meant that they did not consider the average minister to be able to give this vocational guidance, with the help of a little training. Miss Nevis replied, "You are a tester. You know what individual differences are. How can you say that the 'average' minister is able to do this?"

"Do you mean," asked E., "that an expert should come in and do it?"

"I think it would be better to have the test given by someone from the outside," said Mr. Lydoch.

"Why not have a group of experts going around?" asked Miss Nevis. "And if the ministers are to test young people, then the ministers should be given a test first."

"Some people would talk over their personal problems with a specialist more readily than they would with a minister," said Mr. Kinross. "I don't feel that most ministers could do this kind of thing."

"If they do, they should get some training in the subject at college," said Miss Nevis.

April 23, Sunday: Special meeting to explore ways of presenting publicly some of the insights gained during the experiment. Number attending, 10. A panel discussion was decided upon, with four young people as members of the panel and E. acting as moderator.

May 7, Sunday: Preparatory meeting of panel.

May 21, Sunday: Public panel discussion at evening service, Newington and St. Leonard's Church. Number attending, 75. Opening devotions followed by young people's talks. General discussion ensued with questions from the floor. Panel members were Miss Awe, Miss Garry, Mr. Kinross, Mr. Morar. Meeting closed by M. Comment on session: This public presentation would have been more fruitful, in E.'s opinion, if there had been a clearer understanding as to the meaning of Christian Vocation as a combination of witness and work. Lacking such a definite concept, the young people were unable to define their objectives simply, and the sense of the meeting afterward was that the congregation was intensely interested, but was uncertain as to the significance of the experiment for the Church. Nevertheless the discussion provided a satisfactory conclusion to the work of the experiment, and some significant reactions were recorded. There follows an excerpt from the panel talk by Miss Garry:

I must say that the experiment did not change me from the direction I was already traveling. We were all told not to expect to find the course of our lives to be changed completely. It may have been the case that some of us were already



on the right track of our life work but didn't know it. I found that my life work is not to be in the business world that I'm in just now, but to be what I think almost every girl wants to be in her future life, a mother. I wasn't disappointed to hear that because I don't think I would like to be a career girl and spend the rest of my life in an office. Some of you might say "But that's a natural thing for a girl to be." Of course it is, but perhaps some of you aren't aware that Motherhood is a Vocation and it certainly is a life work.

My Vocation wasn't the only thing I found out. I discovered quite a few things about myself which I didn't know and probably wouldn't have known because I just didn't take time to think seriously about myself. Vocational Guidance gave me that time to sit down and really think and by answering questions set down on paper, bring out the unknown facts about myself. They might have been good; they might have been bad but they made me see that perhaps I'm not such a bad person as I thought I was after all; or "that's a bad fault, I'll try and better myself in future".

I also discovered the range of my intelligence which is important with regard to my occupation at present. I found that I wasn't brilliant and I wasn't stupid but had the intelligence of the average person and that the job I am doing at present is quite satisfactory.

I would like to say that I have enjoyed taking part in this experiment. It has been very interesting and it has been fun. I think it has been worth doing.

To analyze the experiment properly it will now be necessary to introduce in a more formal manner the fifteen young people who participated in it. All of them were Scottish by birth, all of them had lived in Edinburgh for many years if not all their lives, and had for some time past taken part in the activ-

ities of Newington and St. Leonard's Church. None of them had had an emotional conversion experience, yet all of them counted themselves members of the Christian community, and each disclosed in his own way some genuine Christian insights. Some of them came from rather poor homes, none of them from wealthy or even upper middle class homes--none of them, for example, possessed a telephone. All came into the experiment voluntarily with the possible exception of the twins, who were influenced by their father.

To conceal identity each young person in the experiment has been given the name of a Scottish loch.

Mr. Morar, 27, was the eldest. He was studying at home and hoping to be able to enter the University school of pharmacy. Quiet, level-headed, well liked and active in the church, he had been a war time conscientious objector, had once sought to study medicine.

Mr. Shin, 26, was a civil servant who had already achieved a post of some responsibility. Brilliant, clean-cut but rather unsociable, he had a slight psychiatric history in the army, and unlike his younger brother had a hard time adjusting to life and especially to women.

Miss Eck, 23, showed intelligence equalled only by Mr. Shin, but was not as nervous. She was engaged to a classics teacher and during the time of the experiment she secured employment as a social worker for a Christian denomination.

Miss Awe, 22, was secretary to a school headmaster. A

study of her case appears later in the report.

Mr. Lomond, 22, was a fireman on the British Railways. He was "the life of the party", a solidly-built, rather noisy young man whose feelings were easily hurt, but whom everyone liked with the exception of those with whom he got into fights.

Miss Nevis, 21, although of only ordinary intelligence, soon made her presence felt in any group as a keen personality. She displayed more leadership and less shyness than any of the others, was active in child social work and engaged to be married.

Mr. Kinross, 20, served in North Africa, also had a slight psychiatric history in the army, was preparing to enter a university. He planned to be a minister in the Church of Scotland. He appeared somewhat nervous and uncertain, yet critical and aggressive, with some leadership tendencies.

Miss Garry, 18, clerkess, seemed more mature than her years. She had a sense of moral obligation and Christian duty which overcame some of her natural shyness. Pleasantly attractive, she steadied the others and proved a most useful member of the group.

Miss Tay, 18, intelligent and quietly pretty, left school at age fifteen with her two girl friends and now regretted it. She was vocationally maladjusted and suffered acutely from shyness; though she liked boys, she sought refuge in intense girl friendships.

Miss Frisa, 18, close friend of Miss Tay, was similar to

her in appearance, personality and aims, though less intelligent. More self-effacing even than her friend, she considered herself a pale copy of her brilliant older sister. She was vocationally maladjusted.

Miss Shiel, 17, third member of the trio, had just begun work as a comptometer operator for a firm and did not anticipate returning to school. Her intelligence scores were lowest of the fifteen, and her personality was quiet and retiring, except when with her friends.

Mr. Earn, 17, a strapping young Scotsman with natural charm, had the consuming ambition to make the sea his life work. Failure to realize this hope and to overcome his parents' objections had made him a growing problem to all his associates and to himself.

Mr. Lydoch, 16, an intelligent, handsome and sincere Christian youth, was clearly puzzled as to what his future life work should be, though he had certain strong scientific interests. His natural appeal was heightened through his general usefulness.

Miss Aline, 13, more a child than a girl, proved to be a cheerful and compliant young person who had very clear ideas about her vocational future as a dress designer.

Miss Rannoch, 13, was more solemn and more shy than her twin sister, Miss Aline, but equally immature. She had plans to become a teacher of small children.

It must be remembered that what was sought in the experi-



ment was a method for bringing Christian vocational guidance into the lives of young people. There was no attempt made to conduct scientific research into personality problems or to measure human reactions under varying conditions. Only in certain cases was anything more than a perfunctory assessment made of home and school life. The experimenter was not concerned to establish his proficiency as a tester or even to apologize for his errors in selecting tests and in matters of counseling technique. The task at hand was the fashioning of a working method by which the Christian Church might assist young people in making the best and the most out of their life work.

Eight questions may now properly be asked of the experiment, in order to develop its relevance to the general thesis:

Who had vocational problems?

Who had personality problems?

Where was practical action indicated?

What concrete improvements resulted?

What opportunities were used for applying the Gospel of Jesus Christ?

What was wrong with the failures?

Which units proved most valuable?

What elements seemed to have universal validity?

To proceed to the answers:

1. Who had vocational problems?

The validity of the distinction between vocational and

personality problems may appear as we proceed. Five of the fifteen subjects had no specific vocational problems, for they had deliberately chosen their life work. Miss Nevis and Miss Eck, in addition to being satisfactorily employed in social work, were both engaged to be married. The twins, Miss Aline and Miss Rannoch, expressed desires to be dress designer and teacher, respectively. Mr. Lomond was enthusiastic over his work as a railway fireman. Of the others, four were working at jobs in which they were dissatisfied.

Mr. Earn. "I do office work in a shop that sells nautical goods. I took the job to please my folks, and because it did have the nautical angle. But I can't get interested in it."

Miss Tay. "I work in an office and do just routine filing. I don't like it. I've been there two years, and am sorry now that I left school. I keep watching the papers for jobs."

Miss Garry. "My present work is a clerkess. I was trained to do shorthand and typing, but I get no shorthand and almost no typing. I don't think there's opportunity for advancement with this firm."

Miss Frisa. "I'm a file clerk, that sort of thing." E.: "Do you like your work?" "Not much." "You don't like your job?" "No, it's boring." "How?" "Oh, too much routine and all that." "Would you like a different job?" "Yes, I'd like to leave, but I don't know where to go."

The resultant unhappiness was mild in Miss Garry, stronger in Miss Frisa and Miss Tay, and acute in Mr. Earn. It was not a question of menial work or low pay, for they were quite aware that young workers must start at the bottom. For each

the problem was adaptation, and all felt they belonged in a different type of activity. Three others, Mr. Shin, Mr. Morar and Mr. Kinross, had a fair liking for the work they were in or heading toward, but were not certain that it was the right Vocation for them.

Mr. Shin. "I like my present work, and mean to stick to it, but even so I feel I have not altogether 'found myself' yet. I am willing to take any considered advice that will help me to see how I fit in, and if it works, to try to find out how to pass on the lessons to new entrants in my own job."

Mr. Morar. "I am very interested in finding out if there is any special gift which I possess. I am studying for a profession at present and I wonder if it really is suitable for me."

Mr. Kinross. "You remember I was talking to you about the ministry. Well, now I'm not so sure. I wonder if I'm not better fitted for something else."

Of the three remaining, Mr. Lydoch was leaving school shortly with apparently only the vaguest notions as to his future work.

Mr. Lydoch. "I'd like to find a job doing something, but I'm not sure what kind of a job I would like, because I don't know what I want to do yet."

Miss Awe, as will be seen in her case report, was concerned as to whether she was really qualified to be a teacher.

Miss Shiel had just entered a new position and was still becoming adjusted to her surroundings. On the surface she seemed to have no vocational problem, but there were hints in her interview that her real interest was motherhood.

## 2. Who had personality problems?

On the basis of the limited information gathered during the experiment, three of the fifteen appeared to have no personality problems. Miss Nevis, Miss Aline and Mr. Lydoch seemed well-balanced, fairly happy young people, not perfect specimens either of psychological integration or Christian saintliness, but satisfactorily normal, reliable young subjects, with a good sense of religious values.

Acute shyness was a problem to four, Miss Tay, Miss Frisa, Miss Shiel and Miss Rannoch. Because of the Scot's proverbial reserve, and because at least twelve of the fifteen were more retiring than aggressive in demeanor, only those whose shyness was marked need be considered.

(Miss Frisa.) M.: "You know, you have never been very free and open in your conversation with me." "But I don't know you very well."  
"You have known me for years!"

Miss Tay. "I knew if I took the job I would be thrown among strange people. They told me I'd be with a lot of girls my own age, and I didn't much care for that." E.:  
"Why?" "Oh, they are inclined to be jolly and like that."

Four of the young people stated definitely in the interviews that they were troubled by sex problems.

Mr. Shin. "I have a terrible facility for making up dirty jokes. Then I get sick of it all."  
(Gesture like vomiting). (In response to query) "Yes, I'm afraid of sex, I admit it."

(Miss Garry.) E.: "Is anything really bothering you as you look toward a Vocation as wife and mother?" "No, I guess not. Well,--" M.:  
"What is it?" "Sex!"



Miss Tay. "Every night before I go to bed I look in it to see if there is a snake in it." E.: "That might mean fear of sex." "I wondered when you'd get around to that."

Three of the young people indicated that they were troubled by temper tantrums.

Mr. Shin. "Did you ever see a terrier shake a rat? That's the way I feel sometimes. I get the shakes all over, I get so mad."

Mr. Lomond. "I didn't care if he was a corporal or who he was, he couldn't tell me that. So I let him have it. Then I did time in the guardhouse."

Mr. Earn. (to M.) "I received Mr. E.'s letter all right, but I thought it was from the trawler people about coming to work. When I found it wasn't I got so mad I tore it up. Then I couldn't answer it because I didn't have the address."

Three current problems of home adjustment came to light in the experiment. They involved Mr. Earn, Miss Eck and Mr. Morar.

Miss Eck. "My being a Christian has put me on a different level of values from the way my folks look at things, in a way. I would have left home and gone to London if my fiancé hadn't come along."

Mr. Earn. "Yes, I'm the only child, and I feel as if I should try to please my parents. But once I did make the break, I think it would be all right. I know Dad wouldn't say I couldn't go, lock me in my room or anything like that. If I could just get to sea, get started, they'd get adjusted to it."

Mr. Morar. "It's pretty hard to study at home. I live with two aunts and my father."

Three of the young people had personality problems which were rather individual. Miss Awe's moodiness will be discussed later in the report. Mr. Kinross had facial ticks, a rather belligerent air and a facility for making those around him

uneasy, all of which betrayed an inner conflict which did not come out in the course of the experiment. Mr. Morar identified his problem as "laziness". Whatever may have been the cause of his inertia, it had corrupted his study habits and caused him to fail twice in his efforts to enter pharmacy school.

In considering the personality characteristics of the group as a whole, E. was attentive to note any marks which could be considered typical. The wide range of ages made it difficult to uncover facts on which generalizations could be built. Some of the young people had been active in the recent war, others were very young when it ended. Yet all of them were children of the twentieth century, all of them lived in one of the western democracies, and came from a particular urban and church environment. The common characteristics which E. noted in particular were as follows:

(1). A lack of aggressiveness in outlook toward the future.

(2). A lack of self-confidence in relations with other persons.

(3). A feeling of "lostness" in the disharmony of the present world, composed partly of bewilderment, partly of dismay, and partly of active fear.

The lack of aggressiveness is particularly noticeable when one compares the statements of these young people about their desire not to leave home, with the adventuring traditions of the Scots in centuries past. They evidenced no sense of

mission. As for self-confidence, only one of the fifteen showed a real quantity of it--Mr. Earn, the prospective sailor. The feeling of "lostness" was of course to be expected, in view of the legacy which our century has handed these young people.

On the positive side many splendid virtues could be attributed to the young people of the experiment; certainly they were a credit to their nation and their race. Perhaps the most noteworthy to an outsider is the uncomplaining way in which they sought to make the best of their lot, despite their handicaps.

### 3. Where was practical action indicated?

It is in the sphere of practical action that our method of Christian vocational guidance meets a crucial test. If the minister takes too much action he can be said to be usurping or overlapping the practical duties of the vocational guidance bureau. If he takes no action he can hardly be said to be a good pastor. If the young people get direct advice from the minister and act upon it, there is danger involved; but if nothing is done the guidance is of little use. E. did take some practical action in the course of the interviews, but the experiment indicated in the main simply the direction in which action should be taken.

Three of the girls definitely needed frank and comprehensive instruction in the Christian understanding of sex. Their cases were urgent, for sex problems were already harassing their lives. Three other girls, including the two who were engaged,

could have profited by attending such instruction.

Continued counsel seemed imperative in the cases of Mr. Earn, Mr. Kinross and Mr. Shin. Each of these three young men needed an older, wiser friend who would act as a safety valve for their grievances and would provide spiritual resources for their doubts. Each of them was finding the business of living difficult, and each of them would have continued the interviews had it been possible.

Help with studies was needed by five of the young people. Yet it was not actual assistance in the studies themselves that they needed, so much as the intimate concern and encouragement of an interested party who would make suggestions regarding study habits and personal discipline, and inquire after their progress. In short, they needed help at exactly that point where a minister in a pastoral relationship could give it.

One young man, Mr. Lydoch, received a direct stimulus to his vocational thinking as the interviews narrowed his choice to civil engineering. It could be maintained that in this case the experiment overlapped the functions of a state vocational guidance bureau, for E. telephoned the careers choice expert of the Ministry of Labour and received the names of leading civil engineers in the city, which he passed on to Mr. Lydoch, encouraging him to call or write. It might have been sufficient had E. merely given the name of the careers choice expert, or the Youth Employment Officer, to Mr. Lydoch, letting



them provide him with the professional information.

#### 4. What concrete improvements resulted?

Any claims in the field of improvement must be extremely tentative. To be sure, certain improvements were noticed during the four months of the experiment, but it would be presumptuous to say that they were the result of the tests, studies and interviews. At the same time there is no doubt that the experiment had some kind of effect on every young person who entered it, and probably in many cases it was a good effect.

A clear sharpening of the choice of Vocation was noted in seven of the fifteen. Mr. Shin, Mr. Morar and Mr. Earn were simply confirmed in the paths they had already chosen. Mr. Shin's written statement at the conclusion of the experiment compares well with his opening remarks (above):

Mr. Shin. I regard my life work as being in the field of government service and public administration, with a leaning to individual case-work. The tests have confirmed most clearly that my aptitudes are on the same lines as these interests.

Miss Tay and Miss Frisa began increasing their efforts to get into different types of work, and made plans to resume night school. Miss Garry made a public statement regarding her intended Vocation which she probably would not have made had there been no experiment. Mr. Lydoch, as has been indicated, began to think for the first time about civil engineering.

Mr. Lydoch. "What does a civil engineer do?"  
 "He surveys, makes calculations and draws maps."  
 "Then that would use my maths, and it would give me instruments to operate, and I would

have plans. He draws up plans, doesn't he?"  
 "Yes, plans and blueprints." "I might like  
 to be a civil engineer."

Miss Awe and Mr. Earn received some confirmation of their choice of life work from the experiment, although it was less significant. Miss Rannoch's parents learned for the first time of their daughter's wish to become a kindergarten teacher.

By drawing attention to personality problems in particular cases, the experiment could be said to have paved the way for concrete improvement, although the shortness of time did not allow sufficient observation. Miss Awe, as will be seen, reported some success. Miss Eck stated in her last interview that she had gained self-confidence in dealing with people as a result of her new job, which M. had aided her in securing. Another series of interviews after the passing of some months might yield significant data as to personality improvement.

5. What opportunities were used for applying the Gospel of Jesus Christ? At this point the writer feels the experiment was weakest. He tended to avoid or to postpone spiritual questions because of the pressing nature of the material facts. He realized afterward that he had failed to speak of God simply and naturally at each interview, and concluded that he was fearful of being accused of "dragging in religion", a fear which was quite unjustifiable considering the environment and circumstances. This reluctance only made it more difficult for the young people themselves to speak of Christian matters. As will be seen, there were indeed Christian discussions both in

the group sessions and in the interviews, but that they could have been improved upon is not to be doubted.

In ten of the fifteen cases only slight application of the Gospel was made in any form. The young people attended the study sessions, but God was not related to their present or future work in any personal way. The reason for this failure, in E.'s opinion, is that at the time of the experiment he had not come to a clear understanding of the way in which the sense of Christian Vocation can be applied in modern life. Without such understanding he could only indulge in generalizations such as the following:

(Mr. Lydoch.) E.: "Do you think you could serve God and make a contribution to mankind as a civil engineer?" "Yes, and it would give me a chance to do something social, like the test showed." (Mr. Lydoch was referring to social service, in which his scores were fairly high.)

Only in the prayers which closed most of the interviews could it be said that serious effort was made to apply the Gospel, and the prayers were brief.

Nevertheless there were occasions in the interviews with the other five young people when Christian conversations did progress past the stage of generalizations, and in which there was little or no reticence.

(Mr. Shin.) E.: "Do you remember Jesus and the disciples on the water? They were tugging at the oars, anxious, knocking themselves out." "Yes, that's a great story, isn't it. I remember, he was asleep." "And when they woke him he said, 'What are you worrying about?"

What's the fuss?' And he not only calmed the waves, he calmed their spirits." "I wish I could have that!" "You might try at your desk, when you begin to get upset, just unclenching and shutting your eyes in prayer, and asking the Lord to take away your fear." "Good."

The same biblical incident came naturally into conversation with Mr. Earn, the prospective sailor. In the case of Miss Eck, forgiveness was discussed as a means of overcoming home resentments. Both Mr. Kinross and Mr. Morar discussed church work at some length. Miss Nevis' TAT story yielded a fruitful discussion.

Miss Nevis. "I was trying to show the old man's Christian charity in taking the girl in and sheltering her."

E. "You were interested in practical Christianity, rather than the mystical aspects?"

M. "It is an extravert type of story."

Miss Nevis. "I think that the visitor was uplifted spiritually and nourished through her immediate needs being attended to in a Christian manner. Like when the disciple washed Jesus' feet."

E. "Do you mean, when Jesus washed the disciples' feet?"

Miss Nevis. "I don't mean that. I mean when the woman ministered to him with ointment, and he said, 'This woman has done a beautiful thing.' Anyone can give, but when a Christian gives he is not giving of his own, but is sharing God's gifts with another."

Miss Nevis' understanding of "sharing" was directly related to her sense of Vocation, for she declared she intended to make her future home a refuge for unfortunate children.

Finally, the Christian attitude to sex was discussed in interviews with Mr. Shin, Miss Garry and Miss Tay, and appropriate literature was provided.



As has been suggested, the opportunities for applying the Gospel were not fully realized in the experiment, but the writer became more convinced than ever that personal vocational counseling is a natural opening for discussion between a young person and his pastor about the Christian interpretation of life.

#### 6. What was wrong with the failures?

Two of the young people were not old enough to benefit from the experiment. They were the 13-year-old twins, Miss Aline and Miss Rannoch. In another year or two it appeared that they would have been ready for some kind of guidance, even Christian vocational guidance. The minimum age for such an experiment as the present one seems to be about fifteen and one-half years.

The case of Mr. Kinross did not seem to develop satisfactorily either during the testing and study sessions or during the interviews. In the final interview he appeared to be more unsettled than ever as to his Calling to the ministry. The reasons for his state of mind were not divulged. Doubts, to be sure, are often a valuable asset to a young prospective minister, but Mr. Kinross may have been struggling with something more than intellectual doubts.

Directive counseling and off-hand advice tended to spoil two interviews. E. was able to learn through a friend that Mr. Morar was dissatisfied with his first interview, and a study of the report showed that it had been mismanaged. Mr. Morar's second interview was allowed to proceed along normal nondirective

lines, and reached a satisfactory conclusion. Mr. Shin's final interview consisted of a lot of last-minute suggestions which were given by E. without much skill or subtlety. The advice was politely acknowledged, but the free flow of discussion was impaired. These two experiences convinced E. that suggestion and advice will only be accepted by the young person when he is ready for them. Such readiness is achieved only rarely in the first interviews, and even in later stages the amount of advice the young person will absorb is extremely limited when compared to the amount that the counselor is tempted to give him.

#### 7. Which units proved most valuable?

A study of the various units in each of the fifteen cases led to the conclusion that the interviews proved to be the most important for purposes of Christian vocational counseling. Second in importance were the study sessions, despite the inadequacy of the materials studied and the shortness of time. The third most important unit seems to have been the OII, which bore directly on the question of vocational interests, but its effectiveness was nearly matched by the TAT adaptation. The latter unit yielded many significant insights through the projection technique. The remaining units, in a diminishing order of significance and usefulness, were: Bell Adjustment Inventory, Intelligence tests, evaluation meeting, panel discussion, Allport-Vernon Ethical Values test, self-description, talk by Youth Employment Officer.

The interview process was judged to be of primary importance in nine of the fifteen cases; in the other six the most useful unit was either the OII or the TAT adaptation. Usually the second interview with a young person proved more valuable than the first.

8. What elements seemed to have universal validity?

The question is directed to elements which appeared so outstanding that they should be included in any program of Christian vocational guidance. They could be classified as follows:

(i) The combination of study sessions and testing over a period of weeks or months.<sup>2</sup>

(ii) A syllabus containing a clear exposition of the meaning of Christian Vocation for the youth about to embark on his life work.

(iii) Personal interviews with each young person in a setting such as a pastor's study until some kind of vocational solution is reached.

(iv) The use of nondirective techniques by the minister or Christian counselor to enable the young person to release expression and achieve insight.

(v) An acquaintance on the minister's part with general facts about the local labor market that will make

2. If test results are available to the minister from local educational agencies in adequate form, there would seem to be no need for him to undertake a Church testing program, except possibly for supplementary data. The use of test results simply presupposes some knowledge of reading and interpreting scores, which is not difficult to acquire, as many ministers have discovered.

him a useful source of information for Christian youth.

(vi) Group discussion of common Christian vocational problems.

If the conclusions reached in this thesis are correct, there are no active churches today, either in the Protestant or Catholic tradition, that can afford to ignore the significance of Vocation for their young people.<sup>3</sup> There is need of a straightforward method for bringing the youth of the Church into direct contact with God's Call and its meaning in modern life. That need is patent to all who have observed the vocational situation from Christian premises. The use of study sessions, a proper syllabus of Vocation, test results, nondirective interviews, group discussions and current information on labor needs and conditions, may help to find the method that the Church is seeking.

---

3. The claims made for a Reformation origin of the concept of Vocation as witness in and through work, do not mean that the idea is in any sense owned or controlled by the Protestant faith. Today the Roman Catholic Church is openly applying the term Vocation more and more to "activity in the world" (see pp. 26, 118 n., and esp. 164 n.). It is quite likely that the Roman communion will undertake considerable pioneering in Christian vocational guidance in the future, as the work of priests in the Swiss forest cantons already indicates. It is also likely that medievalists will bring out new evidence to challenge the Reformation origin. The real value of Vocation, however, does not lie in its historical sources but in its universal qualities of truth and present-day usefulness.



## 2. Detailed Case Study: Miss Awe.

Miss Awe<sup>4</sup> was a Scottish girl, 22 years old and already sensitive about her age. She lived with her parents and numerous other relatives under rather crowded conditions in an older section of the city of Edinburgh. According to her friends she was very good to and was popular with her young nephews and nieces. She called herself a "clerical assistant" and served as secretary to a headmaster, a position she had held for several years. In that time she had made herself apparently an important cog in the life of the school. She had been active in the youth group of the church for several years and attended the morning services. She was of average height and weight and seemed to be possessed of normal health. The economic circumstances of her home environment were not outstanding.

---

4. The names of any one of eight other persons in the experiment could have been substituted for that of Miss Awe in the detailed case study without diminishing its value or interest. Her selection is therefore not to be considered significant in relation to the rest of the group.

In order that the persons involved may be protected, the material in this case study, as in the remainder of the experiment, is not available for reproduction without permission.

E. noticed first of all, on meeting Miss Awe, that she liked to banter and joke. In succeeding meetings he became aware that she was not a careful dresser, that she was rather blunt in her speech, and that she smoked regularly. He also learned to appreciate her good will and cooperativeness. Before the interviews it became clear that because of sensitivity her case would require more tact and caution than most.

At the time of registration she was asked, "What would you say was your present attitude toward this experiment?" She wrote, "This appears to be a very interesting experiment and I think it will be of great value to any young person who is ready to accept, on thinking it over, the results, and attempt to adjust their vocation accordingly."

The two study sessions that followed showed that Miss Awe was one of the first to participate in a group discussion, and that without any difficulty she could stir up a bristling argument. Usually but not always the antagonist was member of the opposite sex.

The first tests administered her were the Beta I.Q. and the WOSB Reasoning test. The Beta gave her a raw score of 95 which was roughly tabulated on the Beta scale as "B". Her I.Q. as computed from weighted scores was 105, which ranked her in eighth place in the group of fifteen. On the WOSB test she improved, making 25 correct answers out of 40, and scoring 105 which according to WOSB norms placed her in the 93rd percentile of the general population. Her WOSB score ranked her in fifth

place in the group of fifteen.

At the next testing session she was given the Allport Vernon Study of Values, in which she had a chance to indicate the relative significance to her of six types of values. She scored as follows: theoretical, 40 per cent; economic, 30 per cent; aesthetic, 70 per cent; social, 70 per cent; political, 20 per cent; religious, 95 per cent. It should be pointed out that five of the fifteen young people surpassed her religious score, despite its relative height.

At this testing session Miss Awe was also given the Bell Adjustment Inventory, which asks 140 questions designed to bring out in rather straightforward fashion the individual's adjustment in four key areas--home, health, social and emotional. Because the fifteen subjects were all relatively unsophisticated in test-taking, the Bell proved a useful tool. Miss Awe's scores were: home, good minus; health, average; social, average; emotional, average plus.

In company with most of the fifteen, she had a strong tendency toward shyness, even though this tendency does not appear in her total scores. She answered several questions about emotional adjustment in a rather significant way. Examples:

"Do you have ups and downs in mood without apparent cause?" Yes.

"Are you often sorry for the things you do?" Yes.

"Do you often feel just miserable?" Yes.

"Are your feelings easily hurt?" Yes.

The answers proved to be valuable handles for the interview process; and while her total scores were rather colorless, they were later judged to have been fairly accurate.

The third testing session consisted of the TAT adaptation and the self-description. The TAT picture Miss Awe selected showed a young boy seated, leaning on his elbows and gazing at a violin on the table before him. The story she wrote follows:

Malcolm is a little boy of about 12 years. He is rather a lonely child, having no brothers or sisters, and missing the love and affection of his parents who are bent on their own pleasures. His main source of joy comes from an old gramophone in the attic on which he plays and re-plays one or two old gramophone records whenever he has the chance. His favourite record is of a violin solo played by a famous violinist whose name has long since been obliterated on the gramophone disc, however, the little boy gets to know the different feelings of this violinist and dreams of having his own violin on which he would be able to tell stories of happiness and sorrow, of loneliness and friends, unfortunately, he has no violin and his dreams end with the record.

But one day Malcolm's dream becomes a reality. It is Christmas and he is wondering excitedly what will his present be this year? To his amazement on opening his parcel he finds inside a violin! The boy is overjoyed and clutches the violin finding, however, that instead of being able to bring forth wonderful music such as the violinist on the gramophone record had done he brings forth only a series of discordant grunts and scratches. He takes the violin sadly up to his room and is sitting disconsolately at it when his father, having noticed his puzzled looks, comes to explain how he will have to study very hard and practice to become such a one as his heroic gramophone violinist. Malcolm's eyes light up and from then on studies and practises incessantly finding in his violin a satisfaction which he has never before had and thinking eagerly on the day when he himself may be thrilling some little child with his playing.

The purpose of this test was to adapt the TAT to a vo-



cational guidance situation, thereby providing the counselor with some data on the subject through a projection technique. The data thus secured is considered valuable by counselors because the subject does not yield it consciously. Miss Awe's theme has an ambitious, positive tone but is not without its discordant elements. The interviews will indicate how far the story correlates with her own attitudes, and what use was made of it.

The self-description test directions were, in the original form: "Write a description of yourself as you think your best friend would write it. Then write a description of yourself as your worst enemy would write it." "Worst enemy" was later changed to "severest critic". Miss Awe's descriptions follow:

#### First Part.

Truthfully I seem to be a person who is thoughtful sympathetic and helpful in time of need. I am ready to rejoice over any little happiness and to sympathise over any misfortune. However, I am inclined towards tactlessness and am very possessive of my friend and being very easily hurt over any little point of disloyalty on her part. My moods sometimes bring me very low and causes me to treat people very nastily, however, I don't seem to remain like that very long and am never too proud to apologise to anyone if necessary.

#### Second Part.

Too much of a bleather! I am always chattering about something and forever prying into people's affairs. I always give advice even when it is not wanted and I just don't realise my place. I think far too much of myself and always making out that my business cannot get along without me. However, I have in a small way a sense of justice!

The final test to be given was the Occupational Interest Inventory, which consisted of 150 sets of alternative choice

questions. On the basis of his answers, each subject was given a percentile score which ranked his interest in six major fields. Miss Awe's scores were: personal-social, 80 per cent; natural (farming, etc.) 70 per cent; mechanical, 90 per cent; business, 1 per cent; arts, 60 per cent; science, 30 per cent. A second classification was by "types" of occupational interests. Miss Awe scored 70 per cent in "verbal", 30 per cent in "manipulatory" and 1 per cent in "computational". Finally, subjects were given a rating in "level of interests"; that is, interest in a simple or a more complicated type of work. Miss Awe scored only 30 per cent, low for one planning to be a school teacher.

The time spent in scoring this test is usually rewarding. In Miss Awe's case the "personal-social" field stood out prominently upon analysis of the individual questions. Within this field she emphasized four branches: domestic service, social service, teaching, and law enforcement. The highest interest was in social service and teaching.

Prior to the first interview, M. and E. held a series of conferences at which the fifteen subjects were discussed in turn, and the tests examined. The first interview was held on March 27, in M's study, with M., and E. both present. That which follows is a report of the interview written the same evening, from memory, in as complete form as was possible.

\* \* \*

## First Interview.

Miss Awe was present when E. arrived on schedule. He asked first if she would describe her work to him. She said she was secretary to a school headmaster; she had held the job seven years; she liked it and had been doing it since she left school at 15; that she had become interested in teaching through her job, and would like to become a teacher herself; that she was now taking the prelims with a view to entering Moray House College of Education next fall. M. asked whether marriage was any part of her future plans, and she said no, that it was not in her mind at all.

E. remarked that it was fine that she had decided on her vocation and asked if she would like to see the Occupational Interest Inventory. She looked at it with apparent interest, read the scores aloud, and was asked if she thought it was a fair reflection of her interests. She said yes, she thought it was. The mechanical score (90%) then received some criticism from her as she didn't know of any particular mechanical interests that she had. E. said the same thing had happened in another case. She noted the 80 in personal-social, 60 in arts and 70 in manipulatory, and thought these "should be about right". When E. pointed to the low scores in business and computational, she declared that she hated typing; nor was she interested in the mechanics of a typewriter.

By checking certain key answers, the choices were narrowed down to social service, teaching, domestic service, and law

and law enforcement, with the first two checked all the way through. E. suggested that she was probably right in assuming her interests to be primarily in teaching. "But does it say that I have the proper qualifications for teaching?" she asked. "That is something else," said E. "Do you think you have?" "I don't know."

"Let's look at some of the other tests," said E. The Intelligence scores were shown her. She was interested in them, and her eyes widened when she saw the 93rd percentile score on the WOSB test. After a moment's reflection she said, "I'm not at all sure that these tests have the right answer."

"Is that so?"

"Yes, I don't think they're right."

"You will not accept them."

"No."

"That's interesting. Would you mind saying why?"

"Because," said Miss Awe, "they are too high. I know I'm not very bright. In fact I am rather dumb."

"You have a feeling that you are not as good as these tests show you to be."

"Yes. I am always making myself out to be bigger than I am. I get the bighead. That's my trouble."

"Your problem is that you think you are too good."

"Yes."

"But these tests seem to suggest that it's just the other way around--you are thinking too little of yourself."



Miss Awe laughed. E. turned to the Bell Inventory, and there was a brief discussion of her home. E. asked whether it were true that she had a lot of youngsters to look after--brothers and sisters. She declared stoutly that she had no more to do than her share, and that they weren't brothers and sisters, but nephews and nieces. She admitted that she liked children and home-making and was not opposed to the general interests of a housewife, but would make no further concessions to the idea of marriage. Attention soon centered on the problem of her shyness. "I really am shy, though people don't believe it," she said.

M. commented that Miss Awe was known as a "kind of good fellow, laughing type". E. then asked, "How is it that you say you do not find it easy to make friendly contacts with members of the opposite sex?"

"I guess," Miss Awe replied, "one reason is I always set my sights too high; the people I am really interested in are not interested in me, and the ones I do seem to attract are just--" (gesture of distaste).

"You are an attractive girl. Why should you feel self-conscious of your personal appearance?" asked E.

"I'm self-conscious right now when you ask me that!"

"Let's look at the emotional," said E., and he read the statements on the Bell Inventory (miserable, often sorry, ups and downs, frequent spells of the blues, etc.). Miss Awe commented, "I was in a bad mood when I took that. Exams were just

coming up, the prelims. I think that's why I filled it out like that."

E. then read to her excerpts from her TAT story emphasizing the fluctuations: "stories of happiness and sorrow, of loneliness and friends"; Malcolm is "overjoyed"; but he "brings forth...discordant grunts and scratches". To these impressions E. added statements from her self-description: "I am ready to rejoice over any little happiness and to sympathize over any misfortune. I am inclined towards tactlessness and am very possessive of my friend, being very easily hurt over any little point..."

"Is that a possible reason for your ups and downs," asked E., "the fact that you may be rather thin-skinned?"

"You hit the nail on the head. I am very thin-skinned."

M.'s comment was, "That is not the impression you give-- it is rather the impression of being a bit tough-skinned." Miss Awe denied it. "Someone will say something," she said, "and I will be very hurt about it."

E. suggested that these personal matters were touched upon only because she had asked if she had the qualifications to be a teacher and they were seeking to find the answer. "You see," said M., "he cannot give you a direct answer to your question; that is impossible."

"Oh, I know," replied Miss Awe, "for perhaps later on if it didn't turn out I would perhaps say, he advised me wrong, and it would be wrong to blame someone else for one's own failure."

"It is interesting," noted E., "that your story ends by the little boy passing on his joy to someone else. That seems to be an essential part of your make-up, wanting to give joy to others." She nodded. E. handed her the A.-V. Ethical Values test and remarked to M., "If I were looking for a subject for some fine Christian position, it would be hard to beat these scores." M. agreed. Miss Awe's comment was, "What is aesthetic?" E. explained. She agreed that she did not place much value on scientific theory or abstract truth as such. E. attempted to summarize: "Your sense of values is excellent. You seem to be a sound sort of person. Only this matter of temperament is causing you any trouble."

"But you know," she said, "I am very confident I will make a good teacher. I am absolutely sure about that. But of course wait till my first tests, then I'll probably hit the bottom and will feel terrible."

"That's interesting--you know 'way down deep that you have the goods, but then other times you get into low moods and decide you don't."

"Yes." Pause.

"In your self-description you say you are 'too much of a bleather', and that you don't realize your place."

M. remarked, "I always thought you knew your place."

"Oh, no, I don't."

"You are pretty hard on yourself, both in the favorable and unfavorable self-descriptions," said E.

"But I know that's what my best friend thinks of me."

"Wouldn't your best friend be apt to say something like, 'She's a wonderful girl'?"

"No." Miss Awe shook her head emphatically.

"I find that in this experiment many of the young people need to be made aware that they really have something; that they are God's handiwork. Aren't you willing to concede that you have something?"

"No."

"But look at these tests!"

"I know."

"Isn't it just possible that you are being too hard on yourself? Could you not gain from this some measure of self-confidence and self-reliance, feel that you really are a worthwhile person with a fine sense of values and an attractive personality and something to give to the world?" She only smiled.

M. said, "She is resisting everything good you say about her, and taking just the bad things."

"Do you think," asked E., "that the time spent in these six weeks was worthwhile?"

"Yes."

"What do you think you got out of them?"

"I can't say." Pause. "I'll tell you one thing, I'm not going away from here very happy." She began to rise from her chair.

E. asked, "Do you feel that you have some insight into



yourself that may be helpful?"

"Yes. There is no doubt that I have up and down moods."

"You felt rather low last Sunday, didn't you."

"Yes, I did."

"I've noticed this many times," said M.

She turned to him. "More than once I've wanted to speak to you about it, and I've come to you in a rather bantering mood, but you've always been busy."

"Oh no," said M. "If you just say you have a problem, I'll be glad to talk with you anytime about it."

"Oh, I'd never do that," she laughed, putting on her coat.

"I'd just laugh and joke at first."

"I wonder," said E., "if you would like to have another interview later on, to see how things come along."

"All right." Miss Awe nodded agreeably, and added as she was going downstairs, "I'll be glad to help out with your experiments any time, Mr. E."

\* \* \*

Some serious mistakes were made in the conduct of this interview, and no attempt has been made to gloss over them. Ministers who seek to give Christian vocational guidance to young people will inevitably make mistakes. But was the interview, in spite of its crude handling, a success?

(1). First of all it can be stated that no direct advice was given. She was asked to accept certain propositions, and

refused to do so. This indicated poor procedure, but it was better at least than being given unacceptable advice.

(2). The vocational problem was isolated by Miss Awe in the words, "Does it say that I have the proper qualifications for teaching?" Hers was not a problem of choice but of fitness; or so it seemed at this time.

(3). The question of fitness related itself naturally to her fluctuations of temperament and self-regard. The real, and in fact the only vocational problem appeared to be a personality problem. She recognized this when she summed up the interview by saying, "There is no doubt that I have up and down moods."

A weakness of the interview was its failure to release expression. No cause or reason was given to explain the "moods". The presence of two counselors rather than one may account for some of the reticence; the other subjects tended to behave similarly. The reticence, in turn, caused E. to err in directing conversation which should have flowed naturally. Despite the interview's jerkiness, it seems to have made an authentic beginning toward helping Miss Awe to strengthen her sense of Christian Vocation. The next interview took place a month later, on April 28, in M.'s study, with only Miss Awe and E. present. The report which follows was written from memory the same evening.

## Second Interview.

Miss Awe arrived on time and was seated when E. entered the room. She was talking to M., who then departed.

"Look out," she said, smiling. "I'm in a bad mood. I'm really low."

"Something has happened to upset you?" asked E.

"No, just the accumulation of about five years."

"Well. Perhaps we had better start talking about Vocation."

She nodded. "Yes."

"How do you feel about this business of Vocation?" asked E. "Do you feel teaching is really a way you can do God's will and serve your fellow man too?"

"Yes, I do. Not only working with the children, but with the parents as well. There's a lot you can do to help them."

"Teaching is a very obvious Vocation, isn't it."

"Yes."

"And you have strong leanings that way."

"The tests seem to indicate I have a lot of interest, don't they?"

"Yes."

"I don't know so much about ability," she said. "Do you think they show I'm fitted for it?"

"That is the same question you asked last time, interestingly enough." E. referred to the report of the first interview and read an excerpt. He then asked, "Do you think you are

fitted for it?"

Miss Awe smiled. "I don't know. My friends and my headmasters and the people I work with, all tell me I'm well fitted. Sometimes the teachers say to me, 'Haven't you seen enough of the kids to be sick of the job?' But I don't let that affect me. However, I am sensitive to criticism, and if anyone told me I weren't fit I would perhaps reconsider, and if the tests showed it, I might even go into another field."

"You are a bit inclined then to let people's opinions affect your attitude toward your Vocation--whether they think you can do it?"

"Yes. I shouldn't be that way, I know. And I know that I'll never be satisfied until I am a school teacher."

"That is interesting, because it indicates you have a basic drive toward this goal, this Vocation."

"Yes."

"Perhaps you can accent that somehow so that you won't be affected by what people say or even what I say; and just go on through to your goal. Develop a self-reliance based on your inner motives and then it can't be changed by outside comment."

"Oh, I don't think I'm too greatly influenced by other people. But I did hear a conversation I wasn't supposed to, and in it some said I would make a good teacher."

"The important thing, perhaps, is for you to think so."

"Well, I don't think I would have any trouble much with



discipline."

"I can believe that," said E. "The people at school seem to have a rather high regard for you."

"Yes, I really am happy in my job as headmaster's secretary."

"You have a way of getting along with people rather well, don't you?"

"Yes, in my six years there I've never had a row. Never any unpleasantness or anything."

"Then it would almost appear that you get along better with other people than you do with yourself."

She laughed. "I see what you mean. There may be something there."

"At least you are always easy-going and congenial, and people like to come to you."

"Yes, they do. They confide in me a lot."

"Is it possible that these fluctuations, these ups and downs we noticed last time, will disappear when you get more in a position to lead, like in a classroom?"

"Oh, I think I know what caused them. I have just been studying too hard, staying home all the time, never taking a night off, just plugging away for the prelims in August. You know I flunked part of them last month and it was quite a shock to me. So I'm studying hard. And I think the blues and so on were caused by that."

The interview had progressed well to this point, although

it was apparent that at the beginning she did not wish to discuss her personality fluctuations. Rapport being good, E. decided to face them. He said, "You were unhappy after the last interview, weren't you?"

"Oh, definitely. For at least a day and a half."

"Why?"

"Oh, you and M. kept looking at each other, and these awful things came up, and I wondered if they wouldn't have to come and carry me away in a cart."

"And how did you feel after the day and a half?"

"Why, all right. I did a little thinking about those depressions, you see. And I saw that perhaps I was just a little proud of them."

"Proud of them?"

"Yes, I kind of enjoyed having my little fits of depression. So then I realized that they were really just caused by so much work, study, night school and all. And I really haven't had one since."

"Not today?"

"Oh, today--that was something that happened--a teacher was unsportsmanlike."

"Then it was a good thing to get all that stuff out?"

"Oh, yes, it was."

"What about the studying? Are you able to take a night off now and then?"

"Oh, no. My mother did that once. She just forced me to

go to a dance. And I had a wonderful time. But for three days after that the tunes were going around in my head--I couldn't study. So I said, no more of that. I have too much at stake."

"You have a tremendous drive of vitality that is pushing you toward this goal, the prelims in August. Kind of a ball of fire inside you."

"Is that what it is? I know it won't give me any rest. I didn't use to be like that, up to two years ago. I mean, not able to stop."

"Do you think it might continue after your prelims, and push you into other things without a break?"

"I don't know, I've been thinking about taking up psychology. But I ought to relax, I know. Only I can't now."

"Perhaps it's only a temporary thing--you're keyed up to the studies."

"Yes, I think so."

"If people keep reposing confidence in you, of course, your Vocation may lead you to higher positions."

"Oh, but I don't want to become an infant mistress. I see how they are on a different plane. I want to be with the herd." (Her level of interest was only 30.)

"People do tend to vest you with authority."

"I have quite a bit of authority now; I've had to break in four headmasters."

"Well, we have seen that you have a drive that is carrying you toward this Vocation, and that is good."

"It will be an awful let down to me if I don't make it."

"I have every confidence," said E., "that you will make it. It was a matter of preparation that caused you to fail before, was it not?"

"Yes. It was a shot in the dark, I didn't know the material. I wouldn't have thought much of them if they had passed me."

"Do you recall where you stood in our intelligence tests?"

"Fifth in the group, I think." E. then read to her excerpts from her previous interview where she had refused to accept the scores. She was amused.

"Could we say that when you are in charge of your classroom, fulfilling your goal, dealing competently with other people, that perhaps your own internal struggles will tend to straighten themselves out?"

"Oh, I'm very sure of it."

"And in after years you will look toward these years as a--"

"A rough time of study."

"It takes quite a bit of drive," said E., "for a girl of twenty-two to compete with girls of eighteen or so, doesn't it? To go back and get this thing?"

"Yes, it does."

"Well, we seem to have uncovered a few basic facts that never appeared in the first interview."

"Yes. I think it's absolutely amazing what the tests



bring out."

"It's a good thing for us to know ourselves, don't you think?"

"Oh, I must say it has been an interesting experience."

"Would you like me to lead us in a closing prayer?"

"Please do."

E.'s prayer dealt not with generalities but with Miss Awe and the specific issues that had arisen in her interviews. At its close, she said, "That, sir, is worth more than all the interviews."

"Jesus was a teacher, you know," said E. "He wasn't a minister."

"Oh, but He ministered to them."

"True, but He taught a lot, in stories. Do you tell stories?"

"Do I? Every night I have to tell them to my nieces and nephews."

"You like that."

"Well, yes--" a smile. "But sometimes they wake me out of a sound sleep and say, 'Tell us a story!'"

"Good. It sounds as if you'll make a fine teacher!"

\* \* \*

The second interview was on a different plane from the first. There was rapport and congeniality, the release of expression, and a smoothly flowing conversation. The counselor did less directing, with the result that rather unusual insight

was achieved. The facts which were rejected at the first interview were now accepted.

A helpful factor was the presence of only two persons. Several young people indicated that they preferred to have only one counselor at the interview. A more important reason for the changed attitude of Miss Awe, however, is that the uncomfortable facts uncovered at the first interview forced her into self-examination. Being intelligent and equipped with Christian moral perception, she did some serious thinking between interviews. Whether or not E. was justified in concluding, "It sounds as if you'll make a fine teacher" is another question.

A follow-up interview was held with Miss Awe by E. nearly a year later, on Feb. 23, 1951, in M.'s study. A report was written the same evening, but only certain relevant portions of the third interview are included here.

\* \* \*

#### Third Interview.

Miss Awe was cheerful and relaxed. She said that she had failed her exams in August, but that the shock of failure was cushioned somewhat by the fact that she had met a boy a week before hearing the results, and that they were now keeping steady company. She had brought him into her church life. She said that if she had to make a decision to choose between teaching and marriage, she would choose marriage. It was not altogether a happy choice, for "if I'm just going to get married, why did I do all this studying? I could have been going out

like the others these past three and a half years. I really wanted to follow my Vocation, and I don't think marriage is a Vocation."

Miss Awe felt that the reason for her failure was carelessness. "I'm terribly careless and always have been, even back in school." She had little hope that she would ever pass the exams, though she was going to attempt them very shortly once again, and was continuing to study (with difficulty in concentrating) at night school. She dreaded failing the exams again because she would "let down" her teachers and her mother. The anxiety and frustration over exams was making her "an old crab", she said. "Everyone is telling me I'm an old crab or an old nark, and it's true. I didn't use to be like this. If I could pass I wouldn't care; all the best teachers are known as old crabs." If she could pass, she said, she would still go through with her teacher training course.

E. was able to use the above comments to draw upon spiritual truths, trying not to drive them home too obviously. He suggested that God works in most human lives in small ways rather than spectacular ones, and referred to her meeting the young man a week before hearing about the failure of her long uphill effort. He said that it is pretty hard to "let down" one's mother. And he succeeded in getting her to admit that she did not really wish to become an "old crab" teacher at all.

Miss Awe's belief that marriage was not a Vocation proved how inadequate had been the instruction given during the ex-

periment a year before. As E. sought to deal with the point, it developed that she was genuinely in love, and that she hoped to marry and have a large family. "One reason I went into teaching was because I like children." E. outlined some of the reasons why marriage, motherhood and home-making constitute one of the finest of Vocations. Once Miss Awe asked, "What would my children think if they knew that I failed my exams two or three times?" E. replied that family loyalty was usually built on love rather than academic attainments. At another point she questioned, as she did in the first interview, whether she "had enough up here" (pointing to her head); she thought the I.Q. test results too high in her case. E. pointed out that Mr. Kinross, whom she had surpassed in both the Beta and WOSB tests, was now through his exams and enrolled in a Scottish university.

At the conclusion of the interview E. noted the times of her exams and assured her he would be praying for her. "Why didn't my prayers work before?" she asked. "I was quite serene and confident." E. did not pretend to know the answer, but he said, "We are wholes, you know. Perhaps there is something else in your personal life that is making spiritual trouble."

As they descended the stairs Miss Awe said, "Next time you see me I may have a lot of wee ones and tell you that I have at last found my teaching Vocation in my own children, and so on. I really have enjoyed the talks, whether I seem to suggest it or not."



The final interview, like the others, had a full quota of counseling errors but made headway nevertheless. The spiritual content reached a more significant level than in previous talks. The vocational picture, which seemed so settled a year earlier, was now showing signs of altering completely.

The possibility of a development in the direction of marriage was not unpredictable, despite Miss Awe's aloofness to the subject at the time of the experiment. Her liking for children and home-making was evident from the start. She was by no means unattractive. The low level of interest registered by the OII (30 per cent) should have been given greater weight in the vocational discussions, especially in view of her second interview remark that she had no wish to become an infant mistress, but wanted to remain "one of the herd". Lacking ambition to rise in the profession, she could hardly be expected to develop into an outstanding teacher.

Were Miss Awe enrolled in a permanent Christian vocational guidance program, her future could be followed by the counselor with undoubted profit both to herself and to the Church. At the time of the final interview she still needed insight into the meaning of Christian personality. The follow-up contact could only leave her as it found her, carrying a full load of life's perplexities and disappointments, and yet looking to the Church of Christ for some sign of guidance.

E. was able to reach several other members of the experi-

ment during February and March, 1951, for brief reports on their vocational progress.

Mr. Morar had given up his efforts to become a pharmacy student and had apprenticed himself to a chemist for a four-year period.

Mr. Shin had received psychological treatment at E.'s suggestion and reported that he was "doing much better" at his work. He was still aloof to women, but recognized the necessity for his ultimately coming to terms with that aloofness.

Miss Eck and Miss Nevis were rapidly becoming expert social workers and were both shortly to be married.

Mr. Lomond was earning an astonishing number of pounds a week as a railway fireman, but temperamental difficulties were still making him somewhat unreliable.

Mr. Kinross was pursuing his studies at a Scottish university with a view to entering the ministry.

Miss Garry, Miss Shiel and the twins, Miss Rannoch and Miss Aline, were vocationally unchanged.

Miss Tay and Miss Frisa were working at their same jobs, but were studying hard at night school and had hopes of passing their higher leaving exams soon.

Mr. Earn, who had wanted to go to sea, had disappeared from all Church activities and social life for some time. In February he was called into the Royal Signals, British Army, and was posted to a wireless operator's course.

Mr. Lydoch had taken full advantage of the information he gained in the experiment. He had answered an advertisement for a surveyor's apprentice and had successfully taken the examinations, and now looked forward to the working life of a civil engineer. He had also been elected president of the Youth Club.

### 3. Conclusion.

The experiment failed to shed light on many of the points raised in the thesis, for the reason that it was conducted before the writing of the thesis was commenced. The integrated concept of Vocation as witness and work did not get a good hearing. Had the experiment been held a year later, E. would have presented that concept in syllabus form and would have sought to integrate it closely with the interviews. Whether by such methods real Christian vocational insight can be achieved remains to be seen.

Relationships with the state vocational guidance program were not explored because the new Youth Employment program had not been started in Edinburgh in the spring of 1950, and because none of the young people in the experiment had received vocational guidance at school.

Some idea was gained of the difficulties facing a young person who wants to make a vocational adjustment after the school-leaving age. The young Christian who cannot develop a sense of Vocation at his work because it is not making use of

his abilities and capacities, will often find the way to his heart's desire a stony if not impassable path. The experiment indicated that the best way to overcome such dissatisfaction is to prevent it by proper guidance in the first place. Nevertheless there is always some value to be derived from Christian vocational guidance at any age, in studying one's personality and vocational potential and seeking to interpret them in terms of spiritual destiny.

E. is aware of many weaknesses in the experiment, and does not pretend to have answered any of the serious technical difficulties that keep the ordinary minister from vocational counseling. His aim has been simply to show that it is needed and that it can be done.



## BIBLIOGRAPHY

## Abbreviations.

- ARSV - American Revised Standard Version.
- AV - The Authorized Version.
- BTNT - Biblical Theology of the New Testament (B. Weiss).
- CVCW - Christian Vocation in the Contemporary World (Miller).
- DI - The Divine Imperative (Brunner).
- ERE - Encyclopedia of Religion and Ethics.
- GAK - Gesammelte Aufsätze Kirchengeschichte (Holl).
- HDB - Dictionary of the Bible (ed. Hastings).
- HPC - History of Primitive Christianity (J. Weiss).
- ICC - International Critical Commentary.
- J & R - Justification and Reconciliation
- JEP - Journal of Educational Psychology.
- LTJC - The Life and Teaching of Jesus Christ (Stewart).
- MC - The Moffatt Commentary.
- PESC - The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism (Weber and Forrester).
- SCM - Student Christian Movement Press.
- TWBB - A Theological Word Book of the Bible (ed. Richardson).
- WA - Weimar Ausgabe (Luther's Works).

\* \* \*

ALEXANDER, Cecil, Poems, ed. William Alexander, London, 1896.

ALLEN, F. J., Practice in Vocational Guidance, New York, McGraw-Hill, 1927.

ALLPORT, G. W., Personality. A Psychological Interpretation, London, Constable, 1949.

ARTICLES in Magazines, see PERIODICALS.

BAINTON, Roland H., Here I Stand, A Life of Martin Luther, New York, Abingdon-Cokesbury, 1950.

BARTH, Karl, Römerbrief, 4th ed., Munich, 1926; tr. by Sir Edwin Hoskyns from 6th ed. as The Epistle to the Romans, Oxford, 1933.

Die Kirchliche Dogmatik, Dritter Band, Zweiter Teil, Zürich, 1948.

BAXTER, Richard, A Christian Directory..., 2nd ed., London, 1678.

BENNETT, John C., Christianity and Communism, New York, Association Press, 1948.

BEVINGTON, Sheila, Occupational Misfits, London, Allen & Unwin, 1933.

BIBLES (other than ordinary translations)

The Apocrypha. an American Translation by Edgar J. Goodspeed, Univ. of Chicago, 1938.

The Byble in Englyshe..., the "Third Great Bible" with Cranmer's Prologue, April, 1540.

The English Hexapla, London, 1891.

The holy Scriptures..., Coverdale's translation of 1535, 1st modern ed., London, 1838.

The New Testament, Tyndale's translation of 1526, reprinted verbatim, London, 1836.

BILLING, Einar, Our Calling, tr. from Swedish by Conrad Bergendoff, Rock Island, Ill, Augustana Book Concern, 1950.

BLOOMFIELD, Meyer, The Vocational Guidance of Youth, Boston, Houghton Mifflin, 1911.

ed., Readings in Vocational Guidance, Boston, Ginn & Co., 1915.

- BLOW, Norman, Christian Vocation, London, Edinburgh House, 1946.
- "  
BONHOFFER, Adolf, Epiktet und das Neue Testament, Giessen, 1911.
- BONNELL, John Sutherland, What Are You Living For? New York, Abingdon-Cokesbury, 1950.
- BORNE, Etienne, and HENRY, Francois, A Philosophy of Work, tr. from French, London, Sheed & Ward, 1938.
- BREWER, John M., Vocational Guidance through the Life-Career Class, see ALLEN.
- BROADLEY, Charles V. and Margaret E., Know Your Real Abilities, New York, Whittlesey House, 1950.
- BRODRICK, J., The Economic Morals of the Jesuits, an answer to Dr. H. M. Robertson, Oxford, 1934.
- BRUNNER, Emil, The Divine Imperative, tr. by O. Wyon, London, Lutterworth, 1937.
- Justice and the Social Order, tr. by M. Hottinger, London, Lutterworth, 1945.
- Christianity and Civilisation, 2 vols., London, Nisbet, 1948.
- CALHOUN, Robert L., God and the Common Life, New York, Scribners, 1935.
- God and the Day's Work, New York, Association Press, 1943.
- CALVIN, John, Institutes of the Christian Religion, tr. from last Latin ed. by J. Allen, 2 vols., Philadelphia, Westminster Press, 1936; French ed., Institution de la religion chrétienne, 1541 ed., 2 vols., Paris, 1911.
- CARLYLE, Thomas, Collected Works, Centenary ed., London, Chapman & Hall, 1895 ff.
- CARR, Edward H., Karl Marx, London, J. M. Dent & Sons, 1938.
- CHAUCER, Geoffrey, Canterbury Tales, ed. A. Burrell, London, Everyman, 1910.
- CLUTTON-BROCK, A., William Morris, London, Butterworth, 1914.



COFFIN, J. H., Personality in the Making, Boston, Houghton Mifflin, 1923.

COLLINS, Mary, and DREVER, James, Psychology and Practical Life, Univ. of London Press, 1936.

#### COMMENTARIES

Barth, Römerbrief, see BARTH.

Dodd, C. H., The Epistle of Paul to the Romans, London, Hodder & Stoughton, 1933 (MC).

Peake, A. S., ed., A Commentary on the Bible, London, 1919.

Sanday, W., and Headlam, A. C., Commentary on the Epistle to the Romans, Edinburgh, T. & T. Clark, 1900.

COULTON, G. G., Five Centuries of Religion, 3 vols., Cambridge, 1923-36.

\* COX, Catherine Marie, Genetic Studies of Genius, vol. ii, Stanford Univ. Press, Calif., 1926.

CRIPPS, Sir Stafford, Towards Christian Democracy, London, Allen & Unwin, 1945.

God in Our Work, London, Thomas Nelson, 1949.

CRONBACH, Lee J., Essentials of Psychological Testing, New York, Harper, 1949.

DAICHES, David, The King James Version of the English Bible, Univ. of Chicago Press, 1941.

DAVIDSON, A. B., The Called of God, Edinburgh, T. & T. Clark, 1902.

DAVIS, G. W., Men at Work, London, SCM, 1946.

#### DICTIONARIES

Dictionary of the Bible, ed. James Hastings, Edinburgh, 1898-1902.

The Oxford English Dictionary, ed. Murray etc., Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1888-1928.

Liddell & Scott, Greek-English Lexicon, London, 1940, abridged.

Webster's Collegiate Dictionary, 5th ed.

DIETRICH, Suzanne de, ed. Professional Life as Christian Vocation, Geneva, Oikumene, 1949.

DOIDGE, Reg and Evaline, Epilogues, London, National Sunday School Union, 1942.

DREVER, James, The Psychology of Industry, New York, Dutton, 1921.

EARLE, F. M., Methods of Choosing a Career, London, Harrap, 1931.

Psychology and the Choice of a Career, London, Methuen, 1933.

EDWARDS, Reese, Vocational and Occupational Guidance, Cambridge, Heffer, 1940.

\* EGER, Karl, Die Anschauungen Luthers vom Beruf, Giessen, 1900.

ELIOT, Charles W., The Value During Education of the Life-Career Motive, see BLOOMFIELD, Readings.

#### ENCYCLOPEDIAS

Catholic Encyclopedia, New York, 1907.

Encyclopedia of Religion and Ethics, ed. J. Hastings, Edinburgh, 1908-26.

Encyclopedia of Vocational Guidance, ed. O. J. Kaplan, New York, Philosophical Library, 1948.

Realenzyklopädie für protestantische Theologie und Kirche, Leipzig, 1877-86; 3 aufl., 1892-1913.

Theological Word Book of the Bible, ed. Alan Richardson, London, SCM, 1950.

Theologische Wörterbuch zum Neuen Testament, von Gerhard Kittel, etc., Stuttgart, 1933-38.

ENGELS, Friedrich, Anti-Dühring, tr. by Ed. Burns, London, 1935.

EPICETUS, Discourses, tr. by George Long, London, Geo. Bell, 1888.

ERICKSON, C. E. and SMITH, G. E., Organization and Administration of Guidance Services, New York, McGraw-Hill, 1947.

FANFANI, Amintore, Catholicism, Protestantism and Capitalism, tr. from Italian, London, Sheed & Ward, 1935.

FIGGIS, John Neville, Studies of Political Thought from Gerson to Grotius, 2nd ed., Cambridge, 1916.

\* FORRESTER, W. R., The Call and the Calling, the Cunningham Lectures for 1950, given at New College, Edinburgh; to be published in 1951 by Lutterworth, London, 1951.

FOX, Ralph, Lenin, A Biography, London, Gollancz, 1933.

GHEORGHIU, Virgil, The Twenty-Fifth Hour, London, tr., Heinemann, 1950.

GORE, Charles, Jesus of Nazareth, London, Butterworth, 1932.

GRAY, Sir Alexander, The Socialist Tradition from Moses to Lenin, London, Longmans Green, 1946.

Economics: Yesterday and Tomorrow, see PERIODICALS.

GWATKIN, H. M., Selections from Early Christian Writings, London, Macmillan, 1949.

HALLER, William, The Rise of Puritanism, New York, Columbia Univ., 1938.

HERON, T. M., Man at Work, see RECKITT.

HOGBEN, Rowland, Vocation, London, Inter-Varsity Fellowship, 1949.

HOLL, Karl, Gesammelte Aufsätze Kirchengeschichte, 3 vols., Tübingen, 1923 ff.

HORTON, Douglas, TITTLE, Ernest F., and LAMPE, William B., Christian Vocation, Boston, Pilgrim Press, 1945.

INCE, Sir Godfrey, see PAMPHLETS.

IREMONGER, F. A., William Temple, Archbishop of Canterbury, His Life and Letters, Oxford, 1948.

JAMES, Fleming, Personalities of the Old Testament, New York, Scribners, 1939.

JENSEN, G. C., The Eureka School Plan, see ALLEN.

JEROME, Selected Works, tr. Fremantle, in Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church, vi, Oxford, 1893 ff.

KAPLAN, O. J., see ENCYCLOPEDIAS.

KELLER, F. J., and VITELES, M. S., Vocational Guidance Throughout the World, London, Jonathan Cape, 1937.

KIRK, Kenneth E., The Vision of God, London, Longmans Green, 1931.

KOESTLER, Arthur, The Yogi and the Commissar and Other Essays, London, Jonathan Cape, 1945.

LAWRENCE, D. H., Pansies, London, Martin Secker, 1929.

LENIN, V. I., "Left-Wing" Communism, Little Lenin Library, xvi, Moscow, Marx-Engels-Lenin Institute.

LEWIS, Sinclair, Elmer Gantry, New York, Harcourt Brace, 1927.

LIGON, Ernest M., The Psychology of Christian Personality, New York, Macmillan, 1935.

Their Future is Now, New York, Macmillan, 1939.

A Greater Generation, New York, Macmillan, 1948.

Their Future is Now: A Guide for Parents and Teachers in the Character Education of Their Children, Schenectady, N. Y., Laboratory of Psychology, Union College, 1948.

LOCKHART, J. G., Cosmo Gordon Lang, London, Hodder & Stoughton, 1949.

LUTHER, Martin, Werke, Weimar Ausgabe, 1883-1939.

Table Talk, tr. by Wm. Hazlitt, London, 1848.

MACDONALD, Allen, A Scheme for Vocational Guidance for Use in an Educational Area, Ph.D. thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1939 (unpub.)

MACGREGOR, W. M., For Christ and the Kingdom, London, S.C.M., 1932.



MACLEOD, George F., We Shall Re-Build, Glasgow, Iona Community, 1944.

An Economic Witness by Churchmen, see PAMPHLETS.

MACRAE, Angus, Talents and Temperament, London, Nisbet, 1932.

MAIRET, Philip, A Civilisation of Technics, see RECKITT.

MAN, Henri de, Joy in Work, tr. from German by Eden and Cedar Paul, London, Allen & Unwin, 1929.

MARTIN-LEAKE, M., The Scientific Selection and Training of Workers in Industry and Commerce, London, Pitman, 1932.

MARX, Karl, and ENGELS, Friedrich, The German Ideology, parts i and iii, tr., London, Lawrence & Wishart, 1938.

MASEFIELD, John, Collected Poems, London, Heinemann, 1923.

MAYO, Elton, The Human Problems of an Industrial Civilization, Harvard, 1933.

The Social Problems of an Industrial Civilization, Harvard, 1945.

McCONNACHIE, John, The Significance of Karl Barth, 2d. ed., London, Hodder & Stoughton, 1931.

MILLER, Alexander, The Christian Significance of Karl Marx, London, SCM, 1946.

Christian Vocation in the Contemporary World, London, SCM, 1946.

See also PERIODICALS.

MORRIS, William, News from Nowhere, London, Longmans Green, 1907.

Architecture, Industry and Wealth, in Collected Papers, London, 1902.

MOTT, John R., The Future Leadership of the Church, London, Hodder & Stoughton, 1909.

MUMFORD, Lewis, Technics and Civilization, London, G. Routledge Sons, 1946.

- MURPHY, Gardner, An Historical Introduction to Modern Psychology, London, Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1949.
- MURRAY, Henry A., Explorations in Personality, New York, Oxford, 1938.
- MYERS, C. S., ed., Industrial Psychology, London, Butterworth, 1929.
- MYERS, G. E., Principles and Techniques of Vocational Guidance, New York, McGraw-Hill, 1941.
- NEWCOMB, T. M., and HARLEY, E. L., eds., Readings in Social Psychology, New York, Henry Holt, 1947.
- OAKLEY, C. A., Men at Work, London, Hodder & Stoughton, 1945.
- and MACRAE, A., A Handbook of Vocational Guidance, London Univ. Press, 1937.
- O'CONNOR, Johnson, The Unique Individual, New York, Human Engineering Laboratory, 1948.
- OLDHAM, Joseph H., Work in Modern Society, London, SCM, 1949.
- OMAN, John, Concerning the Ministry, London, SCM, 1936.
- PAMPHLETS
- GILL, J. Clifford, Christian Faith and Social Order, London, SPCK, 1948.
- GIRDWOOD, J. G., et al., Report on the Cost of House Building, Ministry of Health, London, H. M. Stationery Office, 1948.
- INCE, Sir Godfrey H., et al., Report on the Juvenile Employment Service, Ministry of Labour and National Service, London, H. M. Stationery Office, 1945.
- KIRK, P. T. R., Man the Worker, Industrial Christian Fellowship Publications, London, 1950.
- MACLEOD, George F., An Economic Witness by Churchmen, Glasgow, Iona Community, 1949.
- OUTLER, Albert C., A Christian Context for Counseling, Hazen Pamphlet No. 18, New Haven, Conn., 1945.

## VARIOUS AUTHORS

The Christian Doctrine of Work, Industrial Christian Fellowship Publications, London, 1950.

Christian Responsibility in Industry, British Council of Churches, London, 1950.

The Idea of Christian Vocation, Federal Council of Churches Information Service, New York, June 10, 1950.

The Church, the Secular World, and the Economic Order, Federal Council of Churches Information Service, Dec. 23, 1950.

PARSONS, Frank, Choosing a Vocation, Boston, Houghton Mifflin, 1909.

PECK, W. G., An Outline of Christian Sociology, London, James Clarke, 1948.

## PERIODICALS

BALCHIN, Nigel, Satisfactions in Work, art. in Occupational Psychology, July, 1947.

BROWN, W. B. D., Incentives Within the Factory, art. in Occupational Psychology, April, 1948.

FIRTH, Raymond, Anthropological Background to Work, art. in Occupational Psychology, April, 1948.

FLEECE, U. H., and MALONE, H. J., Motivation in Occupational Choice Among Junior and Senior High School Students, art. in Journal of Educational Psychology, xxxvii, 1946.

FORRESTER, W. R., The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism, art. in The Expository Times, London, Sept., 1937.

GRAY, Sir Alexander, Economics: Yesterday and Tomorrow, art. in Advancement of Science, London, Oct. 1949.

MACE, C. A., Satisfactions in Work, art. in Occupational Psychology, Oct. 1947.

MILLER, Alexander, Evangelism and Social Doctrine, art. in The Coracle, Iona Community, Feb. 1944.

Manual Worker--Missionary Church, art. in The Coracle, Jan. 1951.

ROBINSON, N. H. G., The Place of Vocation in Christian Ethics, art. in Theology, a Monthly Review, SPCK, May, 1950.

ROGERS, Carl, Some Implications of Client-Centered Counseling for College Personnel Work, art. in Educational and Psychological Measurement, Washington, D.C., Autumn, 1948.

WATSON, P. S., Luther's Doctrine of Vocation, art. in Scottish Journal of Theology, Dec. 1949.

Career Determination, art. in Trends magazine, Chicago, Nov. 1950.

PERKINS, William, Workes, vol. 1, Cambridge, 1616.

PLATO, The Republic, tr. by B. Jowett, Oxford, 1888.

RECKITT, M. B., ed., Prospect for Christendom, London, Faber & Faber, 1945.

REEVES, Marjorie, and DREWETT, John, What is Christian Education? London, Sheldon Press, 1943.

REITH, J. C. W., Into the Wind, London, Hodder & Stoughton, 1949.

REUSS, Eduard, History of Christian Theology in the Apostolic Age, tr. by A. Harwood from 3rd German ed., 2 vols, London, Hodder & Stoughton, 1872 ff.

RITSCHL, Albrecht, A Critical History of the Christian Doctrine of Justification and Reconciliation, tr. by J. S. Black, Edinburgh, Edmonston & Douglas, 1872.

ROBERTSON, H. M., The Rise of Economic Individualism, Cambridge, 1933.

ROBERTSON, J. A., Divine Vocation in Human Life, London, James Clarke, 1925.

ROETHLISBERGER, F. J., Management and Morale, Harvard, 1946.

ROGERS, Carl, Counseling and Psychotherapy, New York, Houghton Mifflin, 1942.



Dealing with Social Tensions, New York, Hinds, Hayden & Eldredge, 1948.

RUSKIN, John, Works, Pocket ed., London, Allen & Unwin, 1904-7.

SAYERS, Dorothy, Creed or Chaos? and Other Essays, London, Methuen, 1947.

Vocation in Work, see VARIOUS AUTHORS (Baker, ed.)

SCHOLES, Percy A., The Puritans and Music, in England and New England, Oxford, 1934.

SHAKESPEARE, William, First Part of King Henry IV, ed. W. A. Wright, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1897.

SMITH, Adam, The Wealth of Nations, 2 vols., 1904 ed., London, Methuen, 1949.

SMITH, Walter Bedell, Moscow Mission, London, Heinemann, 1950.

SPRING, Howard, There Is No Armour, London, Collins, 1948.

STEELE, Sir Richard, The Tradesman's Calling, being a Discourse concerning the Nature, Necessity, Choice, etc., of a Calling in general, London, 1684.

STEWART, James S., Life and Teaching of Jesus Christ, Edinburgh, Church of Scotland, 1933.

SUPER, Donald E., Appraising Vocational Fitness, New York, Harper, 1949.

SYMONS, W. G., Work and Vocation, London, SCM, 1946.

The Obedience of the Individual Christian, in Christian Witness in the Post-War World, see VARIOUS AUTHORS.

\* TAULER, Johannes, Die predigten Taulers...ed. F. Vetter, Berlin, 1910.

TAWNEY, R. H., Religion and the Rise of Capitalism, London, J. Murray, 1926.

TEMPLE, William, Nature, Man and God, London, Macmillan, 1949.

Christian Faith and Life, London, SCM, 1931.

Christianity and Social Order, 3rd. ed., London, SCM, 1950.

THOMAS AQUINAS, Opera, editio Altera Veneta, Venetiis, 1786.

TROELTSCH, Ernst, The Social Teaching of the Christian Churches, 2 vols., tr. by O. Wyon, London, Allen & Unwin, 1931.

TRUEBLOOD, Elton, The Common Ventures of Life, New York, Harper, 1949.

#### VARIOUS AUTHORS

A Christian Basis for the Post-War World, ed. by A. E. Baker, London, SCM, 1942.

Christian Witness in the Post-War World, ed. by A. C. Craig and Hugh Martin, London, SCM, 1946.

The Church and the Disorder of Society, an ecumenical study, World Council of Churches, London, SCM, 1948.

The Churches Survey Their Task, Report of Oxford Conference on Church, Community and State, viii, London, Allen & Unwin, 1937.

The Church's Witness to God's Design, an ecumenical study, World Council of Churches, London, SCM, 1948.

Memorials of Myles Coverdale, London, Bagster, 1838.

My Faith and My Job, Ten Broadcast Talks, London, Epworth Press, 1944.

Professional Life as Christian Vocation, see DIETRICH

Prospect for Christendom, see RECKITT

Westminster Confession of Faith, Edinburgh, William Blackwood, 1948.

Youth Employment Officers' Handbook, Ministry of Labour, London, 1948.

VISSER T'HOOF, W. A., The Kingship of Christ, London, SCM, 1948.

VITELES, M. S., The Science of Work, London, Jonathan Cape, 1934.

WATSON, John B., Behaviorism, 2d ed., London, Lippincott, 1931.

WEBB, Sidney and Beatrice, Soviet Communism, A New Civilisation, 1st ed. 1935, 2d ed. 1937, London, Longmans Green.

WEBER, Max, Gesammelte Aufsätze zur Religionssoziologie, 3 vols., Tübingen, 1922.

The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism, tr. by Talcott Parsons from 1920 ed., London, Allen & Unwin, 1930.

WEISS, Bernhard, Biblical Theology of the New Testament, 2 vols., tr. by D. Eaton, Edinburgh, 1882-3.

WEISS, Johannes, The History of Primitive Christianity, 2 vols., tr. by F. C. Grant et al., London, Macmillan, 1937.

WOODHAM-SMITH, Cecil, Florence Nightingale, London, Constable, 1950.

ZWEIG, F., Labour, Life and Poverty, London, Gollancz, 1949.

\* Volumes marked with an asterisk were unavailable for consultation.